TYPES OF PEER FEEDBACK USED BY THE STUDENTS IN A PARAGRAPH WRITING CLASS

A SARJANA PENDIDIKAN THESIS

Presented as Partial Fulfillment of the Requirements to Obtain the Sarjana Pendidikan Degree in English Language Education

By
Angela Sona Eka Pramudita
Student Number: 131214042

ENGLISH LANGUAGE EDUCATION STUDY PROGRAM
DEPARTMENT OF LANGUAGE AND ARTS EDUCATION
FACULTY OF TEACHERS TRAINING AND EDUCATION
SANATA DHARMA UNIVERSITY
YOGYAKARTA
2017
TYPES OF PEER FEEDBACK USED BY THE STUDENTS IN A PARAGRAPH WRITING CLASS

A SARJANA PENDIDIKAN THESIS

Presented as Partial Fulfillment of the Requirements to Obtain the Sarjana Pendidikan Degree in English Language Education

By
Angela Sona Eka Pramudita
Student Number: 131214042

ENGLISH LANGUAGE EDUCATION STUDY PROGRAM
DEPARTMENT OF LANGUAGE AND ARTS EDUCATION
FACULTY OF TEACHERS TRAINING AND EDUCATION
SANATA DHARMA UNIVERSITY
YOGYAKARTA
2017
A Sarjana Pendidikan Thesis on

TYPES OF PEER FEEDBACK USED BY THE STUDENTS
IN A PARAGRAPH WRITING CLASS

By
Angela Sona Eka Pramudita
Student Number: 131214042

Approved by

Priyatno Ardi, S.Pd., M.Hum. 14 August 2017
A Sarjana Pendidikan Thesis on

TYPES OF PEER FEEDBACK USED BY THE STUDENTS IN A PARAGRAPH WRITING CLASS

By
ANGELA SONA EKA PRAMUDITA
Student Number: 131214042

Defended before the Board of Examiners on 11 September 2017 and Declared Acceptable

Board of Examiners
Chairperson : Yohana Veniranda, M.Hum., M.A., Ph.D.
Secretary : Christina Lhaksmita Anandari, S.Pd., Ed.M.
Member : Priyatno Ardi, S.Pd., M.Hum.
Member : Dr. Emanuel Sunarto, M.Hum.
Member : Truly Almendo Pasaribu, S.S., M.A.

Yogyakarta, 11 September 2017
Faculty of Teachers Training and Education
Sanata Dharma University
Dean,
Rohandi, Ph.D.
GOD has perfect timing; never early, never late. It takes a little patience and a whole lot of faith. But it’s worth the wait.

This thesis is dedicated to Bapak Valerianus Suharsono and Ibu Yosephine Erna and My brother, Blasius Sony
STATEMENT OF WORK’S ORIGINALITY

I honestly declare that this thesis, which I have written, does not contain the work or parts of the work of other people, except those cited in the quotations and the references, as a scientific paper should.

Yogyakarta, 14 Agustus 2017

The writer

Angela Sona Eka Pramudita
131214042
LEMBAR PERNYATAAN PERSETUJUAN
PUBLIKASI KARYA ILMIAH UNTUK KEPENTINGAN AKADEMIS

Yang bertanda tangan dibawah ini, saya mahasiswa Universitas Sanata Dharma:

Nama : Angela Sona Eka Pramudita
Nomor Mahasiswa : 131214042

Demi pengembangan ilmu pengetahuan, saya memberikan kepada Perpustakaan Universitas Sanata Dharma karya ilmiah saya yang berjudul

TYPES OF PEER FEEDBACK USED BY THE STUDENTS IN A PARAGRAPH WRITING CLASS

Dengan demikian saya memberikan kepada Perpustakaan Universitas Sanata Dharma hak untuk menyimpan, mengalihkan dalam bentuk media lain, mengelolanya dalam bentuk pangkalan data, mendistribusikannya secara terbatas, dan mempublikasikannya di Internet atau media lain untuk kepentingan akademis tanpa perlu meminta ijin dari saya maupun memberikan royalty kepada saya selama tetap mencantumkan nama saya sebagai penulis.

Demikian pernyataan ini yang saya buat dengan sebenarnya.

Dibuat di Yogyakarta
Pada tanggal: 11 September 2017

Yang menyatakan

Angela Sona Eka Pramudita
ABSTRACT

Pramudita, Angela Sona Eka. (2017). Types of Peer Feedback Used by the Students in a Paragraph Writing Class. Yogyakarta: English Language Education Study Program, Department of Language and Arts Education, Faculty of Teachers Training and Education, Sanata Dharma University.

Writing is the most difficult skill among other language skills, namely reading, listening, and speaking. In writing activity, the students have to do many things such as inventing idea, thinking about how to express them, and organizing them into sentences and paragraphs that will be clear for readers. Related to writing, there are four steps in writing process, namely planning, drafting, editing, and final process. However, editing or revising step requires feedback from others, which gives significant improvement on students’ writings. Feedback can be given by peers, which is called peer feedback. Types of feedback used by students may be various.

In this study, the types of feedback used by the students in Paragraph Writing class A and types of feedback which improve students’ writing most are identified by the researcher.

This study was qualitative research. The participants were from the second semester students of Paragraph Writing Class A in academic year 2016/2017 at the English Education Study Program of Sanata Dharma University. The data were gathered from the analysis of students’ drafts and final revision, the observation notes, and also the transcript of the interview.

The results show that there were forty four direct feedbacks used by the students in the peer feedback activity. The indirect feedback used by students was thirty three feedbacks. Meanwhile, there were two metalinguistic feedbacks used by a student in the peer feedback activity. Then, all of the respondents stated that direct feedback was the type of feedback that helped students improving their writing the most.

In conclusion, the students employed three types of feedback, namely direct feedback, indirect feedback, and metalinguistic feedback. Moreover, direct feedback helped the students to improve their writing due to two reasons: (1) direct feedback was not time consuming and (2) direct feedback provided more suggestion to be considered.

Keywords: Types of feedback, peer feedback, and Paragraph Writing Class
ABSTRAK


Menulis adalah keterampilan paling sulit dibandingkan dengan keterampilan kebahasaan yang lainnya, yaitu membaca, mendengar, dan berbicara. Di dalam aktivitas menulis, para mahasiswa harus melakukan banyak hal, antara lain menemukan ide, memikirkan cara untuk mengungkapkannya, serta mengaturnya kedalam bentuk kalimat dan paragraf yang cukup jelas untuk dibaca. Terdapat empat langkah dalam proses menulis, yaitu perencanaan, pengkonsepan, penelitian, dan pembentukan, serta penyelesaian. Bagaimanapun, proses penelitian dan pembentukan memerlukan umpan balik dari orang lain, yang memberikan peningkatan yang berarti terhadap tulisan para mahasiswa. Umpan balik dapat diberikan oleh teman sebaya, atau biasa disebut peer feedback. Tipe umpan balik yang digunakan oleh para mahasiswa dapat bervariasi.

Pada penelitian ini, penulis ingin mencari tahu tipe umpan balik yang digunakan oleh para mahasiswa di kelas Paragraph Writing Class A dan tipe umpan balik mana yang paling membantu meningkatkan tulisan para mahasiswa.


Hasil dari penelitian memperlihatkan bahwa terdapat empat puluh empat direct feedback, tiga puluh tiga umpan balik tidak langsung, dan dua umpan balik metalinguistic yang digunakan dalam kegiatan peer feedback. Kemudian, semua peserta interview menyebutkan bahwa umpan balik langsung adalah tipe umpan balik yang paling membantu mahasiswa dalam memperbaiki tulisan mereka.

Maka, dapat disimpulkan bahwa para mahasiswa menggunakan tiga tipe umpan balik, yaitu umpan balik langsung, umpan balik tidak langsung, dan umpan balik metalinguistic. Selain itu, umpan balik langsung adalah umpan balik yang paling membantu mahamahasiswa dalam memperbaiki tulisan mereka dikarenakan dua alasan: (1) umpan balik langsung tidak memakan waktu dan (2) umpan balik langsung menyediakan lebih banyak masukan untuk dipertimbangkan.

Kata kunci: Types of feedback, peer feedback, and Paragraph Writing Class
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

First of all, I would like to praise the Lord, Jesus Christ for giving me the strength to finish my thesis on the right time. I believe that God always gives the right time for me.

I addressed my greatest gratitude to my advisor, Priyatno Ardi, S.Pd., M.Hum. for guiding me in finishing my thesis. I thank him for being patient and giving his time to help me in any situation. My next gratitude is addressed to Truly Almendo Pasaribu S.S., M.A. for giving me the permission to conduct this study in her class. I also would like to address my thanks to the students of Paragraph Writing Class for their willingness to be involved in this study.

This thesis is dedicated to my beloved parents, Valerianus Suharsono and Yosephine Erna Tri Widyawardani, also my one and only brother, Blasius Sony Dwi Putranto. I really thank them for always giving me their endless support. I thank them for their patience to remind me to finish my thesis as soon as possible. They are my one and only motivation in finishing my thesis.

I also thank my Alpha Team, Angela Yonara Mahadewi, Capella Yuna Beita Surya, Eukharistia Nethanel, and Fransisca Ariesta for always listening to my struggles and giving me strength when I want to give up. I also thank my college mates, Kelas B Kecil for always being supportive to each other. I am very grateful to be a part of this class for four years. I also address my thanks to Widya Ayu Anindita, Elizabet Afreil, S.Pd., Martha Giovanni Anggasta Paramitha, S.Pd., Antonius Agus Wijaya, S.Pd., and Chrysthania Yan Prasetya, S.Pd. for their willingness to be my proofreaders.

Lastly, I would like to give my appreciation to those, whose names cannot be mentioned one by one, who helped me in finishing my thesis.

Yogyakarta, 11 September 2017

Angela Sona Eka Pramudita
TABLE OF CONTENTS

TITLE PAGE ......................................................................................................................... i
APPROVAL PAGE ............................................................................................................... ii
DEDICATION PAGE ........................................................................................................ iv
STATEMENT OF WORK’S ORIGINALITY ........................................................................ v
PERNYATAAN PERSETUJUAN PUBLIKASI ................................................................. vi
ABSTRACT ...................................................................................................................... vii
ABSTRAK ......................................................................................................................... viii
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS ................................................................................................. ix
TABLE OF CONTENTS ................................................................................................. x
LIST OF TABLES .............................................................................................................. xii
LIST OF FIGURES ........................................................................................................... xiii
LIST OF APPENDICES ................................................................................................. xv

CHAPTER I INTRODUCTION ............................................................................................. 1
A. Research Background ................................................................................................. 1
B. Research Question .................................................................................................... 4
C. Research Significance ............................................................................................... 4
D. Definition of Terms .................................................................................................... 5

CHAPTER II REVIEW OF RELATED LITERATURE .......................................................... 7
A. Theoretical Description .............................................................................................. 7
1. Writing ......................................................................................................................... 7
2. Teaching Writing ....................................................................................................... 12
3. Feedback in Writing ................................................................................................. 14
4. Types of Feedback ................................................................................................... 14
5. Previous Research on Peer Feedback ...................................................................... 17
B. Theoretical Framework ............................................................................................. 17
CHAPTER III RESEARCH METHODOLOGY .................................................................19
A. Research Method .......................................................................................... 19
B. Research Setting ........................................................................................... 20
C. Research Participants .................. ..................................................................20
D. Instrument and Data Gathering Technique ................................................. 21
E. Data Analysis Technique ............................................................................... 25

CHAPTER IV RESEARCH RESULTS AND DISCUSSION.................................29
A. Types of Feedback used by students in Paragraph Writing Class A ...... 29
B. Types of Feedback that can improve the Students’ writing most .......... 35

CHAPTER V CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS ..........................44
A. Conclusions .................................................................................................... 44
B. Recommendations ..........................................................................................46

REFERENCES........................................................................................................48

APPENDICES.........................................................................................................50
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3.1 The Coding of Respondents</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2 The Categorization of Types of Feedback Used by Students in</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Paragraph Writing Class A</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3 Scoring Rubric of Students’ Writing Improvement</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4 The Categorization of the Improvement that Students Made on Every</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Feedback They Got</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
# LIST OF FIGURES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Figure</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2.1 The Wheel of Process Approach to Writing</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2 The Example of Indirect Feedback</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3 The Example of Direct Feedback</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.4 The Example of Error Codes</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.5 The Example of Grammatical Description</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1 The Data Analysis Technique</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.1 The Example of Circling Word and Writing The Correct Form</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2 The Example of Crossing Word and Writing The Correct Form</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3 The Example of Direct Feedback in Adding or Inserting Word</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.4 The Example of Direct Feedback in Adding or Inserting Sentence</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.5 The Example of Indirect Feedback</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.6 The Example of Indirect Feedback</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.7 The Example of Metalinguistic Feedback</td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.8 Participant 4’s Draft</td>
<td>36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.9 Participant 4’s Final Revision</td>
<td>36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.10 Participant 1’s Draft</td>
<td>37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.11 Participant 1’s Final revision</td>
<td>37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.12 Participant 3’s Draft</td>
<td>39</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.13 Participant 3’s Final Revision</td>
<td>39</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.14 Participant 5’s Draft</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
4.15 Participant 5’s Final Revision................................................................. 40
# LIST OF APPENDICES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>APPENDIX</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A</td>
<td>The Questions of the Interview</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B</td>
<td>The Observation Note</td>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C</td>
<td>The validation from Ms. Yuseva Wardhana</td>
<td>53</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D</td>
<td>The Validation from Mr. Daniel Widhiatama</td>
<td>61</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E</td>
<td>The Categorization of Students’ Type of Feedback</td>
<td>63</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F</td>
<td>The Data of the Scoring Rubric</td>
<td>72</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>G</td>
<td>The Students’ Writings Improvement</td>
<td>74</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H</td>
<td>The Examples of Students’ Drafts</td>
<td>83</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I</td>
<td>The Examples of Students’ Final Revisions</td>
<td>84</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>J</td>
<td>The Interview Transcription</td>
<td>85</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
CHAPTER I
INTRODUCTION

In this chapter, the researcher introduces the background of this research. There are four parts in this chapter. They are research background, research questions, research significance, and definition of terms.

A. Research Background

Tangpermpoon (2008) mentions that writing is admitted to be the most difficult skill among other three skills, namely reading, speaking, and listening. Writing is a challenging skill because there are some elements should be considered in writing. Canale and Swain (1980) mention four elements that must be mastered, namely grammatical competence, discourse competence, sociolinguistic competence and strategic competence (as cited in Hyland, 2003). Moreover, in writing activity, the students also have to do many things such as inventing idea, thinking about how to express them, and organizing them into sentences and paragraphs that will be clear for readers (Sokolik, 2003).

Since writing becomes the most challenging skill, teachers are expected to help the students write the writing product easier. In teaching writing, there are four principles that have to be considered by the teacher. They are understanding students’ reason for writing, providing many opportunities for the students to write, making feedback, and clarifying the evaluation to the students (Sokolik,
2003). In the contrary, in few years ago, teaching writing was only focused on the final product. The students’ final writing was considered as the important thing of all. Students did not emphasize on the process of the writing itself. Yet, nowadays, people also tend to focus on the writing process. According to Oshima & Hogue (1999), writing is not only a product but also a process because it must have possibility to be reviewed and revised again.

Harmer (2004) proposes four steps in writing process, namely planning, drafting, editing (reflecting and revising), and final version. Each of the steps has their own meaningful process. In the planning step, the students plan what they are going to write. In the drafting step, the students compose their draft. Then, the subsequent step is editing. In this step, the students commonly edit or revise the draft. In the editing or revising activity, the students will get some correction and feedback from the readers or the corrector. The last step is the final revision. This is the culmination of the writing process.

Among the four steps of writing process, students need to pay attention to the editing or revising step. It is because the editing or revising step requires feedback from others, which gives significant improvement on students’ writing skill. It is used in educational situation for improving students’ knowledge and skill (Moreno, 2004, cited in Shute, 2007). Therefore, the corrector should help the students to accept the feedback and does not judge the students that they are wrong (Harmer, 2007) because it helps the students to revise their writing to be a better one.
It is generally accepted that giving feedback can help students to improve their writing. According to Trickey and Toping (2004), providing revisions for student writing becomes a potentially powerful strategy to support the development of their writing. According to Hattie and Timperley (2007), feedback is hypothesized as information provided by agent (e.g. teacher, peer, book, parent, self, and experience). The one who commonly gives the feedback is the teacher. However feedback can also be given by peers, which is called peer feedback. It is an activity that allows students to give feedback to each other. Topping (1998) defines peer feedback as “an arrangement in which individuals consider the amount, level, value, worth, quality, or success of the products or outcomes of learning of peers of similar status” (p. 250). It means that peer feedback is done by individuals who have same level such as friends, classmates, and study group friends. It is actually not common for students to give feedback to each other.

The previous studies about the effect of using peer feedback on improving the students’ writings have been conducted. Nahur (2012) employed peer feedback as the learning strategy in order to increase students’ past tense awareness in writing narrative text. The research finding shows that the students’ awareness in writing narrative text is improved. It explains that peer feedback helps students to improve their writing. Moreover, Rohmah (2010) also investigated the students’ perception on peer feedback in writing class. From the result, it shows that the students gain positive perception on peer feedback.

From the previous study, it is clearly proved that peer feedback can help students to improve their writing. This study intends to investigate the types of
feedback given by students in Paragraph Writing Class at English Language Study Program. Furthermore, since there is no previous study that enlightened the types of feedback which help students to improve their writing, the researcher also wants to further find out the types of feedback improve the students’ writing.

B. Research Questions

In line with the background above, the researcher generated two research questions. The research questions are presented as follows:

1. What the types of feedback are used by the students of Paragraph Writing Class A in peer feedback activity?

2. What types of feedback improve students’ writings the most in Paragraph Writing Class A?

C. Research Significance

This study is expected to give some benefits to the students, the lecturers, and audience who read this research. Firstly, the students may employ various types of feedback. Second, the lecture understand that types of feedback used by students may be various. Third, the researcher also wants to inform the readers that giving feedback in peer feedback activity can help students improve their writing. According to Duit and Treagust (2010), feedback plays an important role in formative assessment of conceptual learning. Therefore, the researcher expects that the findings of this research help the lecturers and students to understand
about the types of feedback and what types of feedback improving students’ writings the most.

D. Definition of Terms

1. Feedback

Feedback can be defined as information given by a reader to a writer which leads to the revision (Keh, 1990). Feedback is widely seen in education to be crucial for both encouraging and consolidating learning. It forms a key element of the students’ growing control over composing skills, and by genre-oriented teachers employing scaffolding learning techniques. Summative feedback is designed to evaluate writing as a product. According to Duit and Treagust (2010), feedback plays an important role the learning process. The feedback that students might give in doing peer feedback may be various. According to Ellis (2009), types of feedback are classified into six major categories, specifically direct, indirect, metalinguistic, focused/unfocused, electronic, and reformulation feedback.

2. Peer feedback

Peer feedback is a cooperative learning in which the students are required to give constructive criticism after reading and evaluating each other work (Farrah, 2012). In this activity, the writer gets the feedback from a person who has similar status or level such as classmate and friends in the same grade or level of learning. The basic advantage of peer feedback is the students can monitor themselves and others.
3. **Paragraph Writing Class**

Paragraph Writing aims to assist students to write a good paragraph. The students are introduced to the concept of topic sentence, supporting sentences and concluding sentence as well as the concept of unity and coherence of a paragraph. In completing the course, the students are able to compose a good paragraph. Write well using different types of writing genre, deconstruct the generic and schematic structure of each genre, and the social purposes and linguistic features of texts with the learned genres. This course is a compulsory subject and offered in Semester 2 of English Language Education Study Program of Department of Language and Arts Education of Faculty of Teachers Training and Education of Sanata Dharma University.
CHAPTER II

REVIEW OF RELATED LITERATURE

In this chapter, the researcher presents the discussion on some theories that underlie the topic of this research. This chapter is divided into two major parts, namely theoretical description and theoretical framework. The theoretical description consists of review of related theories, and the theoretical framework discusses the theories which are used to answer the research problem.

A. Theoretical Description

This theoretical description concerns with the related theories used to support this study. There are five major areas. They are writing, teaching writing, feedback, peer feedback, and types of feedback.

1. Writing

In this part, the researcher discusses two parts about writing which are related into the study. Those are nature of writing and process approach in writing.

a. Nature of writing

Writing can be considered as an act of communicating (Leki, 1998). That is to say that writing helps people to communicate to each other. Good writing can deliver the message from the writer to the readers. In addition, according to
Dunning, Leuenberger, and Sherman (1995), people also use writing to explore and express themselves. Thus, writing gives chance for the writer to convey their feeling.

Writing is a challenging skill. Tangpermpoon (2008) says that writing is admitted to be the most difficult skill among other three skills, namely reading, speaking, and listening. Writing can be considered as a challenging skill because it should consider several elements such as inventing ideas, thinking about how to express them, and organizing them into sentences or paragraphs that will be clear to readers (Sokolik, 2003). From this explanation, it is clear that the students must be able to organize their ideas, use correct punctuation and use correct spelling in order to write something well and coherent paragraph or text.

According to Sokolik (2003), writing can also be defined as both physical and mental activities that are aimed to express and impress. It means that writing is the physical activity of arranging words or ideas into a passage and also a mental work of inventing ideas, thinking about how to express and organize them into statements and paragraphs which enable the readers as the audience to understand the ideas of the written work. Besides, writing is also both a process and product since the writers experience cyclical process of writing, which consist of imagining, organizing, drafting, editing, reading, and rereading. Therefore, in order to produce a good writing, the students have to experience the writing process itself.
b. Process Approach to Writing

There are two kinds of approaches in writing, namely product approach and process approach. The product approach focuses on the final product of writing that is often seen by an error-free coherent text (Sun, 2009). It explains that the writing only focuses on the final product which is a text with error free. On the other hand, the process approach to writing focuses on the process which emphasizes the development of good practices through stages (Hyland, 2002). In this study, the researcher focuses on the process approach to writing. Tompkins (2006) says that process approach emphasizes what students think and do as they write. Therefore, the process approach to writing has four stages, namely planning, drafting, editing/revising, and final version (Harmer, 2004).

1. Planning

In the planning stage, the writers plan what to write. They should consider three main elements, namely purpose, audience, and content structure. The purpose element impacts the types of text that they want to write and also the language they use. The writers have to decide who the audience of their writing is. The audience becomes one of the considerations of choosing the appropriate language, whether formal or informal. The last is content structure where the sequencing of the evidences and ideas are included.

2. Drafting

Drafting is a stage in process approach to writing which requires the writers to write pieces of writing. Those writings can be changed later and will be
processed into editing. Perhaps, there will be multiple drafts in the writing process before going to the final version.

3. Editing (revising)

Editing takes place after the writers finish their draft. The writers edit the writing after reading and seeing whether the writing works well or does not go as expected such as the writers find inappropriate language use, ambiguous sentence, and other kind of writing techniques. Afterwards, they come into reflecting and revising which are often helped by others, such as editors or readers. In this study, the corrector is the student writers’ peer. The students will give correction and suggestion one to another. The comment or suggestion is called as feedback. The activity is called as peer feedback activity which helps students to improve their writings.

4. Final version

Final version is the final stage of approach to writing. It is the stage when the students have done three other stages, namely planning, drafting, and editing. In this stage, the writing is ready to be shown to others.

![The process wheel]

Figure 2.1 The Wheel of Process Approach to Writing (Adopted from Harmer, 2004, p. 6)
Those stages of process approach to writing help students to create better writing product. The stages are represented as a cycle that can be done repeatedly. The writer can re-plan, re-draft and re-edit their writing when they find the better idea of their writing. Since the stages of process approach to writing are very complex and writing is a challenging skill, the students need to get knowledge on how to write from the expert.

2. Teaching Writing

In the teaching of writing, there are principles that have to be considered. According to Sokolik (2003), there are four principles of teaching writing, such as understanding students’ reasons for writing, providing many opportunities for the students to write, providing feedback that is helpful and meaningful, and clarifying the evaluation to the students.

The first principle is understanding students’ reasons for writing. It is about the importance of both teacher and students’ goals. Teacher needs to understand and convey the students’ goals. Thus the students can apply the writing skills they have learned.

The second principle is providing many opportunities for the students to write. Since writing is a part of physical activities, the teacher should give more practice for students in the learning activities. However, the practice itself should provide different types of writing. By practicing more, the students can construct better English writing.
The third principle is providing helpful and meaningful feedback for the students. In writing, students need feedback from their teacher. The teacher should give clear feedback to the students in which the students understand the vocabulary or symbol that is used by the teacher. If it is necessary, teacher can discuss the feedback with the students in the class so that the students understand the errors on their writing. In this way, the students can learn from their mistakes and be more aware of making errors.

The last principle is clarifying how the students’ writing will be evaluated. The teacher should give an evaluation which is clear for the students such as the importance of presenting creative or original ideas, the importance of following a particular written format, the importance of grammatical accuracy, the importance of including recently taught material in the assignment, and the importance of accuracy in spelling and punctuation. Besides, the teacher needs to make a scoring rubric so that the students know what kind of aspects and requirements that will be assessed in writing.

3. Feedback in Writing

In this section, the researcher discusses two parts about feedback, namely nature of feedback in writing and peer feedback.

a. The Nature of Feedback in Writing

Feedback can be defined as information given by a reader to a writer which leads to the revision (Keh, 1990). Feedback is widely seen in education as crucial for both encouraging and consolidating learning. It forms a key element of
the student’s growing control over composing skills, and by genre-oriented teachers employing scaffolding learning techniques. Summative feedback, designed to evaluate writing as a product.

Based on Lewis (2002), feedback can be more motivating than marks or grades. It can encourage students in learning and using language to the best of their ability. According to Hattie and Timperley (2007), feedback is conceptualized as information provided by agent (e.g. teacher, peer, book, parent, self, and experience). In this study, the researcher focused on peer feedback activity.

b. Peer Feedback

Peer feedback is a cooperative learning in which students give constructive criticism after reading and evaluating each other’s work (Farrah, 2012). In peer feedback activity, the writer and the corrector are the students themselves. They commonly work in pair or small group. They are assigned to help each other in revising their writing products. Thus, peer feedback is a part of student-centered learning.

Farrah (2012) also stated that “peer feedback refers to engaging learners in the process of sharing their ideas and receiving as well as offering contractive comment and suggestions for improving a piece of writing (p. 4). Since the writers and the correctors are on the same levels, they tend to accept the suggestion easier. They are also able to clarify the correction freely than when it comes from teachers. Muncie (2000) states that students are much more likely to
be provoked into thinking about what they are writing of the feedback comes from their peers instead of feedback from their teacher (as cited in Harmer, 2007).

4. Types of Feedback

Each of the students has their own ways in giving feedback to their peers’ writing. Feedback itself has various types. The feedback that the students might give in doing peer feedback is various. Ellis (2008) classifies the types of feedback into six major categories, namely, direct, indirect, metalinguistic, focused/unfocused, electronic, and reformulation. Below is the explanation of each type of feedback:

a. Indirect Corrective Feedback

The corrector or the reader indicates that an error that exists but does not provide the correction (Ellis, 2008). By doing this corrective feedback, the correctors only indicate and locate the mistake and error. They do not give the correction or any suggestion.

A dog stole bone from butcher. He escaped with having bone. When the dog was going through bridge over the river he found dog in the river.

Figure 2.2 The Example of Indirect Feedback

b. Direct Corrective Feedback

Direct corrective feedback is slightly different from indirect corrective feedback. In doing this corrective feedback, the correctors do not only indicate and locate the mistakes but also give the correct form (Ellis, 2008).
c. Metalinguistic Corrective Feedback

In using metalinguistic feedback, the teacher provides some kind of metalinguistic clue to the students’ error. According to Ellis (2008) metalinguistic involves two forms of explicit comments such grammatical description and error code. Error codes consist of abbreviated labels for different kinds of error. Meanwhile by giving grammatical description, the teacher gives the correct form of the error only in the grammatical form.

A dog stole bone from butcher. He escaped with having bone. When the dog was going through bridge over the river he found dog in the river.
d. The Focus of the Feedback

There are two forms in the focus of feedback, namely focused corrective feedback and unfocused corrective feedback. By using focused corrective feedback, the corrector only focuses on one type of students’ error, for example only the punctuation or the grammar. Then, it is different from the unfocused corrective feedback. When the correctors do unfocused corrective feedback, they are not only focusing on one types of students’ error (Ellis, 2008).

e. Electronic Feedback

Electronic feedback allows the correctors to correct the writing by using electronic device, such as computer, phone, etc. In this feedback, the corrector indicates the error and usually gives some hyperlink to a concordance file that provides examples of correct usage (Ellis, 2008).

f. Reformulation

According to Ellis (2008), reformulation is when the correctors do reconstruction to the writer’s writing. In this study, it could be reconstruction of a sentence. It involves native speaker’s reworking of the students’ entire text in

```
V1
A dog stole bone from butcher. He escaped with having bone. When the

V2 + ing

dog go through bridge over the the river he found dog in the river.

Figure 2.5. The Example of Grammatical Description
```
order to make the language seem as native-like as possible while keeping the original content.

5. Previous Research on Peer Feedback

Muchi (2000) states that students are much more likely to be provoked into thinking about what they are writing if the feedback comes from one of their peers instead of feedback from their teacher (as cited by Harmer, 2007). Moreover, Mendonca and Johnson (1994) find that students used their peer’s feedback in more than half of their revisions.

Nahur (2012) employed peer feedback as the learning strategy in order to increase students’ past tense awareness in writing narrative text. The research findings show that the students’ awareness in writing narrative text is improved. It explains that peer feedback helps students to improve their writing. Moreover, Rohmah (2010) also investigated the students’ perception towards peer feedback in writing class. From the result, it shows that the students of writing class gain positive perception towards peer feedback.

B. Theoretical Framework

This study is to answer the two research questions. In the theoretical framework, the researcher presents the related theories to answer each question.

The first research question is about the types of feedback that students use in paragraph writing. The types may be various. Ellis (2008) classifies the types of
feedback into six major categories, namely direct, indirect, metalinguistic, focused/ unfocused, electronic, and reformulation. Thus, from this theory the researcher will identify types of feedback used by the students in the peer feedback activity.

The second research question is about which types of feedback that improve students’ writings the most. In this research question, the researcher would like to know which types of feedback that improve the students writing skill. Since the research question discusses improvement, the researcher has to prove the improvement of the students’ writing by doing scoring according to grammar theory. There are six grammar aspects namely tense, word order, clause structure, determiner and article, punctuation and preposition that are used to assess the students’ writing by considering and synthesizing theories from History (2015).

Afterwards, according to Elshirbini and Elashri (2013), using direct feedback and indirect feedback does improve the writing skills of EFL secondary students. In the other hand, Rymanowski et. al. (2011) argue that direct feedback is the least effective method of providing feedback on student errors and mistakes. Moser and Jasmine (2010) see that indirect feedback is more effective than directly correcting the errors. Ko and Hirvela (2010) stated that making a student try to discover th correct form could be often instructive to both learner and teacher.
CHAPTER III
METHODOLOGY

This chapter provides the research methodology. It presents the description of research method, research setting, research participants, instruments and data gathering technique, and data analysis technique.

A. Research Method

The method used in this research is qualitative method. According to Richards (2005), qualitative research involves collection of a variety of empirical materials-case study, personal experience, introspective, life story, interview, observational, historical, interactional, and visual texts—that describe routine and problematic moments and meanings in individuals life Qualitative research will produce qualitative data. According to Tesch (1990), qualitative data is any information the researcher gathers that is not expressed in numbers.

In this research, the researcher used document analysis as the part of qualitative research. According to Ary, Jacobs, and Razavieh (2002), “document analysis or content analysis focus on analyzing and interpreting recorded material within its own context” (p. 27). Cohen (2011) also mentions that document analysis or content analysis simply defines the process of summarizing and reporting written data-the main contents of data and their message.
In gathering the data, the researcher employed more than one source of data. Rossman and Rallis (1998) mention that qualitative research uses multiple sources of data (document analysis, survey, interview, and observation) in order to minimize researcher’s bias. Cresswell (2007) also adds that the involvement of multiple sources of information is suggested in order to grab the complete illustration of the phenomenon being investigated and it is allowed the triangulation as an important aspect in the qualitative study. Therefore, the strategies and instruments which are employed in collecting the data are data analysis (document analysis), observation, and interview.

B. Research Setting

The researcher did the research in Paragraph Writing Class A at the English Language Education Study Program of Sanata Dharma University. First of all, the researcher conducted the observation three times: 9th March, 16th March, and 23rd March 2017. While doing the observation, the researcher collected students’ writing. Then, the interview was conducted on the first week of April 2017. The study was conducted in Paragraph Writing Class A. An intensive study happened in this Paragraph Writing Class A.

C. Research Participants

The researcher chose the participants from the second semester students of Paragraph Writing Class A in academic year 2016/2017 at English Education
Study Program of Sanata Dharma University. The researcher chose this class because the lecturer implemented peer feedback activity. Therefore, by choosing this class, the researcher had the opportunity to observe the peer feedback activity. The researcher chose sixteen out of twenty five students because only those sixteen students who were qualified with this research according to the completeness of the documents or the researcher had the complete version of draft and final product of the students’ writing.

The researcher employed purposive sampling to choose six students to be interview. The respondents were students who did peer feedback activity in Paragraph Writing Class A. There were two students represented students who got more than two types of peer feedback, two students represented students who got more than eight peer feedbacks, and two students represented students who got only one peer feedback. The respondents were coded as follow:

**Table 3.1 The Coding of Respondents**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>NAME</th>
<th>GENDER</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Participant 1</td>
<td>Female</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Participant 2</td>
<td>Female</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Participant 3</td>
<td>Female</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Participant 4</td>
<td>Female</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Participant 5</td>
<td>Male</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Participant 6</td>
<td>Male</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
D. Instrument and Data Gathering Technique

In gathering the data, the researcher employed three instruments. Many sources are better in a study than a single source because multiple sources lead to a fuller understanding of the phenomena which the researcher was studying (Bogdan & Biklen, 2003). The instruments used in this research were rubric of type of feedback, interview guideline, and observation sheet.

1. Checklist of Type of Feedback

The researcher used document analysis to analyze the draft and peer feedback product. According to Ary, et al. (2002), “document analysis or content analysis focuses on analyzing and interpreting recorded material within its own context” (p. 27). Besides, Cohen (2011) also mentions that document analysis or content analysis is a process of summarizing and reporting the written data as the main contents of the data and their message. To collecting the data, the researcher employed two checklists and one rubric. The first checklist was for categorizing the type of feedback used by the students.

Table 3.1 The Categorization of Types of Feedback Used by Students In Paragraph Writing Class A

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>no</th>
<th>Nim</th>
<th>Feedback</th>
<th>Types feedback</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Afterward, the researcher made a scoring rubric to compare the quality of the students’ draft and final revision. In this study, the feedback only applied to grammatical errors. Therefore, the scoring rubric consisted of four aspects, namely tenses, clause structure, determiner or article and punctuation. The result of the scoring rubric can be seen in Appendix F.
### Table 3.2 Scoring Rubric of Students’ Writing Improvement

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No</th>
<th>The Grammar Aspects</th>
<th>Score</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Tense</td>
<td>5 4 3 2 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Clause Structure</td>
<td>5 4 3 2 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Determiner and Article</td>
<td>5 4 3 2 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Punctuation</td>
<td>5 4 3 2 1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Notes:
- Score 5 with 0 mistakes
- Score 4 with 1-3 mistakes
- Score 3 with 4-6 mistakes
- Score 2 with 7-10 mistakes
- Score 1 with 16 or more mistakes

\[
\text{Total Score} = \frac{\text{Total Score}}{20} \times 100
\]

The last step of the document analysis was using a rubric of students’ improvement on every feedback they got.

### Table 3.3 The Categorization of The Improvement that The Students Made on every Feedback They Got

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No</th>
<th>NIM</th>
<th>Draft</th>
<th>Final revision</th>
<th>Improve/ not</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
2. Interview Guideline

The researcher interviewed the students to get the deeper explanation about the data. According to Cohen (2011), “interview is a flexible tool for data collection, enabling multisensory channels to be used: verbal, nonverbal, spoken and heard. Interview is a powerful implementation for researcher” (p. 409). In this study, the researcher employed the standardized open ended interview. According to Cohen (2011), standardized open ended interview has the exact wording and sequence of questions. All interviewees were asked the same basic questions in the same order. The reason why the researcher chose this kind of interview was because the researcher would have answer from the same questions from the respondent, and it would be easy to be compared by the researcher when the data has already been gathered.

In order to gather the data, the researcher interviewed six students of Paragraph Writing Class A. The researcher prepared ten main questions for every respondents. The questions list can be seen in Appendix A. For the recording system, the researcher used recorder in the mobile phone.

3. Observation sheet

Besides those two instruments, the researcher also did observation. The researcher observed the activity of giving feedback in Paragraph Writing Class A. When the students did the peer feedback activity, the researcher also observed the class situation by using observation notes. The aims of doing observation was to gather the supported data for the research. As Cohen (2011) also said that observation as a research process offers the investigator the opportunity to gather
“live” data from naturally occurring social situations. The data can be gathered from the observation note written by the researcher. The observation note can be seen in Appendix B.

E. Data Analysis Technique

As what the researcher has mentioned before, there were three data gathering techniques used in this research; there were document analysis, interview, and observation. After gathering all the data, the researcher read the data for several times. Then, the researcher categorized the data to several groups. In other words, the researcher coded the data. According to Cohen (2011), coding enables the researcher to identify the similar information. In this research, the researcher will use open coding. At this level of coding, the researcher was looking for distinct concepts and categories in the data, which would form the basic units of the analysis. In this study, the researcher categorized the types of feedback the students used, highlighted some important statements from the interview to be supporting data, and also highlighted the observation note.
1. **Document Analysis**

The researcher categorized the feedback into six types of feedback based on the theory from Ellis (2008) by using table 3.1. First of all, the researcher read the draft and the feedbacks given by the students. Then, the researcher decided what types of feedback used by each student and how many times they used every types of feedback in revising their pair’s writing. It was for answering the first research question.

After categorizing the students’ types of feedback, the researcher did validation with two experts. The first one is miss Yuseva Wardhana, S.Pd., M.Ed.,
a lecturer of ELESPP who is actively doing research about feedback. The result of Ms. Yuseva’s validation is in Appendix B. The other one is Mr. Daniel Widhiatama, M.Hum., who is the alumnus of English Language Education Study Program and he did research about feedback. The validation result also can be seen in Appendix C. In this case, the researcher gave the data to the experts and got the validation whether the researcher has already been correct in categorizing the students’ types of feedback.

Afterwards, the researcher answered the second research question about the types of feedback that help students to improve their writing most. After knowing whether the students’ writing improvement, the researcher did the second step. The researcher listed the improvement or another error occurred. By using Table 3.3 the researcher listed the changing made by the students in every feedback they got.

2. Interview

From the data gathered in document analysis process, the researcher began to do sampling for the interview activity. By doing the purposive sampling, the researcher could decide six respondents to be interview. It was selected from the researcher’s needs in the study. The researcher needed to know deeper what types of feedback that improves the students’ writing most. Hence, the researcher chose two students who got more than two types of peer feedback, two students who got more than eight peer feedbacks, and two people who got only one peer feedback.

After doing the interviews, the researcher began making the transcription of the interview. There were two steps in making the transcription; wrote in the
Indonesian version and translated into English. From the transcription, the researcher be able to answer the second question–what types of feedback that help the student to improve their writing most. The transcription of the interview can be seen in Appendix J.

3. Observation

In doing the observation, the researcher took a note in order to gather the supported data for the research. After finishing those observation, the researcher summarized the observation sheet. The researcher underlined some statements that be able to support the study. The observation note can be seen in Appendix B.
CHAPTER IV

RESEARCH RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

This chapter presents the detailed information about the data gathered in this study, data analysis, and other findings in order to answer the research problem of this study. The discussion is divided into two sections. They are types of feedback used by the students in Paragraph writing class and the types of feedback that improve the students’ writing the most.

A. Types of Feedback used by students in Paragraph Writing Class A

Based on the researcher’s observation note, it was the first time for the students in paragraph writing class did the peer feedback activity. The lecturer explained the role of the students and how they should do in the activity. The lecturer asked the students to give feedback only on the grammatical errors. Therefore, this study also focused on the using of types of feedback on grammatical error. Participant 3 also stated that,

“Yang paling challenging dari nulis bahasa Inggris itu grammarnya kak.”

(The most difficult aspect in English writing is the grammatical aspect)

Afterwards, the lecturer divided the students into groups consisted of two students or in pair. They exchanged their work to each other. Then, they did the peer feedback activity.
During the activity, the lecturer kept giving further explanation about the activity and how to give feedback. Since peer feedback activity is one of activities that is included in the third stage of writing process, namely editing or revising (Harmer, 2007), it shows that the students still got problems in the writing process. Tangpermpoon (2008) mentions that writing is admitted to be the most difficult skill among the other skills. It was also mentioned by students whom researcher interviewed. Writing is considered as a challenging skill, especially writing in English. Participant 3 mentioned that,

“menulis dalam bahasa Inggris itu susah karena harus memperhatikan grammar dan idenya juga harus terstruktur dan imajinasinya harus kreatif”.

(Writing in English is difficult because we have to consider the grammar, how to organize the idea and also think creatively).

According to Sokolik (2003), writing becomes a challenging skill because students as the writer have to do many things in the same time such as inventing idea, thinking about how to express them, and organizing them.

In doing peer feedback, the students might use many types of feedback. According to Ellis (2009), there are six types of feedback, namely direct feedback, indirect feedback, metalinguistic feedback, the focus of the feedback, electronic feedback, and reformulation feedback. There are three types of feedback commonly used by students in Paragraph writing class A. They used direct feedback, indirect feedback and indirect feedback.
1. **Direct Feedback**

Direct feedback was given to almost all of the participants. According to Ellis (2008) in giving direct feedback, the correctors did not only indicate and locate the mistakes but also give the correct form. Based on the students’ writing, the researchers found some examples of direct feedback. Direct Feedback has two forms; (1) Crossing out unnecessary words or phrases then writing the correct form near the error, and (2) adding or inserting words.

a. **Indicating the Error and Giving the Correct Form**

The first type of direct feedback is indicating the error and giving the correct form. In indicating the error, the students used two actions; circling and crossing error. The students did circling or crossing out the error words or phrases and give the correct form. It was the most common direct feedback found in the peer feedback activity in Paragraph Writing Class A. These are the examples of those types of direct feedback.

![Figure 4.1 The Example of Circling Word and Writing The Correct Form](image1)

When my father was child, he always **studied** hard to be success person.

*Studied*

![Figure 4.2 The Example of Crossing Word and Writing The Correct Form](image2)

That is why they are so precious for me and **no one** could be replace with other things in the world

*they*
The students were given suggestion to replace some improper words or phrase to the more proper word. Participant 4 stated that,

“kalau kaya gini (diganti katanya dan dikasih yang benar) jadi mudah untuk dipahami. Saya jadi tahu yang benar bagaimana” (wawancara)

(By getting some error indications and also the correction, we could understand it easily. I could know the correct form directly). (Interview)

It meant that students are really helped by this kind of type of feedback. The students understand it easily and faster. They did not need to clarify to the corrector about the feedback.

b. Adding Word, Phrase or Sentence

Adding or inserting word is considered as one of the direct feedback forms (Ellis, 2008). The students were suggested to add or insert words to make the sentence more appropriate. Besides, it was possible for the students to get suggestion to add a sentence. It was aimed to make the paragraph more organized. Figure 4.3 and Figure 4.4 are the examples of direct feedback in inserting or adding word and sentence form.

Like to
First, I really watch movies because....

..., such as a lovely between a doctor and army. And I like many genres...

*Maybe one more example?*

Figure 4.3 The Example of Direct Feedback in Adding or Inserting Word
Figure 4.4 The Example of Direct Feedback in Adding or Inserting Sentence

Figure 4.3, it showed that the student got suggestion to add word “like to” between “really” and “watch” words. Participant 3 stated that the suggestion was clear enough because the corrector has already provided the correct form.

2. Indirect Feedback

In doing peer feedback activity, the students in Paragraph Writing Class A also used indirect feedback. According to Ellis (2008), indirect feedback occurred when the corrector indicated that an error exists but does not provide the correct form. Most of the students got indirect feedback in a form of circled words or crossed words. The following excerpts are the examples of indirect feedback.

I really like to listening to the music for spend my time.

Figure 4.5 The Example of Indirect Feedback

Another benefit of dance can make new friends.

Figure 4.6 The Example of Indirect Feedback

There are some examples of indirect feedbacks received by students in Paragraph writing Class A. Figure 4.5 is indirect feedback received by Participant 4. The corrector only gave a circle on “to” word to indicate that there was something wrong. It also happened to Participant 5 as seen in the Figure 4.6; the corrector only circled letter “D” from “dance” word. It was different with direct feedback because the corrector didn’t give the correct form. It might give many
interpretation and lead many different actions from students who received the feedback.

3. **Metalinguistic Feedback**

Metalinguistic Feedback was also used by a student in doing the peer feedback activity in Paragraph Writing Class A. Metalinguistic Feedback has two types of comment, namely grammatical description and error code (Ellis, 2008). He also mentions that the most common form of metalinguistic feedback is the using of error codes. These consist of clues or abbreviated labels indicates the error.

However, in this study, only metalinguistic explanation (grammatical description) form was found. According to Ellis (2008) this types of metalinguistic feedback are actually not very commonly used because it is more time consuming than using error codes. From the data gathered by researcher, there was only one student who got metalinguistic feedback. The corrector gave the correct grammatical description above the error.

**Figure 4.7 The Example of Metalinguistic Feedback**

From Figure 4.7, the researcher identified that it was a grammatical description form. It was included into metalinguistic description – one of types of metalinguistic feedback. It was different with direct feedback, since the corrector didn’t give the correct form directly. In doing metalinguistic feedback, the corrector only gave clues to the writer. In this case, the corrector gave clues to the

Do you like **sing** right?

*V + ing*
students to use gerund form (V + ing) because it was in a form of noun. If using direct feedback, the corrector gave the correct form – singing – directly.

Those are types of feedback received by students in doing peer feedback in Paragraph Writing Class A. Since the students used more than one types of feedback, then the researcher wanted to find out which types of feedback can improve students’ writing the most.

**B. Types of Feedback that can Improve the Students’ Writing the most**

After knowing the types of feedback that were received by students in peer feedback activity in Paragraph Writing Class A, the researcher intended to know what types of feedback that can improve the students’ writing the most. The researcher identified whether those students’ writing improved from the draft to the final revision. In order to get the data, the researcher use scoring rubric. The data from the scoring rubric can be seen in Appendix F. According to the scoring rubric, the average of the students’ score increased from the draft to the final revision. It was from seventy nine to ninety. Even though the average was increasing, not all of the aspects were increasing. The clause structure aspect and punctuation aspect were increasing. According to the Appendix K, there are twenty five direct feedbacks on the clause structure aspect. It proves that direct feedback helps students in improving their writing especially in clause structure aspect.

Afterwards, the researcher coded part of the students’ writing that got feedback has changed or not. The detailed information of the each students’ writing improvement can be seen in Appendix G. By doing the interview, the
researcher confirmed which feedback might help the students improve their writing the most. According to Toping (2004), providing revisions for student writing becomes a potentially powerful strategy for supporting the development of student writing. The researcher believes that all of types of peer feedback that the students used played important role in improving students’ writing. In this discussion, the researcher explained each of types of feedback and its effects in improving the students’ writing.

1. Direct Peer Feedback

Direct feedback was mostly used by students in Paragraph Writing Class A. It can be seen that all of the students used direct feedback in doing peer feedback activity. Compared to the other types of feedback, the students preferred to get direct feedback. It was because the students did not need to clarify it again. It has already been clear enough. As what Ellis (2008) mentioned, one of the advantages of receiving direct feedback is learners get explicit guidance about how to correct the error. These is the improvement of Participant 4’s writing.

**Figure 4.8 Participant 4’s Draft**

**Figure 4.9 Participant 4’s Final Revision**

Based on Figure 4.8 and Figure 4.9, Participant 4 improved his writing. It
proves that direct feedback helps students to improve students’ writing. It is also supported by the statement from Participant 4:

“Yang lebih membantu ya direct feedback sih kak, soalnya kan langsung dikasih pembenarannya jadi tau yang salah yang mana dan kalau salah benarnya kayak apa. Jelas dan aku langsung bisa mengerti gitu.”

(Type of feedback that helps me the most is direct feedback, because it provides correct form of the error. Thus, I directly know where the error takes place and the correct form of it.)

Participant 3 also stated that,

“Yang kasih pembenaran lebih jelas kak. Jadi tahu langsung yang salah mana dan benarnya seperti apa.”

(Type of feedback that gives the correct form is clearest. It is not only crossing the error word, but also provides the correct form. Therefore, We will know directly the error and how to make it correct).

Those evidences prove that direct feedback help students to improve their writing. It is also to say that the use of direct feedback is not time consuming. The students do not need to clarify to the corrector because it has already been clear enough.

Besides, there was a student who did not change their work even though the corrector gave direct feedback.
From the Figure 4.10 and Figure 4.11 the researcher realized that Participant 1 did not change their work. It does not mean that the writing did not improve. Both of the suggestion and work are correct. Participant 1 also stated the reason behind the action.

“I think that “it” and “sleeping” have the same meaning as the object of my writing. Therefore I did not do any changing.”

Based on the data and the statement from Participant 1, it can be understood that even though it did not lead students to change their work, it still helped students to reconsider of some possibilities in the writing process. The important thing is that the students were provided with suggestion not only error indications. Both of the suggestion and the draft are correct. Therefore, it is the other advantage given by direct feedback.

Thus, according to the explanations, direct feedback has two main advantages in helping the students to improve their writings: (1) Direct feedback is not time consuming, and (2) direct feedback provides more suggestions. The
respondents did not mention any disadvantage from receiving direct feedback in improving their writing.

2. **Indirect Peer Feedback**

Indirect feedback was also commonly used by students in Paragraph Writing Class A. According to Ellis (2008), indirect feedback leads long-term learning. For the first time they got the feedback, they would be confuse. Most of students who got this kind of feedback were confused because they did not understand what is actually wrong and what the correct form is. Then, the actions that might happened was confirming the feedback to the corrector. Participant 4 mentioned that,

“Kalau yang di lingkari cuma seperti ini ya saya kadang bingung kak benernya kayak apa, jadi saya tanya lagi ke corrector saya ini kenapa salah dan benernya kayak apa.”

(If it was only circling the error, it became confusing because I didn’t know the correct form. Therefore, I did confirmation to my corrector about the correct form of my error.”)

The other hand, Participant 5 who only got one feedback and it was indirect feedback felt okay and did not need to clarify anymore to the corrector.

Another benefit, Dance can make new friends.

**Figure 4.12 Participant 5’s Draft**

Another benefit, dance can make new friends.

**Figure 4.11 Participant 5’s Final Revision**
According to Ellis (2008), indirect feedback leads students to analyze their error. They need to have assumption about the error they have made. Then, here is the Participant 5’s statement about indirect feedback he received.

“Iya hanya D nya saja yang dilingkari. Saya tidak tanya lagi ke corrector karena memang sudah jelas. Itu berarti seharusnya d nya tidak kapital.”

(This is only about the capitalization, so I do not need to clarify to my corrector anymore. It means that the “D” letter should not be capitalized.)

It was clear enough because it has two possibilities; it was capitalized and not. It might be problem if there were circles or crosses on words that has more than two possibilities, such as the Figure 4.12 and Figure 4.13. It would lead confusion to the students.

I am very like coloring book because that’s cam reduces my stress...

I am very like coloring book because of several reasons.

Figure 4.12 Participant 3’s Draft

Figure 4.13 Participant 3’s Final Revision

It can be seen that the word that got the indirect feedback did not change. The sentence might have changed and improved. However the target of the indirect feedback did not improve. The target of the feedback is included into tense aspect. According to Appendix F, the tense aspect of participant 3 did not improve. In the interview, the participant 3 stated that:
“Indirect feedback bikin bingug sih. Saya biasanya bakal cari sendiri yang bener apa kalau indirect feedback.”

(Indirect feedback makes me confused. When I got indirect feedback, I looked for the correct form by myself.)

It means that it was time consuming because they need to clarify the correct form of the error. In spite of the time consuming, participant 5 stated the other disadvantage from only getting one indirect feedback. In the interview, Participant 5 mentioned:

“Prefer yg ada pembenarannya karna lebih jelas. Kita juga kadang tidak tahu sudah bener atau belum grammarnya, klo dicoret saja tidak tahu salahnya kenapa, jadi lebih baik dikasih pembetuannya. Trus bs sharing gitu kak.”

(I prefer the one that gives correct form. It is clearer. Sometimes, we do not know whether the grammar has already correct or not. Then, if it is only crossed or circled, then we do not know how to correct it. Then, we can learn from each other.)

It is to say that indirect feedback did not provide any suggestion to the students. Therefore, it is difficult for the students to improve their writing. Participant said that indirect feedback did not give her any explanation regarding to her grammar aspect or the content itself.

It is to say that indirect feedback does give advantage, it helps students to recognize their errors. On the other hand, indirect feedback creates some disadvantages to the students: (1) Indirect feedback is time consuming, (2) indirect feedback is confusing, and (3) indirect feedback did not give any suggestion.
3. **Metalinguistic Peer Feedback**

Ellis (2008) mentions that metalinguistic feedback involves providing learners with some form of explicit comment about the nature of the errors they have made. In Paragraph Writing Class, there was only one student used this type of feedback. It means that this type of feedback is not really popular among the students.

It explains that metalinguistic feedback does help the student in the writing process. It can be seen on Participant 5’s draft and final revision below.

![Figure 4.14 Participant 6’s Draft](image)

Do you like singing right?

**Figure 4.15 Participant 6’s Final Revision**

It means that metalinguistic does help student in improving their writing. Yet it also gives confusion to the student. Participant 6 stated that,

"Lumayan membantu sih kak, tapi saya harus mikir lagi itu kata berarti itu saya harus buat dalam bentuk V+ing begitu aja atau bagaimana. Jadi saya tanya lagi sama yg koreksi tulisan saya apakah pemahaman saya sudah benar."

(It is quite helpful, kak. However, I have to think what the meaning of it. Is it only changing the form or what? Then, I ask my corrector whether my understanding is already right or not.)
Even though metalinguistic feedback does help the students, it still gives disadvantages to the students. It requires the students to clarify their understanding about the feedback that they got. It means that metalinguistic feedback is more time consuming.

Robb, Ross, & Shortreed (1986) found it no more effective than direct feedback and indirect feedback. It may give clues to the student but it still not provides the correct form. Participant 5 also stated that,

“Kalau cuma di coreti itu pelit banget nih ga kasih pembetulannya. Jelas bingung dan jadi harus tanya lagi ga efektif gt lho.”

(If it is only crossed or circled without any correct form, it only makes me confused, I have to clarify again. It is not effective.)

Thus, those prove that metalinguistic feedback does help students to improve their writings. Yet, it provides fact that decreases the role of metalinguistic feedback in improving the students’ writings: it is not effective because it is time consuming than direct feedback.

Thus, according to all of those explanations, the researcher concludes that type of feedback which helps students to improve their writing is direct feedback. It is because the other two types of feedback are not more effective because they are more time consuming than direct feedback and cannot provide suggestions like what direct feedback does.
CHAPTER V

CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

This chapter presents the conclusions of the research. There are two parts that are presented in this chapter. The first part presents the conclusions drawn from the research findings. The second one presents the recommendation for English teacher and other researchers.

A. Conclusions

The study is aimed to identify the types of feedback that the students used in peer feedback activity in Paragraph writing Class A and the types of feedback that improve the students’ writing most. The researcher then drew some conclusions based on the research results and discussion.

First, the types of feedback that the Paragraph Writing Class A’ students received in peer feedback were direct feedback, indirect feedback, and metalinguistic feedback. Since the researcher only focused on grammatical mistakes, the students did not use the focused or unfocused feedback and reformulation feedback in the grammatical feedback part. Those types of feedback are applied to reconstruct the whole paragraph. Then, electronic feedback was not employed because the peer feedback was done in handwritten style. There were forty four direct feedbacks used by the students in the peer feedback activity. The
indirect feedback used by students was thirty three feedbacks. Meanwhile, there were two metalinguistic feedbacks used by a student in the peer feedback activity.

Based on the findings, it can be concluded that the students preferred to employ direct feedback in the peer feedback activity. Furthermore, the students in Paragraph Writing Class A also stated that direct feedback was the type of feedback that helped them to improve their writing. There were two main reasons: (1) direct feedback was not consuming and (2) direct feedback provided more suggestion to be considered.

**B. Recommendations**

The second part of this chapter is talking about recommendations. The recommendations are directed to the lecturer of English department, students and other future researchers who want to conduct the same type of research.

1. **The Lecturers of English Department**

Lecturers of English Department are suggested to employ peer feedback as the learning strategy in teaching writing. It is because the implementation of peer feedback helps students to improve their writings. Since direct feedback is the type of feedback that helps students the most, the lecturers are recommended to employ this type of feedback in peer feedback activity.

2. **Other Future Researchers**

This study has limitation at seeing to what types of feedback that students use. Moreover, to know the type of feedback that helps students to improve their writing the most, the researcher analyzed the implementation of each type of
feedback, the students’ writing improvement in general after getting peer feedback, and students’ opinion on the employing of each type of feedback. The future researchers who are interested in the use of type of peer feedback to improve students’ writings are recommended to do more detailed study at seeing more on the each student’s aspect improvement. Thus, a further and detailed investigation about the effect of each type of feedback is expected.
REFERENCES


Appendix A

The Questions of the Interview

1. Apakah kamu suka menulis?

2. Menurutmu, apakah tulisanmu sudah baik?

3. Apakah setiap kamu selesai menulis, kamu sudah yakin dengan tulisanmu?

4. Apakah kamu punya cara untuk meyakinkan dirimu bahwa tulisanmu sudah baik?

5. Apakah kamu tau peerumpan balik itu apa?

6. Menurutmu peer feedback membantu kamu dalam proses memperbaiki tulisanmu?

7. Dalam hal apa saja peer feedback membantumu memperbaiki tulisanmu?

8. *menunjukan tipe tipe umpan balik* Tipe umpan balik mana yang menurutmu membantu untuk meningkatkan kualitas tulisanmu?

9. Jika kamu mendapatkan umpan balik, apa yang kamu lakukan selanjutnya?

10. Apakah kamu mendapatkan sesuatu dari kegiatan peer feedback ini?
Appendix B

The Observation Note

Observation day 1
9\textsuperscript{th} March 2017

The lecturer review the material last week, explain today’s activities, and choose the partner randomly.

The students do the peer feedback to the partner that the lecturer has chosen for them. The time allotted is 15 minutes. They do it by themselves but they recently ask to their friends “\textit{apa maksut nya ini? Aku salahin yaaaa}”

They tell the correction to the owner of the writing at that time, they explain it. It is because they want their friend understand.

Then, the lecturer gives evaluation sheet to the students. It is more about the deeper meaning of the whole writing.

After finishing the feedback activity, they give the writing back to the owner.

Observation Day 2
16\textsuperscript{th} March 2017

This meeting, the lecturer does not ask the student to continue the peer feedback activity. They do group feedback. They are divided into three big groups. In this meeting, the lecturer explain theoretically about the feedback. Then, the rest of today’s activity is about group feedback.
Observation Day 3

23rd March 2017

The lecturer divided the class into three groups. She explains today’s activity. They will do a game “Begin with the end”. After doing the game, they are asked to revise their previous draft. They also learn about how to make a good paragraph.
## Appendix C

### Ms. Yuseva’s Validation

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Details</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>Suwarni Arbowati</td>
<td>I am excited with the actors or actress as they enhance the movie's interest.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>Joshua dhanu</td>
<td>Because actors or actresses will make the movies more interesting with their acting.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Finally, I can learn moral value from the movies. For example, in the movie, the moral value is about the importance of honesty.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>For instance, like Pinocchio, the moral value is to be honest.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>I like to watch movies. So, these are my reasons why I spend my time to watch movies.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>They got married in 1987 and have two daughters. When my father was a child, he always studied hard to be a successful person.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
|3. | 008 | Clara andira dwi putri wijaya | I love my Idol very much. First, it can be a spirit for me to start my day, because ...
|   |   | Irawan (24) | Sometimes, I feel so lonely, but when I see my Idol’s picture ...
|   |   |   | I always put my Idol’s picture in my book.
|   |   |   | Reformulation: They should be a sentence I love my Idol very much. There are some reasons why I always put my Idol’s picture in my book.
|   |   |   | Ref. & Form.: 2, 1 |
|4. | 008 | Fansiska maroetha haedyanti | That is why they are so precious to me and no one could be replace with other things in the world.
|   |   | Wikantri (019) | Last, they are my biggest motivation to do everything and give t, First, they are happiness because my feeling is in not a good mood they can cheer me up.
|   |   |   | Ref. & Form.: 1, 1 |
|5. | 009 | Stella Ladjwina | That’s how I spent my day with some activities, ...
<p>|   |   | Ni made widya (021) | |
|   |   |   | D: 1 |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Student 1</th>
<th>Student 2</th>
<th>Notes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| 6.  | Oliyini   | Jonathan haryana (012) | **PLAGIAT MERUPAKAN TINDAKAN TIDAK TERPUJI**
First of all, in the morning usually I wake up very early to go to campus.
In holiday, my friends and I usually travelling together...
After that, I having class (usually in the third floor) and then sometimes after having the class...
**Reformulation:**

| 7.  | Ossiana   | Maria lydia gelu | **PLAGIAT MERUPAKAN TINDAKAN TIDAK TERPUJI**
Then, I'm very like coloring book because that's can reduce my stress...
I want to be a success woman because of many reasons.
The first reason is I love my family so much.
**Direct:**
**Indirect:**

<p>| I: 5 | Direct: | Indirect: |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>8.</td>
<td>015</td>
<td>Amelia Kristian Rony</td>
<td>Klara Tyas Sulistyawati (020)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>It</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>First of all, I love sport because sport can make healthy for my body.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>The second/first Basketball can make our brain works, because we must know ...</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>First of all, I love sport because sport can make healthy for my body.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Another reason, why we love basketball is can makes us happy.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.</td>
<td>017</td>
<td>Maria Idiya Gelu</td>
<td>Sherena Agustin (014)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Whether</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>... God can judge me and evaluate whether I sing honestly or not.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>... but when I sing world song, I faster.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>I am never bored to sing for God, but when I sing world song, I faster.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Finally, sing is my priority, I am never bored to sing for God, ...</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Direct: 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Indirect: 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Reformulation: 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No</td>
<td>Name</td>
<td>Comment</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----</td>
<td>-----------------------</td>
<td>------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>018</td>
<td>Anastasia eka wulan utami</td>
<td>I really like to listening to the music for spend my time.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>The first music can makes me enjoy.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>The second with music I can open my mind.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>not only book can be a window of the world but music also can I think.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>I can improve my vocabulary, know about the grammar by the lyrics and also the pronunciation.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>When I know that the lyric that I find some words then that I don't know</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Maria Vanessa</td>
<td>I really like to listening to the music for spend my time.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>spending</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>The first is music can makes me enjoy.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>I will searching to find the lyrics then I try to sing it, search</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>... it really can makes me enjoy because the song will make</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>makes me deep and deeper with my feeling.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>... because the video clip of the song will show me about the other view of world.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10. 019</td>
<td>Wikantri Lamamuki</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------</td>
<td>------------------</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Fransisco martha (008)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| Music can also make me know about something new. |
|--------|-------------|
| And if my skills are increasing, my self confident will increasing. |
| ..., because the video clip of the song will shows me about the other view of world. |

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>M: 1</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Most of people likes sleeping, but spend a lot of your time sleep causes bad effects for our health.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>When we spend our free time for sleep, so our body lack of activities.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>R:2</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>It makes greases heaped in body cease burning that happen in our body decrease.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>spending</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Most of people likes sleeping, but spend a lot of your time sleep causes bad effects for our health.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>D:1</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

<p>| ..., so our body lack of activities. |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>ID</th>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Response</th>
<th>Type</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>020</td>
<td>Klara tyas</td>
<td>I love it because it can increase my mood.</td>
<td>Direct 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>sulistyawati</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>021</td>
<td>Ni made widya</td>
<td>I’m very interesting in traditional dance because of several reasons.</td>
<td>Reftorm</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Stella L U (009)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Practice</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Practicing makes me realize that nothing is perfect without practice.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>The other reason is dancing is money.</td>
<td>Reformt</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Makes can get</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>The other reason is dancing is money.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>These are reasons why I’m really love dancing.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>022</td>
<td>Kezia triyono</td>
<td>First, I like when it have a good style in fashion.</td>
<td>Direct 3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Agata dina (23)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Maybe one more example?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>... such as a lovely between a doctor and army. And I like many genres ...</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No.</td>
<td>Name</td>
<td>Information</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----</td>
<td>---------</td>
<td>----------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>Agatha</td>
<td>I like the place that they make for the setting of the story.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>dina</td>
<td>... such as a lovely between a doctor and army. And I like many genres ...</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>I like the place that they make for the setting of the story.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>These the reasons why I like watching korean drama</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>I like travelling.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>I can refreshing my eyes because I can refresh my eyes with the blue sea.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>It is my second reasons</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>... make creative thing with the sand, and hear the peaceful sounds of wave</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>I like beach so much.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>... the sea like sound of wave.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Appendix D

Mr. Daniel’s Validation

Pagi mbak Ela.. 11:25

I do apologize for this belated reply. 11:25

Just finished checking ur work 11:25

Kindly check whether ‘reformulation CF’ really occurred. 11:26

What makes it different from Direct Correction and Indirect one? 11:27

😊 11:27

Waa thankyou so much sir. 12:03 ✓

I will check it. 12:03 ✓

Nah, actually I’m little bit confused with the reformulation CF. 12:04 ✓

Based on your comment and miss yu’s comment, I think that reformulation didn’t occur 12:05 ✓

Hehe 12:08

Type a message
You
Nah, actually I'm little bit confused with the reformulation CF.

Reformulation wasn't there. It requires a certain demand from the task maker (as explained by Ellis).

Oh okay sir, so if the corrector cross "make" and suggest "making" it is categorized as direct CF?

Yes, i guess so.

It's a bit tricky.

So, it seems like it has to change the whole sentence so we can categorize it as reformulation ya sir?

Okay sir, thankyou so much for your help 😊🙏
### Appendix E
The classification of types of feedback used by student in Paragraph Writing
Class A

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>no</th>
<th>Nim</th>
<th>Feedback</th>
<th>Types feedbacks</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>003</td>
<td>I am really like to watching movies or dramas ...</td>
<td>Indirect: 7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>I really watch movies because it's makes you on a good mood.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Because romantic movies will make you happy and laughing.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Another reason, in movie and drama I am excited with the actors and actress</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Like to</td>
<td>Direct: 12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>First, I really watch movies because ...</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>&amp; comedy</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Because Romantic movies will make you happy ...</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Then, movies or dramas can teach you some new vocabularyies</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>If you watch movies from another country ...</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>that</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>... , so you will learn some words you never know before</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>actresses</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>... I am excited with the actors or actress</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Because actors or actress will make the movies more interesting with their acting.

Finally, I can learn moral value from the movies.

For example, Movie give a moral value, like pinochio the moral value is ... 

..., like Pinochio the moral value is don't like to lie someone. 

So, these are my reason why I spend my time to watch movies.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>2. 004</th>
<th>had</th>
<th>Direct: 3</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>They got married in 1987 and has two daughters.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

When my father was child, he always studied hard to be a success person. He always studied in Catholic private school.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>3. 005</th>
<th>I love my Idol very much.</th>
<th>Indirect: 7</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>First, it can be a spirit for me to start my day, because ...</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sometimes, I feel so lonely, but when I see my Idol's picture....</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>... I always put my Idol's picture in my</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
I love my Idol very much. There are some reason why I always put my Idol’s picture in my book. That is why they are so precious for me and no one could be replace with other. Last, they are my biggest motivation to do everything and give. First, they are happiness because my feeling is in not a good mood they can cheer me up.

That’s how I spent my day with some activities, ... First of all, in the morning usually I wake up very early to go to campus. In holiday, my friends and I usually travelling together. After that, I having class (usually in the third floor) and than sometimes after having the class ... then ... that’s can reduces my stress, and coloring book also changed my mood. It makes me creative, enjoy, and focus. I am very like coloring book because thatcam reduces my stress ...
7. 014

**successful**

I want to be a successful woman, because of many reasons.

I want to be a success woman, because of many reasons.

The first reason is I love my family so much.

---

8. 015

*It*

First of all, I love sport because sport can make healthy for my body.

*The second/first*

Basketball can make our brain works, because we must know...

First of all, I love sport because sport can make healthy for my body.

Another reason, why we love basketball is it can makes us happy.

---

9. 017

*whether*

... God can judge me and evaluate whether I sing honestly or not.

..., but when I sing world Song, I faster.

I am never bored to sing for God, but when I sing world song, I faster.

---

Finally, sing is my priority, I am never bored to sing for God, ...
I really like listening to the music for spend my time.

The first is music can makes me enjoy.

The second is with music I can open my mind.

... not only book can be a window of the world but music also can I think.

I can improve my vocabulary I know about the grammar by the lyrics and also the pronunciation.

When I know that the lyric that I find some words that I don't know then I will searching to find the lyrics then I try to sing it, ... make.... it really can makes me enjoy because the song will makes me deep and deeper with my feeling.

..., because the video clip of the song will shows me about the other view of world. show

Music can also makes me know about something new. make

And if my skills are increase my self confident will increase
<p>| | | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>increasing</td>
<td>Metalinguistic</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>..., because the video clip of the song will shows me about the other view of world.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Need a definite article “the”</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10. 019</td>
<td>Most of people likes sleeping, but spend a lot of your time sleep causes bad effects for our health.</td>
<td>Indirect</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>When we spend our free time for sleep, so our body lack of activities.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Heaped</td>
<td>Direct</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>It makes greases heaped in body reas burning that happen in our body decrease.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>spending</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Most of people likes sleeping, but spend a lot of your time sleep causes bad effects for our health.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>will</td>
<td>Direct</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>... so our body lack of activities.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11. 020</td>
<td>I love it because it can increase my mood.</td>
<td>Direct :1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sleep</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12. 021</td>
<td>I’m very interesting in traditional dancing because of several reasons.</td>
<td>Direct</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Practice</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Practicing makes me realize that nothing is</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>perfect without practice.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>The other reason is dancing is money.</td>
<td>Indirect</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Makes/ can get</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>The other reason is dancing is money.</td>
<td>Direct</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>These are reasons why I’m really love dancing.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>022</td>
<td>first, I like when it have a good style in fashion.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>..., such as a lovely between a doctor and army. And I like many genres ...</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><em>Maybe one more example?</em></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>I like the place that they make for the setting of the story.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>..., such as a lovely between a doctor and army. And I like many genres ...</td>
<td>Indirect</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>I like the place that they make for the setting of the story.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>These the reasons why I like watching Korean drama</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>023</td>
<td>I like travelling.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>I can refreshing my eyes because I can refresh my eyes with the blue sea.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>It is my second reasons</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
..., make creative thing with the sand, and hear the peaceful sounds of wave.

I like beach so much.

..., the sea like sound of wave.

And I think it’s the best kill your stress because of the busy activities.

**15. 024**  Another benefit, Dance can make new friends.

**16. 025**  I think all people in this world are like *to sing.*

Do you like *sing* right?

You feel like *loose* from your problem.

..., but when you *singing,* you will follow the tones and chord,...

... entertaining people from *her/him* problem, make *him/her* relax from...
### Appendix F

**Scoring Rubric**

**Students’ Drafts Scoring Rubric**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>nim</th>
<th>tense</th>
<th>clause structure</th>
<th>determiner</th>
<th>punctuation</th>
<th>score</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>65</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>70</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>85</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>70</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>70</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>85</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>95</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>75</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>85</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>85</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>85</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>average</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>79</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## Students’ Final Revision Scoring Rubric

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>nim</th>
<th>tense</th>
<th>clause structure</th>
<th>determiner article</th>
<th>punctuation</th>
<th>score</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>average</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>no</td>
<td>Nim</td>
<td>Feedback</td>
<td>Types feedbacks</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----</td>
<td>-----</td>
<td>----------</td>
<td>-----------------</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| 1. | 003 | I really like to watch movies and dramas because of several reason. | Indirect: 7  
First, I really like to watch movies because it makes you on good mood.  
For example, comedy movies will make you happy and laughing.  
Another reason, in movies and dramas I excited with the actors or actresses.  
First, I really like to watch movies because it makes you on good mood.  
For example, comedy movies will make you happy and laughing.  
Then, movies or dramas can teach you some new vocabularies.  
If we watch movies from another country ...  
..., so you will learn some words that you never know before  
... I am excited with the actors or actresses  
Because it will makes the movie more interesting with their acting.  |
|    |     |          | Direct: 12  
Suggest nya  
Mengganti kata  
Followed  |

**Types feedbacks**
- Yg dibulatindilangin
- Dibenerin
- Diganti katanya
- Deleted
- Suggest nya
- Mengganti kata
- Followed

**Note:**
- **PLAGIAT MERUPAKAN TINDAKAN TIDAK TERPUJI**
Finally, I can learn the moral value from the movies. Movie give a moral values, for example like pinochio the moral value is ... 

..., like Pinochio the moral value is dont like to lie to someone.

So, these are my reason why I like to spend my time to watch movies.

| 2. | 004 | They are got married in 1988. Then, they has two beautiful daughter. When my father was child, he always studied hard to be success person. | Direct : 3 | Ignored |

| 3. | 005 | I love my idol very much. First, it can be a spirit for me to start my day. I often feel so lonely, but when I see my idol’s picture I feel like they already beside me. ... I always put my idol’s picture in my book. | Indirect : 7 | Follow | Mengubah dan deleted | Mengubah total | Mengubah |
I love my Idol very much; they are so amazing for me, and there are some reasons why I always put my Idol’s picture in my book. That is why they are so precious for me and they could not be replaced with other things in the world.

Last, they are my biggest motivation to do everything and bring them credits whenever I go home.

First, they are happiness because my feeling is in not a good mood they can cheer me up.

---

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>4.</th>
<th>008</th>
<th>That is why they are so precious for me and they could not be replaced with other things in the world.</th>
<th>Direct: 2</th>
<th>Followed</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Last, they are my biggest motivation to do everything and bring them credits whenever I go home.</td>
<td>Indirect: 2</td>
<td>Followed dan mengganti</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>First, they are happiness because my feeling is in not a good mood they can cheer me up.</td>
<td>Reformulation: 1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>5.</th>
<th>009</th>
<th>That’s how I spent my day with some activities, ...</th>
<th>D: 1</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>First of all, in the morning I usually wake up early to go to campus,</td>
<td>I: 5</td>
<td>Mengubah dan deleted</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>In holiday, my friends and I usually travelling together ...</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>After that, I having class (usually in the third floor) and then sometimes after having the class ...</td>
<td>Reformulation: 1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. 011</td>
<td>For example coloring book can reduces my stress and my mood.</td>
<td>Direct:</td>
<td>Menggabungkan</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------</td>
<td>-------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>---------</td>
<td>---------------</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>It makes you creative, enjoy, and focus.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>I am very like coloring book because of several reasons.</td>
<td>Indirect:</td>
<td>Ignored</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Direct:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Indirect:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. 014</td>
<td>I want to be a successful woman because of many reasons.</td>
<td>Direct: 1</td>
<td>Other mistakes</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>I want to be a successful woman because of many reasons.</td>
<td>Indirect: 2</td>
<td>deleted</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>The first one is I love my family so much.</td>
<td>Change the diction</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. 015</td>
<td>First of all, I love sport because it can make our body healthy.</td>
<td>D:2</td>
<td>Followed</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Basketball can make our brain works, because we must know ...</td>
<td></td>
<td>Ignored</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>First of all, I love sport because it can make our body healthy.</td>
<td>Indirect :2</td>
<td>Followed</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Another reason why we love basketball is that it can make us happy.

... just God can judge and evaluate whether I sing honestly or not.

..., but when I sing world Song, I faster bored

I am never bored to sing for God, but when I sing world’s song, I faster.

Finally, sing is my priority, I never bored to sing for God, ...

I really like listening to the music for spend my time.

The first is music can makes me enjoy.

The second is with music I can open my mind.

... not only book can be a window of the world but music also can I think.

I can improve my vocabulary, know about the grammar by the lyrics and also the pronunciation.

When I know that the lyric than I find some words
that I don’t know

I really like to listening to the music for spend my time

The first is music can makes me enjoy.

I will searching to find the lyrics then I try to sing it, ...

..., it really can makes me enjoy because the song will makes me deep and deeper with my feeling.

..., because the video clip of the song will shows me about the other view of world.

Music can also makes me know about something new. *make*

And if my skills are increase my self confident will increase increasing

..., because the video clip of the song will shows me about the other view of world.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>10.019</th>
<th>Most of people likes sleeping, but spend a lot of your</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I:3</td>
<td>Ignored</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>R: 7</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>M: 1</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>time sleep causes bad effects for our health.</td>
<td>When we spend our free time for sleep, our body lack of activities.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>It heaped greases in body</td>
<td>Spending a lot of our time to sleep causes bad effects for our health</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>..., so our body will lack of activities.</td>
<td>Make new sentence</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11. 020</td>
<td>I love it because it can increase my mood.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12. 021</td>
<td>I’m very interesting in traditional dance because of several reasons.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Practicing makes me realize that nothing is perfect without practice.</td>
<td>Deleted</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The other reason is by dancing I can get money.</td>
<td>Change the whole sentences</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The other reason is by dancing I can get money.</td>
<td>Kuning : followed</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>These are the reasons why I’m really love dancing.</td>
<td>Merah : diabaikan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.</td>
<td>022</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14.</td>
<td>023</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15. 024</td>
<td>Another benefit, dance can make new friends.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16. 025</td>
<td>I think all people in this world are like to sing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Do you like singing right?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>You feel like loosing from your problem</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>...., but when you are singing you will follow the ties and chord</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>... entertaining people from their problem, make them relax from...</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Appendix H

The Example of Students’ drafts

precious treasure in my life for three reasons:

Family is an expensive thing for my life. First, they are happiness because

whenever my feeling is in not a good mood, they can cheer me up.

They always have many ways to make me comfort. Family is a

place to share everything. Next, family is a home for me because

They can make me miss them whenever I am especially they live long

away from me. Last, they are my biggest motivation to do everything

and give it when I go home. It always remind me to bring the credit for

them. That is why they are so precious for me, and they are

replaced with other things in the world.
Appendix I

The Example of Students’ Final Revisions

Precious Treasure

Family is a precious treasure in my life for three reasons.

First, they are my happiness because whenever my feeling is not
in a good mood they can cheer me up. They always have many
ways to make me comfort. Family is a place to share everything.

Next, family is a home for me because they can make me miss
them whenever I am. Especially, they live far away from me.

Last, they are my biggest motivation to do everything and
bring them a credit whenever I go home. That is why they
are so precious for me and they could not be replaced
with the other things in the world.
Appendix J

The Interview Transcription

Dina

Q: Suka menulis?
A: Sejujurnya engga

Q: Knapa? Nulis susah ga?
A: Susah lagi di b.inggris itu grammarnya harus benar, jalan cerita harus kronologis, imajinasi harus creative. Jd susah.

Q: Di kelas sering diminta menulis, mengalami kesulitan / yakin nggak?
A: pasti ga yakin

Q: Cara mengatasi?
A: tanya temen, bener ga klo bener yaudah, klo engga ce dikamus jg

A: Yg paling challenging grammar

Q: apakah kamu tahu apa itu peer feedback?
A: Koreksi dari temen, dikoreksi temen

Q: PF membantu unt improve tulisanmu atau tidak?
A: Bantu, karena di koreksi jadi tahu apa yg salah
Q: Yg kasih fedbak tu temen, sama sama belajar percaya ga, langsung ganti ga?

A: Biasanya ga tanya cm 1 orang dong, coba tanya yg lain jg, klo emg mentok
cari solusi sndiri, ga langsung ganti

A: Pas dapet umpan balik, klo yg indirect cara sendiri benernya apa

Q: Yang effective yg mana?

A: Yang dikasih pembetulannya. Karena tahu apa yang benar tidak cuma tahu
salah

Q: Banyak umpan balik, sesuai dg harapan mu ga?

A: Klo emg kesalahannya segini doang yasudah.

A: Iya minta yg lebih ga cm grammatical doang tapi kata yg enak biar lebih
flownya enak

A: dari mendapatkan umpan balik aku dapet 1. Tau kesalahannya apaa 2. Belajar
ngoreksi orang lain juga.

Eka

Q: Suka nulis?

A: Suka

Q: in english ?

A: jarang tp suka
Q: Nulis in _english_ susah ga?

A: Gampang tp masih masalah di _grammar_, dr SMP dan SMA sering menulis, tapi _pay attention_ lebih di grammar

Q: Banyak disuruh menulis, sudah yakin belum?

A: kalau ide sudah yakin, tp _grammar_ belum yakin.

Q: Apa yg d lakukan?

A: paling gampang tanya ke teman, kalau tidak tanya ke dosen.

Q: _Peer feedback_ itu apa?

A: Salah satu kegiatan yg bntu tau kelemanan dan membantu teman lain

Q: Apakah memperbaiki tulisanmu?

A: Bantu sih tapi kadang saya butuh temen yang lebih baik bahasa inggris nya dari saya.

Q: Metalingusitic membantu tidak? Lbh seneng lbh mendetailed salah yg mana, benernya kayak apa, spy ga keulang lagi.

Q: Does it help you to improve your writing?

A: sometimes it helps me. But I need friends who has english proficiency better than me.

Q: Does metalinguistic umpan balik help you?
A: Honestly I prefer the detailed information. So I know ny error and also the correct form. then, in he future, I will not repeat the same error.

Q: Diteliti temen , brapa persen percaya?

A: Tergantung orang, rata2 70%.

Q: Setelah dikasih Umpan balik, apa yg dilakukan?

A: Coba menelaah, klo paham yaudah, klo engga ya ditanyain lagi

Q :Bkal kamu ikutin ga?

A: Kadang malah mbenerin , sama sama belajar, ga harus ikutin.

*menjelasin tipe umpan balik*

A: Yg ngasih pembetuan lbh jelas , jd baha evaluasi membantu banget siah ini . Klo cm d coretitu pelit bgt nih ga kasih pembetulanny. Jelas bingung dan jadi harus tanya lagi ga efektif gt lho.

Q: Menurutmu umpan balik kasih km apa ?


Irawan

Q: Suka nulis ?

A: suka nulis tp dg topik yg saya pilih
Q: Di Paragraph writing di suruh menulis, kamu sudah yakinkah dengan tulisanmu?

A: Saya memilih topik yg saya ingin, jd saya senang dg tulisan saya nanti, jd bener2 yakin sama topik saya

Q: Sudah yakin sama grammar content dll blm ?

A: saya sempet ragu2 , tp yakin grammar udah bener, yg terjadi kesalahan bukan di grammar tapi hanya capitalization.

Q: Peer feedback itu apa?

A: Itu seperti commet atau masukan untuk tulisan lain

Q: Membantu improve tulisanmu tidak?

A: Umpan balik membantu untuk penulis jadi bisa mengimprove kesalahan supaya diperbaiki lagi, jadi bisa lebih baik lagi.

Q: Peer feedback sama sama belajar, efektif ga sih ?

A: miss trully bilan, masih ada kebingungan masih bs tanya miss nya. Article saya emg yg salah cm itu saja jd ga tanya sama miss trully. Walau ga yakin ckup membantu.

*jelaskan tipe*

A: Prefer yg ada pembenarannya karna lbh jelas . kita jg kadang gatau udah bener atau belum grammarnya, klo dicoret gatau salahnya knapa, jd lbh baik dikasih pembetuannya. Trus bs sharing
Q: Yg kamu harapin dr *peer feedback* ?

A: kalau itu sekukupnya saja kalau memang tidak banyak yang salah yasudah ndak papa

Q: Setelah dapet umpan balik, dibenerin atau engga ?

A: cm itu doang kok yg salah jd Cuma itu aja

Q: Merasa membantu ga ?

A: bantu sihhh, smg ga salah lagi.

**Irma**

Q: Suka nulis ?

A: engga begitu

Q: di kelas suruh nulis *in english*, yakin atau tidak ?

A: rata rata yakin sih, kadang lupa lupa *minimum requirementnya*

Q: kan kamu merasa tidak yakin, apakah kamu punya cara khusus untuk menghadapinya?

A: Tanya temen, *njuk* mengingat ingat kelas *grammar*

Q: menurutmu *peer feedback* itu apa?

A: Kasih pendapat ke temen tentang tulisannya

Q: Bantu kamu untuk *improve* tulisanmu atau tidak? Kamu percaya tidak dengan temanmu?
A: Sangat membantu. Kadang lebih teliti di grammar nya sebelum di kumpulin. Saya sih percaya tp lbh ngecek lg sama isi tempat kita Klo ga cocok ga dipake

Q: setelah mendapat peer feedback, apakah langsung kamu ganti?

A saya baca ulang dulu, kalau ada yg aneh aku ganti lagi , pake kata kata yg mirip.

Q: Merasa si korektor bener ga ?

Abener sih , jd keinget

Q: Jelasin type umpan balik. yg lbh membantu ?

A: yang kasih pembenaran , ga cm dicoret gatau benernya yg mana

Q: apa yang kamu lakukan saat setelah mendapat peer feedback?


Klara

Q: Apakah suka nulis ?

A: lumayan

Q: Di kelas disuruh banyak menulis, menurutmu apakah tulisanmu sudah benar?

A: udah bener sih , karena saya suka ngecek grammarnya dlu . saya selalu mengecek dulu untuk meyakinkan.
Q: menurutmu, **peer feedback** itu apa?

A: dievaluasi sama temen.

Q: Masih sama bsama belajar, percaya ga?

A: 50%, lbh percaya sama dosen.

Q: *menunjukan kata yang disalahkan padahal sebenarnya tidak masalah*


Q: Apa yg amu harapan?

A: grammarnya gmana, kheren atau kohesi nya nyambung atau engga gt.