THE VIOLATION OF MASCULINITY MYTH OF AMERICAN COWBOY REFLECTED IN ANNIE PROULX’S BROKEBACK MOUNTAIN

A SARJANA PENDIDIKAN THESIS

Presented as Partial Fulfillment of the Requirements to Obtain the Sarjana Pendidikan Degree in English Language Education

By

Dimas Wulan Merdeka Basuki
Student Number: 091214048

ENGLISH LANGUAGE EDUCATION STUDY PROGRAM
DEPARTMENT OF LANGUAGE AND ARTS EDUCATION
FACULTY OF TEACHERS TRAINING AND EDUCATION
SANATA DHARMA UNIVERSITY
YOGYAKARTA
2014
THE VIOLATION OF MASCULINITY MYTH OF AMERICAN COWBOY REFLECTED IN ANNIE PROULX’S BROKEBACK MOUNTAIN

A SARJANA PENDIDIKAN THESIS

Presented as Partial Fulfillment of the Requirements to Obtain the Sarjana Pendidikan Degree in English Language Education

By

Dimas Wulan Merdeka Basuki
Student Number: 091214048

ENGLISH LANGUAGE EDUCATION STUDY PROGRAM
DEPARTMENT OF LANGUAGE AND ARTS EDUCATION
FACULTY OF TEACHERS TRAINING AND EDUCATION
SANATA DHARMA UNIVERSITY
YOGYAKARTA
2014
A Sarsana Pendidikan Thesis on

THE VIOLATION OF MASCULINITY MYTH OF AMERICAN COWBOY REFLECTED IN ANNIE PROULX'S BROKEBACK MOUNTAIN

By

Dimas Wulan Merdeka Basuki
Student Number: 091214048

Approved by

Advisor

Henny Herawati, S.Pd., M.Hum.

Date

January 3, 2014
A Sarjana Pendidikan Thesis on

THE VIOLATION OF MASCULINITY MYTH OF AMERICAN COWBOY REFLECTED IN ANNE PROULX'S BROKEBACK MOUNTAIN

By

Dimas Wulan Merdeka Basuki
Student Number: 091214048

Defended before the Board of Examiners on January 15, 2014 and Declared Acceptable

Board of Examiners

Chairperson: C. Tutyandari, S.Pd., M.Pd.
Secretary: Drs. Barli Bram, M.Ed., Ph.D.
Member: Henny Herawati, S.Pd., M.Hum.
Member: Dra. Novita Dewi, M.S., M.A (Hons.), Ph.D.
Member: C. Tutyandari, S.Pd., M.Pd.

Yogyakarta, January 15, 2014
Faculty of Teachers Training and Education
Sanata Dharma University

Dean

Supandi, Ph.D.
“If You Can’t Fix it, You’ve Got to Stand it.”
-- Brokeback Mountain

“Be Out and Proud!”
-- Anonymous

“When I was in the military, they gave me a medal for killing two men and a discharge for loving one.”
-- Epitaph of Leonard P. Matlovich

I dedicate this thesis to:
My Mother
&
All gay people out there who feel discriminated
STATEMENT OF WORK’S ORIGINALITY

I honestly declare that this thesis, which I have written, does not contain the work or parts of the work of other people, except those cited in the quotations and the references, as a scientific paper should.

Yogyakarta, January 03, 2014

The Writer

Dimas Wulan Merdeka Basuki
091214048
LEMBAR PERNYATAAN PERSETUJUAN
PUBLIKASI KARYA ILMIAH UNTUK KEPENTINGAN AKADEMIS

Yang bertanda tangan di bawah ini, saya mahasiswa Universitas Sanata Dharma:

Nama : Dimas Wulan Merdeka Basuki
Nomor Mahasiswa : 091214048

Demi pengembangan ilmu pengetahuan, saya memberikan kepada Perpustakaan Universitas Sanata Dharma karya ilmiah saya yang berjudul:

THE VIOLATION OF MASCULINITY MYTH OF AMERICAN COWBOY REFLECTED IN ANNie PROULX’S BROKEBACK MOUNTAIN

beserta perangkat yang diperlukan (bila ada). Dengan demikian saya memberikan kepada Perpustakaan Universitas Sanata Dharma hak untuk menyimpan, mengalihkan dalam bentuk media lain, mengelolanya dalam bentuk pangkalan data, mendistribusikan secara terbatas, dan mempublikasikannya di Internet atau media lain untuk kepentingan akademis tanpa perlu meminta ijin dari saya maupun memberikan royalty kepada saya selama tetap mencantumkan nama saya sebagai penulis.

Demikian pernyataan ini yang saya buat dengan sebenarnya.
Dibuat di Yogyakarta
Pada tanggal : 15 Januari 2014

Yang menyatakan

[Signature]

(Dimas Wulan Merdeka Basuki)
ABSTRACT


This study discusses Brokeback Mountain, a novella written by an American author named Annie Proulx. The story gives a spotlight on the homosexual love relationship between the two main male characters. The story is very moving, beautifully narrated, and has excruciatingly painful ending. Revolving around homosexuality issue between two male American cowboys, the story perfectly depicts the discrimination towards homosexual people in 1960s. Thus, in this study, the writer intended to analyze the violation of masculinity myth of American cowboy reflected in Annie Proulx’s Brokeback Mountain.

In order to analyze the violation of masculinity in Brokeback Mountain there must be a research problem. One research problem was formulated in this study. The research problem is: How do the main characters violate the masculinity myth of American cowboy in Annie Proulx’s Brokeback Mountain?

In order to answer the research problem, the writer applied the socio-cultural approach, which enabled the writer to relate the violation of masculinity myth with the social condition and culture of American cowboy society in the 1960s. The writer chose a library study as the method of this study, in which a novella entitled Brokeback Mountain became the primary source of the study. The secondary sources of this study contained theories and reviews on sociological description of American cowboy, sociological review of homosexuality and society’s concept of masculinity.

Based on the analysis conducted, there were three findings found in the study. The first finding reveals that the main characters violate the masculinity myth of American cowboy because they show their fear. It is viewed by the society that having fear is not manly or feminine. Their fears show that one of the traditional masculinities, boldness, is being violated. The Second finding reveals that the main characters violate the masculinity myth of American cowboy through their fragility. It is viewed by the society that men should have the quality of being manly; strong, durable and unbreakable. Therefore, the fragility which appears in both Ennis del Mar and Jack Twist violates the masculinity myth of American cowboy in this study: being strong, durable, and unbreakable. The third finding, based on the sociological review of homosexuality, reveals that the main characters violate masculinity myth through homosexuality. Masculinity is against homosexuality, which means that a homosexual man will automatically violate the masculinity myth of American cowboy.

Keywords: Brokeback Mountain, masculinity myth, American cowboy
ABSTRAK


Untuk menganalisa pelanggaran maskulinitas pada Brokeback Mountain, diperlukan rumusan masalah. Studi ini memiliki satu persoalan yang akan dibahas yaitu tentang bagaimana kedua karakter utama melanggar mitos maskulinitas cowboy Amerika sebagaimana digambarkan dalam Brokeback Mountain.


Kata Kunci: Brokeback Mountain, mitos maskulinitas, cowboy Amerika
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

I am deeply indebted to Allah SWT for the blessing and love upon the process of writing this thesis. Obstacles come and go throughout the process of writing the thesis. However, the love and blessing have always strengthened me in finishing this thesis.

I am also greatly indebted to my thesis advisor, Henny Herawati, S.Pd, M.Hum, for her sincere dedication. I thank her for being my fairy god mother who endlessly supports me and keeps believing me in times of doubt. Her faith in me that I could finish this thesis no matter how long it would take surely kept me going until I truly finished this thesis.

I also want to express my great honor to Yuseva Ariyani Iswandari, S.Pd, M.Ed. for her sincere support. I thank her for being very kind to me when being kind was not fashionable. I remember in time of despair doing this thesis, a remarkable lecturer telling me that all I need is just to get away from everything for awhile then get back writing again. The next thing I knew I was on a train heading to Jakarta and a little step closer to one of my dreams becoming a fashion designer. Words do have power.

My deepest gratitude will always go to my mother, Wulandari, and to my younger brothers, Damas and Domas, for their sincere and unconditional love, patience, and endless support in many ways. Without them I would not be where I am now. My love will also go for my late father, alm. Basuki, without him I would never be the man I am today. When God decided to take him as one of His
angels, we learned how to struggle in life. He made me a man of the family, but I know I would never be able to replace him. My family is the only reason that keep me going this far. All I do, I do it for love, and love here named Wulandari, Basuki, Damas, and Domas.

I thank two of the three little pigs Tiara and Sandy, who have been standing with me through the good and the bad, up and down. I thank Rena for being best friend and the best hairstylist in our business. I also would like to thank Joneta, Risa, Wisnu, Maris, Nindy, Ratna, and all PBI students batch 2009 that I could not mention one by one for persevering together in every moment we have been through in PBI. My deep gratitude also goes to all PBI lecturers and staff (especially Mba Dhanniek and Mba Tari) for their hard works.

I thank my Kansas man, Matthew James Onstott, for giving me an authentic American way of love. There is no better way of understanding American cowboy culture than learning it directly from a cowboy.

Last but not least, I would like to address my gratitude to those who sincerely and unconditionally motivate, inspire, and advise me to always do my best in life.

Sincerely,

Dimas Wulan Merdeka Basuki
TABLE OF CONTENTS

TITLE PAGE ........................................................................................................... i
APPROVAL PAGE................................................................................................... ii
STATEMENT OF WORK’S ORIGINALITY ....................................................... v
PERNYATAAN PERSETUJUAN PUBLIKASI ................................................... vi
ABSTRACT ............................................................................................................ vii
ABSTRAK ............................................................................................................. viii
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS......................................................................................... ix
TABLE OF CONTENTS ....................................................................................... xi
LIST OF APPENDICES ....................................................................................... xiii

CHAPTER I. INTRODUCTION .............................................................................. 1
  A. Background of the Study ................................................................. 1
  B. Problem Formulation .................................................................. 3
  C. Objectives of the Study ................................................................. 3
  D. Benefits of the Study ................................................................. 3
  E. Definition of Terms ................................................................. 4

CHAPTER II. REVIEW OF RELATED LITERATURE .................................. 7
  A. Review of Related Theories ....................................................... 7
     1. Socio-Cultural Approach to Literature .................................. 7

xi
2. Sociological Description of American Cowboy ........ 9
3. Sociological Review of Homosexuality ................. 10
4. Society’s Concept of Masculinity .......................... 13

B. Theoretical Framework ...................................... 16

CHAPTER III. METHODOLOGY .................................. 18

A. Object of the Study .......................................... 18
B. Approach of the Study ...................................... 19
C. Method of the Study ........................................ 20

CHAPTER IV. ANALYSIS .......................................... 22

The Violation of Masculinity Myth of American Cowboy 22
1. Fear ................................................................. 22
2. Fragility ............................................................. 26
3. Homosexuality .................................................. 32

CHAPTER V. CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS .... 40

A. Conclusions ..................................................... 40
B. Suggestions ..................................................... 42
1. For the Future Researchers ................................. 43
2. For Teachers ..................................................... 43

REFERENCES ...................................................... 45
LIST OF APPENDICES

Appendix A:
The Summary of Brokeback Mountain ................................................................. 47

Appendix B:
The Biography of Annie Proulx ........................................................................ 49

Appendix C:
Reflecting Brokeback Mountain: A Reflection of Sexual Orientation
Discrimination Seen in Brokeback Mountain and Its Relation to Gay
Student Bullying in Schools ............................................................................. 52
CHAPTER I
INTRODUCTION

This study aims to reveal the violation of masculinity myth of American cowboy reflected in Annie Proulx’s *Brokeback Mountain*. This introductory chapter contains five major sections, namely (1) background of the study, (2) problem formulation, (3) objectives of the study, (4) benefits of the study, and (5) definition of terms. Background of the study will be focusing on why the topic was chosen. Problem formulation formulates the problems that will be discussed in the study. Objectives of the study present the purposes of this study. It is related to the benefits of study which aim to reveal the advantages of the study for the readers of this thesis. Definition of terms is aimed to prevent ambiguous interpretations of the terms used in this study.

A. **Background of the Study**

The topic of homosexuality has been widely discussed over and over, including homosexuality in literary works, such as novel, novella, short story, children’s literature, children’s picture book, poem, song’s verses and movie. People would always see it as controversial when it comes to homosexuality, some would end up agreeing and the rest would be busy disagreeing. Among so many other literary works containing homosexuality, Annie Proulx’s *Brokeback Mountain* is a different yet interesting one because in the novella, Proulx draws the topic of homosexuality in the middle of masculinity myth of American cowboy. Proulx also sets the setting of the story in Wyoming 1963 which happens
to have *homophobic* society and notoriously known for their violent behaviors toward gay people at that time. Homophobia is the fear of any terms related to homosexuality. The setting of the story would later bring the dynamic and the psychological feelings for the homosexual relationship of the main characters and it would be analyzed in the research. In relation to the *homophobic* society, this study aims to educate and enlighten Indonesian people that it is not homosexuality we need to fight against, but the narrow-minded and the homophobic actions.

The main characters, Ennis del Mar and Jack Twist, two nineteen-year-old cowboys, were raised in poverty and low education. They both were rough mannered, rough spoken and school dropout. In 1963, Ennis del Mar and Jack Twist, two ranch hands, come together as shepherder one summer. At first, sharing an isolated tent, the attraction is casual, inevitable, but something deeper caught them. Both men worked hard, married, and had kids like every common cowboy does, but over the course of many years of separations, this relationship became the most important thing in their lives, and they did everything they could to preserve it. The story of *Brokeback Mountain* has captivated the readers in a glimpse about a real cowboy world and its reality in relation to human beings and their emotions. Eleanor Ringle Gillespie (Atlanta Journal-Constitution, 2005) in her review stated that, *Brokeback Mountain* is a love story, but that is not all it is. In some ways, the story is as much about the way we were as the way they are. Jack and Ennis live in fear of discovery in a Reagan World that considers them in the same league as pedophiles. Surrounded
by hatred, contempt and bigotry, they are condemned to lead inauthentic lives, full of curdled yearning and clamped-down emotions.

The focus of this study is to describe how the main characters in Annie Proulx’s *Brokeback Mountain* violate the masculinity myth of American cowboy.

B. Problem Formulation

This study is aimed to reveal how the main characters, Ennis del Mar and Jack Twist, violate the masculinity myth of American cowboy as it is reflected in Annie Proulx’s novella *Brokeback Mountain*. Therefore, I formulate one research problem:

How do the main characters in Annie Proulx’s *Brokeback Mountain* violate the masculinity myth of American cowboy?

C. Objective of the Studies

Based on the research questions I have one objective. The objective of this study is to reveal how the main characters in Annie Proulx’s *Brokeback Mountain*, Ennis del Mar and Jack Twist, violate the masculinity myth of American cowboy.

D. Benefits of the Study

This section identifies who will benefit from the study. The benefits of the study can be classified as follows. The students of PBI Sanata Dharma would be able to acknowledge various kinds of literary works related to homosexuality theme and any other different sex orientation themes.

The lecturers of PBI Sanata Dharma, especially for literature course lecturers such as *Book Report*, *Prose*, and *Poetry*. In hope that they would be able
to introduce and provide the students with various literary work genres including those related to homosexuality and other different sexual orientations.

All students in Indonesia starting from junior level to higher level education would be able to acknowledge and access various kinds of literary works including those related to homosexuality and other different sexual orientations. It is important to let them know that gay, lesbian, bisexual and transgender people exist among them.

All teachers and educators in Indonesia would be able to introduce and acknowledge various kinds of literary works including those related to homosexuality and other different sexual orientations. It is important for the teachers and educators to be open-minded and teach their students about tolerance to make a safe and supportive learning environment for every single student including those gay, lesbian, bisexual, and transgender students who might be among them.

E. Definition of Terms

1. Homosexuality

According to LeVay (1993) and Weinrich (1994), homosexuality is the occurrence or existence of sexual attraction, interest and genitally intimate activity between an individual and other members of the same gender. The most common terms for homosexual people are *lesbian* for females and *gay* for males, though *gay* is also used to refer generally to both homosexual males and females. In this study, homosexuality refers to the relationship which occurs between the two main male characters, Ennis del Mar and Jack Twist. Homosexuality in this
novella is depicted as the romantic feeling between two male cowboys. First it begins with an intimate interaction then becomes relationship among them. In the story, the early childhood of both Ennis and Jack have role in shaping Ennis and Jack sexual orientation and homosexual characteristic.

2. American Cowboy

American cowboy has become the main masculine image in American men’s culture. The beginning of American cowboy history begins in 1860s. According to Hattrup (2000) in her journal, after the civil war many men rushed to the west for the opportunity to work, earn money and seek adventure. They shared an expertise in horsemanship, shepherding, and skills in using ropes. In relation to the topic of the study, both the main characters, Ennis del Mar and Jack Twist are cowboys. They are hired as sheepherder in Brokeback Mountain. Hattrup (2000) added that cowboys are simply cattle herders. Cowboy could be boastful and proud and demonstrated much loyalty to their group, but the herd is cowboy’s most important concern. In Annie Proulx’s Brokeback Mountain, both Ennis and Jack are paid cowboys to herd Joe Aguirre’s scattle as it is written in the novella:

That spring, hungry for any job, each had signed up with Farm and Ranch Employment—they came together on paper as herder and camp tender for the same sheep operation of Signal. It would be Jack Twist’s second summer on the mountain, Ennis’ first. Neither of them was twenty. (Brokeback Mountain, 2005, p. 5)

This is supported by Hattrup (2000) by saying that usually cowboys work on ranches that are usually owned by others.
3. **Violation**

In relation to the main problem of this study which is the violation of masculinity myth of American cowboy, it is important to define what violation is. The violation in this study context is defined as the ways these two main characters, Ennis del Mar and Jack Twist, break the boundary of masculinity myth by showing some characteristics which are considered not masculine. These characteristics which break the boundary of masculinity can be seen through the narration of the story, the relationship between the characters, and the relationship between the characters and the society.

4. **Masculinity Myth of American Cowboy**

In relation to the masculinity myth of American cowboy, the masculinity myth in this study is actually the same as the masculinity myth of men in general. It means that the masculinity myth of American cowboy and the masculinity myth of men in general share the same perspective in defining the masculinity. In 1970, the studies on psychology and sociology define the term masculinity as possessing qualities or characteristics typical to be appropriate for a man. The term is used to describe any human, animal, or object that have the quality of being manly, rough, strong, insensitive, and sexist. In the context of the story, the myth of masculinity is related to American cowboy as having characteristics for being manly, strong, rough mannered, unbreakable, bold, insensitive, and straight (heterosexual). Proulx’s *Brokeback Mountain* is set in the middle of masculinity myth of American cowboys.
CHAPTER II

REVIEW OF RELATED LITERATURE

The review of related literature in this chapter is about the theories in conducting this study. This chapter consists of two parts. The first part, review of related theories, reviews the related and relevant theories employed in this study. The second part, the theoretical framework, explains in steps the contribution of the theories and reviews in solving the problem of the study. This part also explains how those theories are applied in the study.

In this chapter the theory of socio-cultural approach of literature, sociological description of American cowboy, sociological review of homosexuality, and society’s concept of masculinity are presented to support the discussion in this study.

A. Review of the Related theories

1. Socio-cultural Approach to Literature

Kennedy and Gioia (1998) mentions about the socio-cultural approach to Literature. Kennedy and Gioia (1998) mentions that in socio-cultural approach, the sociological criticism examines the literary works in the cultural, economic, and political context. Kennedy and Gioia (1998) also add that this socio-cultural approach explores the relationship between the characters and the society. This is supported by Kammeyer, Ritzer, and Yetmon (1994) by mentioning that sociology specifically explores on why and how a condition happens in a society. While Bukharin (1969) in
his book mentions that as a matter of fact, social phenomena are created by persons, and that society consists of persons who think, cogitate, feel, pursue, purposes and act. In the subject of the study, the society where the characters live takes a huge role in shipping the way of life of its people. As it is supported by Bukharin (1969) in his book that if social phenomena follow a uniform law and if they are nevertheless the result of the actions of men, it follows that the actions of each individual also depend on something. It thus follows that man and his will are not free, but bound, being subject also to certain laws. It shows that the way of the characters’ lives is not free, but bound to the society’s law. I must say that somehow, man’s feeling is dependent on the condition of his organism and on the circumstances in which he finds himself. What happens between the characters and the society they live in is somehow reflected in Bukharin’s (1969) words which mention that social phenomena do not express the will of individual persons, but frequently is a different contradiction of this will; they prevail over it by force, with the result that the individual often feels the pressure of social forces on his actions.

In order to make sociology specific, Kammeyer, Ritzer, and Yetmon (1994) classify sociology into at least fifty specializations. One of them is sociology of culture or in this study called as socio-cultural. This socio-cultural is based on the interrelationship within the complex unity. It means that one person who lives in a certain community will influence others when they live in a society that consists of people from many different races, religions, sexual orientations, and cultures. In this study, this socio-cultural is suitable for analyzing the relationship between the main
characters of the story and their relationship with the society of American cowboy in Wyoming 1960s.

2. Sociological Description of American Cowboy

The story of *Brokeback Mountain* takes place in the middle of American cowboy masculinity myth. American cowboy is believed to be uniquely American culture. According to Richard (2000), American cowboy has become an idealized representative of the tradition of chivalry. The American cowboy archetype is essential ideological and hegemonic elements in American’s paradigmatic cultural shifts as the country moves toward nationalism, industrialism, and capitalism.

The beginning of American cowboy history began in 1860s as the result of the invasion of cattle industry. American cowboys work as sheep herder in the mountain, and have such hazardous work in isolated condition. American cowboy has been known for the bred of the tradition of self-dependence and individualism. Supported by Kearns (2012), he mentions that an American cowboy has some persistent stereotypes of being masculine, rough, manly, handworkers and isolated. In the society, American cowboys are usually ranked low in the social structure. In the story, the two main characters, Ennis del Mar and Jack Twist are depicted as school drop-out, rough mannered, and rough spoken, suits the typical of low end society. American cowboys often work in all-male environment, particularly on cattle drives, and in the frontier west, men often significantly outnumbered women. As it is related to the masculinity myth, American cowboys remain deeply homophobic. A man to
man intimate and close friendship will be considered as homosexual relationship and will be socially punished. In many views of American cowboy they are told to be famous for their hard works and bravery, however on the other hand they also stereotyped as being full of violence, rough mannered, bad tempered, and physical.

Further Kearns (2012) mentions that the truth about the real American cowboys of the mid-to-late nineteenth century is as complex as other historical objects. The real cowboys are the mixture of races, creeds, and ages. All craved the one thing that most Americans who came west were looking for: a better life. Although some cowboys do make a better life for themselves, others often fall into lawlessness and crime. The majority, however, endure a hard, strenuous existence that yielded few opportunities. Today the American cowboy is viewed as the quintessential American figure from a mythic past.

3. Sociological Review of Homosexuality

When we are talking about homosexuality, first of all we must define the word homosexuality clearly in order to get the better and clearer view on homosexuality. LeVay and Heinrich (1994) mention that homosexuality is the existence of sexual attraction, interest, and genitally intimate activity between an individual and other members of the same gender. It is supported by Crooks (198:291). Crooks mentions that a homosexual person is an individual whose primary erotic, psychological, emotional, and social interest is in a member of the same sex, even though that interest may not be overtly expressed.
Homosexuality is usually assumed with the erotic expression of one person to another person with the same gender and assumed to be inappropriate and sinful. An individual who is involved in homosexual activities is called homosexual or gay for male homosexual and lesbian for female homosexual. The existence of homosexuality can actually be found throughout ages, cultures and through out the world no matter how advanced or primitive, large or small, ancient or modern.

If we are talking about homosexuality, there will be a question that comes to our mind about why or how a person can be a homosexual. Then further another question may come about how a person can be a heterosexual too. Many researchers throughout the ages had done some primary researches in finding out the causes of homosexuality in an individual, and for some people, they may come up with some surprising facts about the causes of homosexuality in an individual. Coleman (1972: 395) says that there have been two different views on the cause of homosexuality. They are constitutional (biological) and psychosocial factors. Specifically, the sexual development of American male is also mentioned in Lerner’s America as a Civilization book as it is quoted from Kinsey (1957) that in the case of American male, the sexual life pattern he is likely to follow is set during his adolescence. But while this life pattern is in large measure genetically determined, the form in which the sexual drive expresses itself is shaped by class and social environment.

Homosexual people usually live in some small communities and engaged in some private activities. It is supported by Coleman (1973: 393). Coleman mentions that most activities of homosexual people take place in friendship cliques and only a
small part of the behavior is visible to the public. This visible part is functioning as social institutions when friends are met, news and gossip exchanged, and warning about current political policy.

In relation to the society of Wyoming 1960s in the story and the main characters’ homosexual behaviors, Coleman (1972: 392) in his book mentions that homosexual people are not free from problems. Homosexual people have to make adequate occupational, sexual, and general social adjustments in the face of society’s severe disapproval and prejudice. Many homosexual people live in continual fear of detection, loss of employment, and social disgrace even though they feel they have equal rights with heterosexual people in the matter of their sexual adjustment, and the rest of them feel that their sexual desires are wrong. It leads them into a constant conflict within themselves. When a homosexual man lives alone and does not belong to any organized group of homosexual, he tends to be continually at war with himself and to feel insecure, apprehensive, and lonely. However, Crooks in his book (1983: 293-294) mentions that a number of research studies of other cultures have revealed widespread acceptance of homosexuality. Homosexuality has been widely accepted in many earlier cultures. In ancient Greece, homosexual relationship between men was believed to be superior intellectual and spiritual expression of love, whereas heterosexual relationship provided the more pragmatic benefits of children and a family unit. However, Crooks (1938: 294-295) also mentions that in years, there were these attitudes toward homosexual people. People believe that homosexuality is immoral, sinful, and mentally ill.
4. Society’s Concept of Masculinity

The masculinity in this study is actually the same as the masculinity in general. According to Lonner and Malpass (1994: 191-193) in *Psychology and Culture*, socio-cultural background becomes the basic of each society in viewing and also in treating man and woman. Each society views a man and a woman from various or even different perspectives. This is supported by Dubbert (1979). He says that American men have to struggle with a mystique about being male, just as women have to contend with certain assumptions about what it means to be female. In Wyoming 1960s, a man or specifically a cowboy viewed as being strong and masculine. According to Burman (1994: 54), masculine is described as powerful and strong person that has different character from female. Culturally in American cowboy culture, maturity is equated with masculinity, it shows that every masculine character must have the characteristics as a man in general such as being strong and protective, and it differs from female characters which are soft and loveable. Dubbert (1979) adds that the American Republic stands before the world as the supreme expression of masculine force.

It is also supported by Payne, in his book *A Dictionary of Cultural and Critical Theory* (p.336). Payne states that masculinity is defined identifiable sets of behavior, forms of speech, and styles of bodily comportment that serve to keep men dominant in a patriarchal society. In the story, American cowboy is viewed to behave, speak, and act very masculine in order to maintain their social lives in the society. On the other hand, Maccoby (1988: 762) mentions that it is not hard to understand the
concept of male and female in relation to masculinity. These male and female words are related to biological differences. Therefore, the concept of masculinity and feminity are much less closely related to biology. It is supported by the research in nearly 30 countries around the world by Williams and Best in Lonner and Malpass. These two tables below and on the next page show 100 adjectives associated with men and women.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Male Adjectives Associated with Men</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Active</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Adventurous</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Aggressive</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Arrogant</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Autocratic</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bossy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Capable</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Coarse</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conceited</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Confident</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Courageous</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cruel</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cynical</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Determined</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Disorderly</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Enterprising</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Greedy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hard headed</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Humorous</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Indifferent</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Individualistic</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Initiative</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Interest wide</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Inventive</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lazy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Loud</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Obnoxious</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunistic</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pleasure seeking</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Precise</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Progressive</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Quick</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rational</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Realistic</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reckless</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Resourceful</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rigid</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Robust</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Serious</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sharp-witted</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Show off</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Steady</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stern</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stingy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stolid</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tough</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unfriendly</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unscrupulous</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Witty</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Female Adjectives Associated with Women</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Affected</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Affectionate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appreciative</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cautious</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Changeable</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Charming</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Complaining</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Complicated</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Confused</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Curious</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dependent</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dreamy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Emotional</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Excitable</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fault-finding</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fearful</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fickle</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Foolish</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Forgiving</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Frivolous</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fussy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gentle</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Imaginative</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kind</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mild</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Modest</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nervous</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Patient</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pleasant</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Prudish</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Self pitying</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sensitive</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sentimental</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sexy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Soft hearted</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sophisticated</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Submissive</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Suggestible</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Talkative</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Timid</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Touchy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unambitious</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unintelligent</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unstable</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Warm</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Weak</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Worrying</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Understanding</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Superstitious</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The previous tables show adjectives associated to men and women all over the world will be helpful in analyzing which masculine characteristics are being violated in relation to the violation of masculinity myth of American Cowboy in Annie Proulx’s *Brokeback Mountain*. Referring to the tables, according to Wardaugh (1986), society tends to judge a man on what he does whereas a woman on her appearance. This social expectation reflects and effects the way men and women live their lives in the society, and that includes adjusting their sexual orientation for homosexual people. Supported by Nelson (1988: 19), traditionally men have been expected to be physically strong, instrumental, goal-oriented or focusing on achievement, lacking in emotional and interpersonal skill, and having dominant manner in relation with women. Nelson (1988: 19) adds that the society’s expectations might be changed throughout the times but there are still at least two things which have tendency to be resistant to change in most society. First is that work is still seen as the primary criterion of man’s worth and self-esteem, and second is the restriction on men’s emotional expression.

Talking about the homosexual relationship in *Brokeback Mountain* between the two main characters, Jung as quoted in Sanford and Lough (1988) says that one is always in the dark about someone’s own personality, and that one needs others to get to know one-self. Based on the quote I can draw a meaning that without relationship, a man can neither know nor become himself. In heterosexual relationship for example, a man’s relationship with a woman gives him an opportunity to learn about
his feminine side. A relationship not only helps somebody knows himself, but it also helps a man to become himself. Later in the next chapter, this understanding towards a man’s relationship will be challenged by changing the heterosexual relationship into homosexual relationship between a man and another man. A relationship is a man’s emotional anchor. He may put all his energy and time to devotedly reach his life’s goal, but it will all be ineffective and not perfectly achieved unless he has an emotional foundation in relationship.

Sanford and Lough (1988: 1955) say that in American culture, many men seem afraid or are incapable of making close relationship with another man. It happens because of cultural factors that are against close relationship between men. Relationship between men may bring up a fear that the relationship might be involved in homosexual feeling. Supported by Brannon (1995: 155), he mentions that the result of this fear of relationship between men comes up as homophobia. In the story, the society of Wyoming in the 1960s is depicted as a homophobic society. Homophobia becomes the barrier for American men to make an intimate friendship among men. Nelson (1988: 59-60) also supports as he defines homophobia as an extreme and irrational fear of same-sex attraction.

B. Theoretical Framework

In this study, I would analyze the violation of masculinity myth of American cowboy using socio-cultural approach. Related theories are used in analyzing the story to find out the factors which violates the masculinity myth. The theories of
socio-cultural, sociological review of homosexuality, sociological description of American cowboy and the society’s concept of masculinity are used as the base theories in this study. Since this study needs socio-cultural approach, some socio-cultural concepts are needed to help in comprehending the matter sociologically and in solving the problem. The socio-cultural approach is used in this study related to the analysis of sociological pattern of masculinity of American cowboy in Wyoming in 1960s.

To support the analysis some theories are used. The sociological description of American cowboy will be used in order to relate whether the main characters, Ennis del Mar and Jack Twist, really violate the masculinity myth of American cowboy in the society.

The problem in this study will be dealing with the revelation of how the main characters, Ennis del Mar and Jack Twist, violate the masculinity myth of American cowboy. It will be elaborated using sociological review of homosexuality, the sociological description of American cowboy and society’s concept of masculinity.
CHAPTER III
METHODOLOGY

The discussion in this chapter is about the methodology in conducting the study. This chapter consists of three parts. The first part discusses the object of the study containing a brief description of what the work is generally about. The second part presents the approach employed in this study. The third part describes the method used and the steps taken in analyzing the work and answering two questions formulated in the problems formulation in Chapter 1.

A. Object of the Study

This study deals with the novella entitled *Brokeback Mountain*, written by an American female author, Annie Proulx. Edna Annie Proulx, also known as Annie Proulx, was born in Norwich, Connecticut, on August 22, 1935. She received a bachelor’s degree in history from the University of Vermont in 1969 and a master’s degree from Sir George Williams University in Montreal, Canada, in 1973. During her early career, she wrote articles for magazines on many different topics. Her works appeared in publication such as *Country Journal*, *Organic Gardening*, and *Yankee*. In 1992 she came up with her first novel *Postcards* (1992). This novel brought Proulx to be the first woman to receive the PEN/Faulkner Award for fiction. The next year, Proulx continued her success by writing *The Shipping News* (1994). The book resulted in some awards: first, the *Heartland Prize* from *the Chicago Tribune*,

18
followed by the *Irish Times International Award*, and *the National Book Award*. These awards were all topped by the 1994 *Pulitzer Prize* for fiction.

*Brokeback Mountain* is one of Proulx’s works which was first published in *The New Yorker* in 1997 and then republished in extended version along with Proulx’s other stories in *Close Range: Wyoming Stories* published in 1999. *The New Yorker* won the National Magazine Awards for Fiction for its publication of *Brokeback Mountain*. Proulx’s *Brokeback Mountain* was also adapted as an Academy Award, BAFTA, and Golden Globe Award-winning major motion pictures released in 2005. At that time, the short story and the screenplay were published together in book form. *Brokeback Mountain* consists of 55 pages. It was published in form of a book by Simon & Schuster Inc, U.S.A., in 2005. *Brokeback Mountain* is a work of cultural fiction that tells about two gay cowboys who lived in the middle of American cowboy and masculinity myth. The setting of the story is in Wyoming, United States, in 1963.

**B. Approach of the Study**

To analyze the story, I employ a socio-cultural approach as the appropriate approach to deal with the relation between two gay American cowboys who fall in love with each other and their society that strongly believe in masculinity myth. I believe that in order to be able to analyze the violation of masculinity myth of American cowboy, that is related to the sociological pattern of American cowboy and its masculinity myth, socio-cultural approach would be appropriate. According to Kennedy and Gioia (1998), sociological criticism examines the literary work in the
cultural, economic, and political context. It also explores the relationship between the characters and the society.

Sociology specifically explores on why and how a condition happens in a society. Kemmeyer, Ritzer, Yetmon (1994) classify sociology in to at least fifty specializations. One of them is the sociology of culture. The sociology of culture is based on the interrelationship within the complex unity (Raymond, 1977). It means that one phenomenon will influence the other phenomena when they live in a society which consists of people coming from different races, religion, cultures, and sexual orientations. The classification of sociology of culture tells us the usefulness of sociology in socio-culture studies.

C. Method of the Study

In completing the analysis, the method conducted in doing the study was library research. It means that the data was gathered by reading literature and taking important notes. The primary and secondary sources were used to analyze the study. The primary source was Annie Proulx’s *Brokeback Mountain*. The secondary source was derived from some other sources such as books, articles found through the internet and encyclopedias which dealt with the topic discussed supported the idea of this study.

Moreover, there were some steps taken in analyzing the study. Firstly, the novelette was bought through an online shopping. Then I read the story several times in order to understand what it was generally and specifically about. After that, I took some important notes from the story about American cowboy, masculinity myth and
homosexual relationship. The steps were needed in order to help me get the related idea and information in the novel so that I can describe it clearly and thoroughly. It also helped me in understanding the relation between American cowboy and masculinity myth, and how the main characters violate the masculinity myth of American cowboy. Secondly, by taking some supporting notes and references, I made a critical analysis. Thirdly, I analyzed the socio-cultural phenomena in the story which are the masculinity myth of American cowboy and the main characters’ homosexual relationship. Then I tried to relate the socio-cultural aspects of how the main characters, Ennis del Mar and Jack Twist, violate the masculinity myth of American cowboy. Finally, I drew some conclusions from the study based on the result of the analysis and give some implication and suggestions for the benefit of further researchers and educators.
CHAPTER IV

ANALYSIS

This chapter aims to answer the problem of this study in order to find out how the main characters, Ennis del Mar and Jack Twist, violate masculinity myth of American cowboy in Annie Proulx’s *Brokeback Mountain*. The analysis of the study reveals that the two main characters, Ennis del Mar and Jack Twist, violate masculinity myth by showing the characteristics of fear, fragility, and their homosexual relationship. These violations will be revealed, analyzed, and discussed using socio-cultural approach, sociological review on homosexuality, sociological description of American cowboy, and the society’s concept of masculinity.

The Violation of Masculinity Myth of American Cowboy

1. Fear

The first finding reveals that the main characters violate the masculinity myth of American cowboy by showing their fear. It is viewed by the society of Wyoming 1960s that having fear is not manly. The fear shows that one of the traditional masculinities, boldness, is violated. Sanford and Lough (1988: 1955) mention that in American culture, many men seem afraid or are incapable of making close relationship with another man. It happens because of cultural factors which are against close relationship between men. As Kimmel (1994) mentions that men are afraid to let other men see their fear. Fear makes men ashamed because the
recognition of fear in men is a proof that they are not as manly as the society’s perception. Men’s fear is the fear of humiliation, and that what makes men ashamed to be afraid. According to Lonner and Malpass (1994), being fearful is shown in their table as the adjective that possesses a feminine quality. In *Brokeback Mountain*, The main character, Ennis del Mar is a man of fear. He is afraid of his own voice, afraid of revealing any internal part of himself.

“I doubt there’s nothing now we can do, said Ennis. “What I’m sayin, Jack, I built a life up in them years. Love my little girls. Alma? It ain’t her fault. You got your baby and wife, that place in Texas. You and me can’t hardly be decent together if what happened back there”—he jerked his head in the direction of the apartment—“grabs on us like that. We do that in the wrong place we’ll be dead. There’s no reins on this one. It scares the piss out of me.” (p.27)

It can be seen that Ennis del Mar has fear which makes him violate the masculine character of men. In relation to that, Kimmel (1994) mentions that men are refused to show their fear to other men. From the quotes above it is seen that Ennis’ fear of Jack’s idea to live together in a small ranch. Ennis’ fear of admitting and embracing his inner truth might be the result of his early childhood experience from his older brother and father.

“I come up under my brother K.E., three years older’n me, slugged me silly everyday. Dad got tired a me come bawlin in the house and when I was about six he set me down and says, Ennis, you got a problem and you got a fix it or it’s gonna be with you until you’re ninety and K.E.’s ninety-three. Well, I says, he’s bigger’n me. Dad says, you got a take him unawares, don’t say nothing to him, make him feel some pain, get out fast and keep doin it until he takes the message. Nothin like hurtin somebody to make him hear good.” (p.28)
According to Wardaugh (1986), the social expectation reflects the way men live their lives in the society. This might be the cause of the fear in Ennis’ personality. He is forced to conceal the real him; therefore, he can fit in the society. Rather than runs off with Jack and builds a life together as Jack keeps suggesting, Ennis considers the reality of it. He is afraid of the violent opposition in the society that would oppose two gay cowboys if they live together. He is also afraid of the fact that he has a hard life including financial hardship and family support he needs to bear. Without the financial source to depend on, without any sort of family support for his sexual preference, and with his belief that everybody must bear what they cannot fix, Ennis has become the prisoner of his life. Like what he says in Brokeback Mountain (p.30), “But if you can’t fix it, you got a stand it.” His father himself is the one who forces Ennis to have man quality for being masculine and not afraid of anything. Ennis’ childhood experience can also be seen from the following quotation:

“… Jack, I don’t want a be dead. There was these two old guys ranched together down home, Earl and Rich—Dad would pass a remark when he seen them. They was a joke even though they was pretty tough old birds. I was what, nine year old and they found Earl dead in a irrigation ditch. They’d took a tire iron to him, spurred him up, drug him around by his dick until it pulled off, just bloddy pulp. What the tire iron done looked like pieces a burned tomatoes all over him, nose tore down from skiddin gravel.” (p.29-30)

The previous quotation tells the scene where Ennis del Mar describes his childhood experience with his homophobic father. His father brings Ennis and his brother to see the corpse of a gay man who was murdered in irrigation ditch in result of gay bashing actions.
“Dad made sure I seen it. Took me to see it. Me and K.E. Dad laughed about it. Hell, for all I know he done the job. If he was alive and was to put his head in that door right know you bet he’d go get his tire iron. Two guys living together? No. All I can see is we get together once in a while way the hell out in the back a nowhere—” (p.29-30)

From the quotation shows that this homosexuality issue even scares Ennis and made him a man of fear. Jack Twist’s idea of them living together in a ranch freaks Ennis out because it reminds him of his early childhood memory with his violent father. Ennis’ fear gives a hint that there is a violation of masculinity. Kimmel (1994) mentions that the fear being seen as coward dominates the definition of manhood.

While Ennis del Mar reacts fearfully to the idea of two men moving out and living together. His lover, Jack Twist, shows the opposite masculine side.

“You won’t catch me again,” said Jack. “Listen. I’m thinking, tell you what, if you and me had a little ranch together, little cow, and calf operation, your horses, it’d be some sweet life. Like I said, I’m gettin out a rodeo. I ain’t broke-dick rider but I don’t got the bucks a ride oy’ut this slump I’m in and I don’t got the bones a keep getting wrecked. I got it figured, got this plan, Ennis, how we can do it, you and me. Lureen’soldman, you bet he’d give me a bunch if I’d get lost. Already more or less said it— (p.28)

Jack has less fear than Ennis related to their attraction to each other because Jack feel less force from the society and the people in the family in order to fit in.

“How much is once in a while?” said Jack. “Once in a while ever four fuckin years?

What Jack twist says to Ennis is somehow shows the sense of liberation.

“It don’t happen in Wyomin and if it does I don’t know what they do, may be go to Denver,” said Jack, sitting up, turning away from him, “and I don’t give a flyin fuck. Son of a bitch, Ennis, take a couple days off.Right now. Get us out a here. Throw your stuff in the back a my truck and let’s get up and tell her you’re goin. Come on, Ennis, you just shot my airplane out a the sky—
give me something a go on. This ain’t no little thing that’s happening here.”
(p.30)

The previous quotation shows that Jack Twist is more liberated and bold in embracing the feeling between them. He comes up with the idea of them living together in a ranch and run a business. He is depicted to be more visionary, bold, and has faith in their future. It can also be concluded that the marriage Jack has been living in is not a perfect marriage as he mentions that his father in law would give him money if he divorces his wife. From the quotation it can be concluded that Jack Twist as a rodeo bull rider, engaged in a very dangerous sport with high risk of injury. It means that Jack possesses more masculine side than Ennis.

This analysis shows how one of the traditional masculinities, boldness, is violated. The analysis of the first violation of the masculinity myth shows that in Ennis del Mar there is a man in fear because he was raised by a rough mannered father, while within Jack there is a man in liberation but unhappy with his marriage.

2. Fragility

Fragility violates the masculinity myth of American cowboy for being manly, strong, durable, and unbreakable. Dubbert (1979) mentions that American men have to struggle with a stereotype of being male. It is in the same way as women have to contend with certain assumptions about what it means to be female. It is not always easy for men to articulate their feeling. The story of Brokeback Mountain is set in Wyoming, America, in 1960s where cowboy as culture puts men on top of the masculinity hierarchy. In Wyoming 1960s, a man or specifically a cowboy is viewed
to be strong and masculine. Violence is often considered as the most evident marker of manhood. However, violence can also be a sign of fragility within a man. Kimmel (1994) mentions that being violence is men’s defense mechanism when they feel fragile and threatened. The second violation of masculinity myth of American cowboy in *Brokeback Mountain* is fragility. Fragility has been considered as the sign of sensitivity within, and being sensitive is considered inappropriate for cowboys.

People constantly construct the word masculine with some adjectives like strong, durable, and unbreakable. It is supported by Dubbert (1979) that many contemporary males suffer from a distorted view of themselves in terms of what they think society has always expected of them as American men. It means that fragility and sensitivity is definitely violating the masculinity construction. Masculinity construction expects men to be strong, durable, and unbreakable. In other words, a fragile man is described to be not masculine. Ennis said, “I’m not no queer,” and Jack jumped in with “Me neither. A one-shot thing. Nobody’s business but ours.” (p.15)

The quotation shows the denial of their attraction to each other. It is quoted from the conversation which takes place after Ennis del Mar and Jack Twist’s intimate intercourse. Kimmel (1994) in his journal mentions that denying is a self defense mechanism in a man’s mind to protect their weakness from being exposed and judged. In relation to the topic, what Ennis and Jack are denying about is something that they consider as a weakness. From the quotation it can be seen that both Ennis and Jack denies their attraction to each other. What Ennis did after their
intimate intercourse is a statement to clarify or in this case to deny that he is not a homosexual. While at the same time Jack reacts directly that he is also not a homosexual. It means that both, Ennis and Jack are sensitive against their homosexual attraction towards each other. “...Nobody’s business but ours.” (p.15)

Another proof that they consider their attraction to each other as sensitive topic to debate about is shown on the next line spoken by Jack. Jack says that their attraction towards each other is something sensitive that they need to keep away from everyone. The verbal silence that accompanies their intimate intercourse represents their relationship which is very fragile. Whenever Jack and Ennis speak up their doubts, hopes, and fears, their conversation will end up in an argument, not a solution. Their few words which are spoken between Jack and Ennis in the quotation (p.15) are desperate denials of the truth that they are too fragile against the homophobic society.

Masculinity is equated with power over everything including the power over themselves. Being emotional could also be the sign of fragility within a man.

The next week Joe Aguirre sent word to bring them down—another, bigger storm was moving in from the Pacific—and they packed in the game and moved off the mountain with the sheep. The mountain boiled with demonic energy, glazed with flickering broken-cloud light, the wind combed the grass and drew from the damaged krummholz and slit rock a bestial drone. As they descended the slope Ennis felt he was in a slow-motion, but headlong, irreversible fall. (p.17)

This quotation shows Ennis loses his control over himself related to their separation. Kimmel (1994) mentions that being emotionally losing control over
himself is described as something which is not masculine. Masculinity construction forces men to hide their feelings, and that includes being fragile, being sensitive and being emotional.

“Right,” said Jack, and they shook hands, hit each other on the shoulder, then there was forty feet of distance between them and nothing to do but drive away in opposite directions. Within a mile Ennis felt like someone was pulling his guts out hand over hand a yard at a time. He stopped at the side of the road and, in the whirling new snow, tried to puke but nothing came up. He felt about as bad as he ever had and it took a long time for the feeling to wear off. (p.18)

Dubbert (1979) in his book, *A Man’s Place; Masculinity in Transition* mentions that stereotypically men avoid doing something that could have signaled sentimentality and emotion, because both are symptoms of weakness that men should avoid. It is seen clearly from the previous quotation that Ennis feels sentimentality over their separation. It shows according to Dubbert (1979), Ennis del Mar violates masculinity myth of men. It is supported by the following quotes which expresses the emotion Ennis del Mar has long enough suffered from.

“That summer,” said Ennis. “When we split up after we got paid out I had gut cramps so bad I pulled over ad tried to puke, thought I ate something bad at that place in Dubois. Took me about a year a figure out it was that I shouldn’t a late you out a my sights. Too late then by long, long while.” (p.26)

Ennis del Mar expresses his emotional feeling by telling Jack that he gets sick when they both separate. He does not know the cause of the sick until after about one year when they meet each other again then Ennis can finally understand the cause of his sickness is his loving emotion to Jack.
When it came (a postcard Ennis ordered with the picture of Brokeback Mountain on it)—thirty cents—he pined it up in his trailer, brass-headed tack in each corner. Below it he drove a nail and on the nail he hung the wire hanger and the two old shirts suspended from it. He stepped back and looked at the ensemble through a few stinging tears. (p.54)

The previous and the next quotation show another fragility of Ennis del Mar. The fragility is marked by the presence of his tears for Jack.

Around that time Jack began to appear in his dreams, Jack as he had first seen him,… and he would wake sometimes in grief, sometimes with the old sense of joy and release; the pillow sometimes wet, sometimes the sheets. (p.55)

As it is mentioned in the previous page that according to Dubbert (1979), in masculinity myth, men avoid to give a signal of sentimentality because it is a symptom of weakness. On other hand, the other main character, Jack Twist also expresses his fragility.

“….count the damn few times we been together in twenty years. Measure the fuckin short leash you keep me on, then ask me about Mexico and then tell me you’ll kill me for needin it and not hardly never getting it. You got no fuckin idea how bad it gets. I’m not you. I can’t make it on a couple a high-altitude fucks once or twice a year. You’re too much for me, Ennis, you son of a whoreson bitch. I whish I knew how to quit you.” (p.42)

Jack expresses his fragility by telling Ennis that when they hardly meet each other he cannot conceal the fact that he misses Ennis. Jack tells Ennis how fragile he was without Ennis and that no matter how hard Jack tries he will never be able to quit Ennis.

The closet was a shallow cavity. At the north end of the closet a tiny jog in the wall made a slight hiding place and here, stiff with long suspension from a nail, hung a shirt. He lifted it off the nail. Jack’s old shirt from Brokeback
days. The dried blood on the sleeve was his own blood, a gushing nosebleed on the last afternoon on the mountain when Jack, in their contortionistic grappling and wrestling, had slammed Ennis’s nose hard with his knee. He had staunched the blood which was everywhere, all over both of them, with his shirtsleeve, … (p.50)

The way Jack Twist treats Ennis’ shirt from Brokeback Mountain shows the vulnerability and fragility within Jack. He keeps Ennis’ shirt which is stained with blood from their fight in Brokeback Mountain, keeps Ennis’ shirt inside his own shirt and hang it on the closet.

…, but the staunching hadn’t held because Ennis had suddenly swung from the deck and laid the ministering angel out in the wild columbine, wings folded. The shirt seemed heavy until he saw there was another shirt inside it, the sleeves carefully worked down inside Jack’s sleeves. It was his own plaid shirt, lost, he’d thought, long ago in some damn laundry, his dirty shirt, the pocket ripped, button missing, stolen by jack and hidden here inside Jack’s own shirt, the pair like two skins, one inside the other, two in one. (p.50)

The previous quote actually explicitly shows the personality of Jack which are emotional and sentimental. It shows how Jack always misses Ennis, and how Jack keeps Ennis’ shirt with the stain of his blood unwashed since their last fight. In relation to the violation of masculinity myth, Nelson (1988) mentions that traditionally men have been expected to be physically strong and lacking in emotional skill. Nelson adds that although the society’s expectation can sometimes changes throughout the times but there would be one thing which has tendency to be resistant to change in most societies. It is the restriction on men’s emotional expression. Therefore, it shows that fragility which includes being sensitive and emotional is violating the masculinity myth of American cowboy.
3. Homosexuality

One of the reasons which make Annie Proulx’s Brokeback Mountain a very interesting literary work to study is because of its different genre from the mainstream literary works. Proulx takes the sad, melancholy theme in *Brokeback Mountain* and explores the American West in the early 60s to show how two lovers are bound by their expected roles, how they rebel against them, and the consequences for each of doing that. However, the romance in *Brokeback Mountain* is between two men. Ennis del Mar and Jack Twist are two ranchers cowboy looking for work in Wyoming when they meet and embark on a summer sheepherding job in Brokeback Mountain.

In 1963 when he met Jack Twist, Ennis was engaged to Alma Beers. Both Jack and Ennis claimed to be saving money for a small spread; Ennis’ case that meant a tobacco can with two five dollar bills inside. That Spring, hungry for any Job, each had signed up with Farm and Ranch Employment—they came together on paper as herder and camp tender for the same sheep operation north of Signal. It would be Jack Twist’s second summer on the mountain, Ennis’ first. Neither of them was twenty. (p.5)

The silent and uncommunicative Ennis, finding himself opening up around the expressive Jack. The two of them form a bond which surprisingly catches the fire one cold night in the wilderness. Separating at the end of the summer, each goes on to marry and have children. However, in a reunion years later proves that their attraction has grown into passion for each other significantly. While Jack Twist dreams of a life together with Ennis, the silent Ennis is unable to bring himself considering something revolutionary as two men living together and build a life.
Its open, unforced depiction of love between two men made *Brokeback Mountain* a ground-breaker in literary works. However, the controversy sparks in relation to *Brokeback Mountain*. Relationship between men may bring up a fear that the relationship involved in homosexual affair. According to Brannon (1995), the result of this fear of relationship between men comes up as homophobia. Nelson (1988: 59-60) also supported as he defines homophobia as an extreme and irrational fear of same-sex attraction. Proulx in an interview with *the Advocate* magazine mentions that the only people who would have problems with the homosexual relationship between Ennis and Jack are people who are very insecure about themselves and their own sexuality and who would be putting up a defense, and that is usually young men who have not figured things out yet.

The attraction between Ennis del Mar and Jack Twist begins accidentally when both cowboys are on Brokeback Mountain shepherding.

During the day Ennis looked across a great gulf and sometimes saw Jack, a small dot moving across a high meadow as an insect moves across a tablecloth; Jack, in his dark camp, saw Ennis as night fire, a red spark on the huge black mass of mountain. (p.9)

Ennis begins to notice the presence of his attraction to Jack in the middle of the wilderness, but he cannot help the fact that they are living in a society which views homosexuality as abnormality of masculinity myth. For Ennis, the cause of his struggle stemmed from seeing the consequences of public homosexuality among fellow cowboys, one of whom was brutally murdered due to his sexual orientation.
As it is stated earlier in chapter two of this study, Le Vay and Heinrich (1994) mention that homosexuality is the existence of sexual attraction, interest, and genitally intimate activity between an individual and other members of the same gender. The previous quotes on page nine (p.9) of Brokeback Mountain shows that Ennis del Mar begins the spark of attraction to Jack Twist while they are sheep-herding in Brokeback Mountain.

Ennis ran full-throttle on all roads whether fence mending or money spending, and he wanted none of it when Jack seized his left hand and brought it into his erect cock. Ennis jerked his hand away as though he’d touch fire, got to his knees, unbuckled his belt, shoved his pants down, hauled Jack onto all fours and, with the help of the clear slick and a little spit, entered him, nothing he’d done before but no instruction manual needed. They went at it in silence except for a few sharp intakes of breath and Jack’s choked “gun’s goin off,” then out, down, and asleep. (p.14)

From the quotes (p.14) it can be seen than both, Ennis and Jack first have their sexual intercourse when they are sheep-herding in Brokeback Mountain. In one freezing and in a tent, Jack is the first person who initiates the sexual act. In relation to the sexual intercourse of the people in the same gender, Crooks (1983) mentions that a homosexual person is an individual whose primary erotic, psychological, emotional and social interest in sin the member of the same sex, even though that interest might not be overtly expressed.

Late in the afternoon, thunder growling, the same old green pickup rolled in and he saw Jack get out of the truck, beat up Resistol tilted back. A hot jolt scalded Ennis and he was out on the landing pulling the door closed behind him. Jack took the stairs two and two. They seized each other by the shoulders, hugged mightily, squeezing the breath out of each other, saying, son of a bitch, son of a bitch, then, and easily as the right key turns the lock tumblers, their mouths came together, and hard, … (p21)
The quotation shows the expression of Ennis and Jack’s homosexual relationship. They show their affection by kissing and hugging each other passionately which makes them unaware of Alma witnessing behind the door. The following quotation also shows that Ennis really loves Jack by calling him ‘little darling’ which he only uses to call his loved ones.

…, Jack’s big teeth bringing blood, his hat falling to the floor, stubble rasping, wet saliva welling, and the door opening and Alma looking out for a few seconds at Ennis’ straining shoulders and shutting the door again and still they clinched, pressing chest and groin and thigh and leg together, treading on each other’s toes until they pulled apart to breathe and Ennis, not big on endearments, said what he said to his horses and daughters, little darling. (p.21)

What the quotation shows is the expression of their homosexual feeling towards each other which is manifested into an extreme physical interaction in a form of a passionate kiss. In men’s masculinity and manhood, physical affection action between two men is certainly restricted.

Homosexuality is usually assumed with the erotic expression of one person to another person with the same gender and society views homosexuality as inappropriate, against masculinity of the manhood, and sinful.

As it did go. They never talked about the sex, let it happen, at first only in the tent at night, then in the full daylight with the hot sun striking down, and at evening in the fire glow, quick, rough, laughing and snorting, no lack of noises, but saying not a goddamn word except once Ennis said, “I’m not no queer,” and Jack jumped in with “Me neither. A one-shot thing. Nobody’s business but ours.” (p.15)

It can be seen from the quotation in (p.15) that the erotic expression mentioned earlier in the paragraph above is represented with the presence of sexual intercourse which
happens over and over again at different times. The spotlight is on the line when Ennis says that he is not a queer then followed by Jack says nobody should ever known their affair. This conversation represents the effect of society’s perception on homosexuality which is sinful and against the masculinity. Therefore as the result they both deny their attraction to each other as homosexual affair. It reminds of what Dubbert (1979) mentions that many contemporary males suffer from a distorted view of themselves in terms of what they think society has always expected of them as American men. The society of Wyoming 1960s always sees American cowboy as the symbol of masculinity and manhood who will always be heterosexual. While these American cowboys, Ennis del Mar and Jack Twist break the boundaries of becoming a masculine American cowboy.

Homosexuality is a bend in the men’s masculinity journey. Kimmel (1994) mentioned that masculinity is against homosexuality. It means that a homosexual man will automatically violate the masculinity myth. The following quotation of Brokeback Mountain proves that masculinity is against homosexuality which makes masculinity homophobic.

“There was these two old guys ranched together down home, Earl and Rich—Dad would pass a remark when he seen them. They was a joke even though they was pretty tough old birds. I was what, nine years old and they found Earl dead in a irrigation ditch. They’d took a tire iron to him, spurred him up, drug him around by his dick until it pulled off, just bloody pulp. What the tire iron done looked like pieces a burned tomatoes all over him, nose tore down from skiddin on gravel. Dad made sure I seen it. Took me to see it. Dad laughed about it.” (p.29)
It can be seen from the quotation that Ennis’ father is a homophobic person. It is explicitly stated when Ennis says that his father laughs about it, and makes jokes of it. According to Kimmel (1994), homophobia, men’s fear of other men, is the animating condition of the dominant definition of masculinity in America, that the reigning definition of masculinity is a defensive effort to prevent being emasculated. In the efforts to suppress or overcome those fears, the dominant culture exacts a tremendous price from those deemed less than fully manly, for example homosexual man. What Ennis’ father does is certainly a homophobic action.

The study puts homosexuality as a violation of masculinity because a man who is homosexual will be considered not manly, not masculine or feminine. Homosexuality is not a quality which the society expects in the masculinity myth. This is a phenomenon of masculinity myth which is challenged by homosexuality. As Bukharin (1969) mentions that as a matter of fact, social phenomena are created by persons. Society consists of persons who think, cogitate, feel, pursue, purpose, and act. Society does not express the will of individual person, but frequently are a different contradiction of this will; they prevail over it by force, with the result that the individual often feels the pressure of social forces on his actions.

The way the society of Wyoming 1960s views homosexuality in Brokeback Mountain can be seen through the exploration of the character, Alma Beers, Ennis’ long-suffering wife. For years, Alma tolerates Ennis’ lack of affection, and his poor jobs. Alma accidentally witnesses the homosexual action between Ennis and Jack. Although she sees Jack and Ennis kissing, she never says a word about it until
they are divorced. She finally confronts Ennis about Jack during a Thanksgiving dinner, which leaves Ennis to storm out.

“You know,” she said, and from her tone he knew something was coming, “I used to wonder how come you never brought any trouts home. Always said you caught plenty. “That don’t mean nothin.” “Don’t lie, don’t try to fool me, Ennis. I know what it means. Jack Twist? Jack Nasty. You and him—” She’d overstepped his line. He seized her wrist; tears sprang and rolled, a dish clattered. “Shut up,” he said. “Mind your own business. You don’t know nothin about it.” “I’m goin a yell for Bill.” “You fuckin go right ahead. Go on and fuckinyell. I’ll make him eat the fuckin floor and you too.” (p.33)

The reaction of Alma Beers can be viewed as the representation of the Wyoming society in 1960s. From the previous quotation (p.21), Alma is shocked witnessing homosexual act by her husband and Jack. Alma is the representative of a conservative and common people in Wyoming 1960s society. She definitely stands to oppose the homosexuality between Ennis and Jack, she even makes it clear by saying ‘Jack Nasty.’ She is disgusted with Ennis and Jack, two men who kiss each other passionately. Alma’s reaction is one of the signs that homosexuality is not accepted during the 1960s in Wyoming. It is not accepted because homosexuality shows a peculiarity of the masculinity myth of American cowboy.

Homosexuality violates the characteristic of an American cowboy of being heterosexual. In relation to the society of Wyoming in 1960s, Coleman (1972) mentions that homosexual people are not free from problems. Homosexual people have to make adequate occupational, sexual, and general social adjustments in the
face of the society’s severe disapproval and prejudice. Many homosexual people live
in continual fear of detection, loss of employment, and social disgrace even though
they feel they have equal rights as heterosexual people in the matter of their sexual
adjustment, and the rest of them feel that their sexual desire is wrong. Therefore, it
leads them into a constant conflict within themselves. They tend to be continually in
war with himself and to feel insecure. In relation to how the society of Wyoming
1960s viewing homosexuality, Crooks (1938) also mentions that in years, there were
these attitudes toward homosexual people. The society believes that homosexuality is
immoral.

Masculinity is equated with power. Masculinity is described as the drive for
domination, the drive for power, and the drive for conquest. Society has constructed
the rules of masculinity. As a result of these rules of masculinity, the society manages
to disempower the overwhelming majority of American men by discrimination based
on race, class, ethnicity, age, and sexual orientation.
CHAPTER V

CONCLUSIONS AND SUGGESTIONS

This chapter is divided into two parts. The first part is the conclusion which deals with the summary of the analysis in chapter four. The second part is the suggestions of the study for future researchers and teachers.

A. Conclusions

There are several conclusions which can be drawn from the analysis in chapter four. The analysis was conducted based on the problem which attempts to reveal how the main characters, Ennis del Mar and Jack Twist, violate the masculinity myth of American cowboy as it is reflected in Annie Proulx’s *Brokeback Mountain*. The conclusions reveal that there are three major violations of masculinity myth of American cowboy in Annie Proulx’s *Brokeback Mountain* done by the main characters. The violations are the fear, fragility, and homosexuality.

In American culture, many men seem afraid or are incapable of making close relationship with another man, including the society of American cowboy in Wyoming 1960s. Men are afraid to let other men to see their fear. Fear makes men ashamed because the recognition of fear in men is proof that they are not as manly as the society’s perception. In *Brokeback Mountain*, The main character, Ennis del Mar is a man of fear. He is afraid of his own voice, afraid of revealing any internal part of himself. Ennis’ fear of admitting and embracing his inner truth might be the result of his early childhood experience from his older brother and father. Due to make him fit
in the society, Ennis del Mar conceals and hides his fear and puts a fake persona to appear tough, rough, and manly. Jack’s idea of them living together and build a ranch freaked Ennis out because it reminds him of his early childhood memory with his violent father and the corpse of a gay ranch man in the irrigation ditch as the result of gay murder. It shows how one of the traditional masculinities, boldness, is being violated.

The second violation of masculinity myth of American cowboy is fragility. American men have been struggling with a mystique about being male. The story of Brokeback Mountain was set in Wyoming, America in 1960s where cowboy as culture puts men on top of the society hierarchy. It means that men should all have the quality of being manly; strong, durable and unbreakable. Being fragile, which includes emotional and sensitive is considered not manly and if a man possesses one of these qualities, they are violating their manhood of masculinity. Ennis and Jack express their fragility, emotions, and sensitivity after their separations. Ennis is even seen in tears. Tear signals the sentimentality of a fragile person. In masculinity myth, men are expected to be physically strong and lacking in emotions. Therefore the fragility that appears in both Ennis del Mar and Jack Twist violates the second masculinity myth in this study; being strong, durable, and unbreakable.

The last violation of masculinity in this study is homosexuality. Masculinity is against homosexuality, which means that a homosexual man will automatically violate the masculinity myth. In Brokeback Mountain the two American cowboy, Ennis del Mar and Jack Twist is described as having homosexual relationship. The
society of Wyoming 1960s always sees American cowboy as the symbol of masculinity and manhood who will always be heterosexual. While these American cowboys, Ennis del Mar and Jack Twist break the boundaries of becoming a masculine American cowboy. Relationship between men may bring up a fear that the relationship involved in homosexual affair. The result of this fear of relationship between men comes up as homophobia. Homophobia is as an extreme and irrational fear of same-sex attraction.

From the conclusion in chapter four of this study, the readers are achieving the facts that the violations of masculinity myth done by the main characters lead into sexual orientation based discrimination. The readers are convinced that there is no benefit that can be taken from any type of discriminations. Any kind of discrimination existing in this world gives nothing but misery for the rest of human race. Discrimination leaves people divided into some certain group that makes them hate each other. Thus, I personally hope that the readers could get the fundamental meaning of Brokeback Mountain, that love conquers all. There is no skin color, race, religion or sexual orientation that makes one person better than anyone else.

B. Suggestions

The suggestion of this study will be divided into two parts. The first suggestion is intended for future researchers, and the second suggestion is intended for the English teachers who want to use this literary works in their learning process.
1. **Suggestion for future researchers**

*Brokeback Mountain* is one of the ground-breaking literary works. This is a rich literary work to study. The major conflict of the story which is controversial and bold provides limitless aspects that can be analyzed, researched, and learnt. Thus, I highly recommend the novella to be the primary source for those future researchers who are interested in analyzing literary works.

I suggest the future researches to dig more on the depiction of the symbols which can be drawn from this *Brokeback Mountain* book. I suggest the future researchers to carefully analyze the metaphoric meaning behind these symbols which can be seen from the story. In order to analyze the symbols, the future researchers might want to consider reading the biography of the author because the environment of the story takes role in creating the metaphor of Brokeback Mountain. Hopefully, by analyzing the symbols and metaphors, the future researchers can reveal why and how Jack Twist died. Then the result of the study will be useful to reach a broader range of readers.

2. **Suggestion for teachers**

The study reveals the violation of masculinity through the presence of homosexual relationship among the American cowboy. In relation to homosexuality, there is a phenomenon called sexual orientation discrimination. The discrimination toward people with different sexual orientation comes in many ways including name calling, bullying, verbal abuse, terror, physical abuse and even murder. This
Brokeback Mountain reveals how two men with same sex, love each other but they must hide it to avoid discrimination. This story also shows how cruel the gay bashing activities were back in 1960s as the result of sexual orientation discrimination.

In relation to education world, Brokeback Mountain can be one of those ways that teacher can do in order to fight against sexual orientation discrimination in school. Teacher has responsibility to plant the seeds of tolerance in students to make the world a better place to live for all and equal. Brokeback Mountain can be the inspiration that will reach the society’s mind and heart and telling them that no matter what, love conquers all. This Brokeback Mountain can help the students to understand that there is no skin color, races, religions, nations, and sexual orientation that make them better than anyone else. The teachers can teach the students that human beings are all living and sharing this world equally. I have included a reflection in the appendix for teachers to enable the teachers reflecting on the ways to fight against sexual orientation discrimination in school.
REFERENCES


APPENDIX A

THE SUMMARY OF BROKEBACK MOUNTAIN

Brokeback Mountain first begins with the narration of the present times of Ennis del Mar, one of the main characters of Brokeback Mountain. Ennis is seen has grown old waking up in his trailer. He has woken up from a dream where Jack Twist appeared smiling at him with the sense of joy and sadness.

Then the story goes back to the spring 1963, when Ennis and Jack first meet at Wyoming. Both Ennis and Jack are teenagers with no adequate education, rough spoken and poor. Both are school dropout. When they meet, Ennis del Mar is engaged to Alma Beer. Hired by Joe Aguirre as sheep-herder in Brokeback Mountain, they become friends in the solitude of Brokeback Mountain. Jack was more experienced than Ennis because he has become a sheep-herder for several times while Ennis is a new hand. They talk together, drink whiskey, and become friends.

One cold night, after much talking and drinking, Ennis decides to remain in base camp rather than trek back to the herd. It’s freezing and Jack tells him to join him in his sleeping roll inside the warm tent. In the tent, Jack reaches for Ennis’s hand and pulls it to his groin. It is the first time Ennis has been with a man. The sex happens many times after that, but they deny their homosexuality. Their denial has something to do with the current society perception of the masculinity of American cowboy. The society of Wyoming 1960s is depicted as homophobic society and known for its violence behavior towards gay people at that time.
During a surprise visit to the campsite, Joe Aguirre sees the men together through his binoculars. In late August, Aguirre calls the men and sheep down from the mountain and frowns as he pays Jack and Ennis, knowing that some of the sheep aren’t his. The two men say goodbye, each. Ennis and Jack have fight the day before they say goodbye which leave them bleeding and their shirts are covered in blood. When they are separating, once Jack is out of sight, Ennis has to pull over because he is sick with grief.

Both Ennis and Jack have to move on. Ennis marries Alma and has two girls, getting work to support his family. Four years pass. Jack sends Ennis a postcard saying he is coming to town, and Ennis replies with his address. When Jack arrives, Ennis runs to greet him. Alma steps outside and sees them kissing in front of their apartment, then quickly goes back inside. Jack and Ennis tell each other about the children they have. Jack has married to a Texas girl named Lureen. The next day, they reminisce about their time on Brokeback and talk about their feelings. Jack suggests they set up a ranch together. But Ennis tells Jack about the time his father took him, as a child, to see the mutilated body of a gay rancher. He says they just have to endure this separation.

Not long after Jack and Ennis’ meeting, Alma and Ennis get divorce. The Ennis and Jack continue to see each other occasionally, but they never return to Brokeback. Months later, a postcard Ennis has mailed to Jack is returned to him, stamped “DECEASED.” Ennis calls Lureen, and she says that Jack had an accident: he was changing a tire when it blew up, sending the rim into his face. Ennis thinks it was no accident and that men killed him with the tire iron. Lureen says Jack wanted to have his ashes interred in a place called Brokeback Mountain, but she didn’t know where it was, so she buried half the ashes and gave the rest to his parents. Ennis decides to visit Jack’s family in Lightning Flat, Wyoming.

In Lightning Flat, Wyoming, where Jack spends most of his childhood, Ennis meets Jack’s mother and his disapproving father in their tiny, depressing ranch house. Jack’s mother invites Ennis to see Jack’s room. In the closet Ennis discovers an old shirt of Jack’s, stained with Ennis’s blood, layered over a shirt of Ennis’s, from their Brokeback days. Jack’s father says he’s putting his son’s ashes in the family plot. Around that time, Jack begins to appear in his dream.
APPENDIX B

THE BIOGRAPHY OF ANNIE PROULX

Annie Proulx is the acclaimed author of The Shipping News and three other novels, That Old Ace in the Hole, Postcards, and Accordion Crimes, and the story collections Heart Songs, Close Range (which includes Brokeback Mountain), and bad dirt. Winner of the Pulitzer Prize, a National Book Award, the Irish Times International Fiction Prize, two O. Henry Prizes, and a PEN/Faulkner, she lives in Wyoming and Newfoundland.

Edna Annie Proulx was born on August 22, 1935, in Norwich, Connecticut, the first of George Napoleon Proulx and Lois Nelly Gill Proulx’s five children. Proulx’s father was the vice president of a textile company. His family had come to the United States from Quebec, Canada. The family often moves to different places in New England and North Carolina because of her father’s job. Her mother, a painter, encouraged her to notice everything around her. She was taught to observe the activities of ants and to notice every detail, the feeling of fabrics, and the unique facts of people’s faces.

Proulx attended Colby College in Maine briefly in 1950s but left to work different jobs, including waiting tables and working at the post office. She
received bachelor’s degree in history from the University of Vermont in 1969 and a master’s degree from Sir George William University in Montreal, Canada, in 1973. She then began working toward her Ph.D., but in 1975 she abandoned the idea, thinking she would not be able to find a teaching job. Proulx told Contemporary Authors that she was “wild” during those years. Her third marriage broke up at around the same time. As a result, Proulx became a single parent to her three sons.

In Tiny town in Vermont, Proulx spent her time fishing, hunting, and canoeing, and began working as a freelance journalist. She wrote articles for magazines on many different topics. Her work appeared in publications such as Country Journal, Organic Gardening, and Yankee. In the early 1980s Proulx produced a series of “how-to” books, including Sweet and Hard Cider; Making it, Using it, and Enjoying it. The Fine Art of Salad Gardening; and Plan and Make Your Own Fences Gates, Walkaways. She also created her own newspaper, the Vershire Behind the Times, which existed from 1984 to 1986. She also found time to average two short stories a year, nearly all of which were published.

In 1983 Proulx’s career as a fiction writer was boosted by a notice in Best American Short Stories, an honor that was repeated in 1987. Proulx published her first book, Heart Songs and Other Stories, in 1988. Against the beautiful backdrop of the New England countryside, her stories involve the struggles of people trying to cope with their complicated lives. Proulx illustrates the stories with sharp descriptions, such as a man who eats a fish “as he would a slice of watermelon” or a woman who is “thin as a folded dollar bill, her hand as narrow and cold as a trout.”

Editors that worked with Proulx on her short stories suggested that she try to write a novel. She came up with postcards (1992), the story of a man from New England who flees the family farm after accidentally killing his bride-to-be. The passages including the man’s wandering across the country comes from Proulx’s own trip across America while doing research. The book was a professional and
personal success. Proulx’s became the first woman to receive the PEN/Faulkner Award for Fiction, Which came with a fifteen thousand dollar bonus.

The very next year Proulx capped the success by writing *The Shipping News*. A dark but comic tale set in Newfoundland, it is the story of an unlucky newspaper reporter named Quoyle. It is packed with details, all drawn in a vibrant lively style. The book resulted in a steady stream of awards: first, *the Heartland Prize from the Chicago Tribune*, followed by the *Irish Times International Award*, and *the National Book Award*. These honors were all topped by the 1994 *Pulitzer Prize Fiction*.

After becoming famous, Proulx found that she had less time to research and write. In 1994 she had short stories published in *Atlantic Monthly* and *Esquire*. She bought a second home in Newfoundland, and by the spring of 1995 she had moved to Wyoming. In researching her next novel, Proulx became an expert of accordion music. She studied not to play the instrument but how to take one apart and then rebuilt them. *Accordion Crimes*, released in 1996, is about the music of immigrants and particularly about different kinds of accordion music.

In 1999 Proulx released *Close Range: Wyoming Stories*, which won a book award from *the New Yorker* for best work of fiction. In 2001 *The Shipping News* was released as a film.

(Taken from: http://www.notablebiographies.com/Pe-Pu/Proulx-E-Annie.html)
APPENDIX C

Reflecting *Brokeback Mountain*:

A Reflection of Sexual Orientation Discrimination Seen in *Brokeback Mountain* and Its Relation to Gay Student Bullying in Schools

*Brokeback Mountain*, a novella by Annie Proulx, depicts the discrimination based on sexual orientation by the society to the main characters who are engaged in a gay love relationship. Annie Proulx writes with all the brutal honest of gay relationship in Wyoming 1960s society. The study on this novella reveals that when a man or a group of men tend to violate the masculinity myth will be socially punished by the society. In Indonesian context, Indonesian people are not ready for something different which they are not prepared for. As the result, our society tries to eliminate people who have different sexual orientation by discriminating them from fitting into the society. People are afraid of something which they do not really understand, and discrimination is the manifestation of their fear. People assume that when they discriminate gay people it will stop them infecting the society. I personally disagree if society treats gay people as a contagious disease.

In any means, discrimination leaves nothing but great pain for the victims. As human beings we surely do not want to be happy while the rest of us suffer in silence. How can we be happy while the rest of us still need to fight to be treated equally? Studying and exploring *Brokeback Mountain* reminds me of so many gay
discriminations that the society had done throughout the times. It makes me realize how barbaric their actions are. And as the time goes by, discrimination towards gay people comes in many ways including bullying in school. People say that bullying in school is just a passage rite during teenage time. This is absolutely not true. According to Dr. Deon Davis at San Francisco State University mentions that bullying leads into depression and depression leads into suicidal thought. In the context of Indonesian education, Dede Oetomo, the founder of GAYA Nusantara (the oldest gay movement organization) in Indonesia mentions in an article that Indonesian people is accustomed to judge one another based on their appearance and behavior. Let’s have an example if a male student has characteristic which is less feminine than other male students, his friends will mock him with several name calling such as binci, bencong, kemayu, etc. Name calling is included as verbal bullying. Bullied students are more likely to take a weapon to school, get involved in physical fights, and suffer from anxiety and depression, health problems, and mental health problems. Our teenagers are endangered. This gay bullying has been a global issue in education world.

Some of us would probably still remember how these cruel bullies bullied our friends in high school whom they identified as gay or sissy. Across the country, suicide issue has become somewhat of an epidemic in the gay community. Bullying frequently leads to suicides, especially when gays find it difficult to talk to others about their problems, or when they are unwilling to openly declare themselves as gay. When bullying becomes the norm in schools and in young children’s’ behavior, they gradually move on to progressively more
and more serious negative treatment of gays. According to psychiatric studies, bullying puts a strain on the mental health of our gay students. They are at especially high risk because the bullying is focused on an aspect of their self that they feel ashamed of and are unable to change; their sexuality. According to Mental Health America (2010) “Gay, lesbian, and bisexual youth are two to three times more likely to attempt suicide than their heterosexual counterparts.”

Dealing with our gay students in school, they are much more likely to skip school, citing the fear of bullying and violence as the primary reasons they feel blocked from their regular classes. There are many of them who end up dropping out of high school. According to Mental Health America (2010), the proportion of gay students dropping out of high school is three times bigger than the proportion of heterosexual dropouts. It means that our school system has failed establishing a safe environment for all students regardless of their sexual orientation. The awfulness of gay students bullying has led people around the world to make a move in making a better, more accepting and safer environment for our gay youth. They come up with many various actions such as The Trevor Project and It Gets Better project which involved celebrities and famous people around the world giving encouragement messages to our gay students, including U.S. President, Barack Obama. In Indonesia, we have GAYA Nusantara, Arus Pelangi, and PLU Satu Hati as foundations who can aspire the aspirations of Indonesian LGBT (Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual, and Transgender) people.

Can anything be done to prevent gay bullying in school? Clearly there needs to be a greater emphasis placed on Indonesian education and on the
punishment for the bullies. This is all common sense to all educators and teachers. Teachers and educators have known for decades that students need to be in a safe and supportive learning environment. Teachers know that they must keep their students safe in school. Reflecting from Brokeback Mountain teachers can understand how bad it gets if our students are being bullied because bullying is a sign of discrimination. I personally admit that it is not an easy thing to do. We can not erase prejudice and discrimination overnight. However, it is a challenge for teachers to plant the seed of tolerance in the students’ heart. From Brokeback Mountain we learn that no matter what kind of sexual orientation you have, love conquers all. Thus, through this reflection, I try to relate the story of gay people struggling to fit in the society in dealing with sexual orientation discrimination as it is seen in Annie Proulx’s Brokeback Mountain with the role of teachers in reflecting their ways to fight against gay students bullying in school. As a teacher surely we do not want to make homophobic jokes in class while our gay students suffer in silence.

Teacher Can Do Something to Fight Against Gay Students Bullying in Indonesian School!

Although in Brokeback Mountain Ennis del Mar and Jack Twist give up their life to fate, but we can see the struggle Ennis and Jack did to preserve their love. The love that they preserved costs their life but it is worth it. Near the end of the story Ennis finally finds his courage and dignity to fight for his love to Jack, but unfortunately Jack died because of gay bashing tragedy. It reminds me what
gay people are fighting for. They are not fighting for some special treatment, they just want to be treated equally. All they want is just equality. In a human being sense, equality is not a special right. It is essential right that every human being is born equal.

One thing that teacher can do in school to fight against gay students bullying is by being open minded. Indonesia is an eastern country where the topic of homosexuality is still previewed as something taboo and inappropriate to be discussed. However, we cannot forget that Indonesia is the fastest developing country, too. It means that there is a hope in repairing Indonesian education culture related to students bullying. We can start by becoming an open-minded person. As teacher we need to give our students example of a real open-minded value. The only way to do that is by starting from ourselves, so that our students can see and then follow us.

Teacher is a role model in school. Students give their attention to what the teachers do. Being open-minded encourages our students to feel comfortable in their own skins. Teachers can make a move by knowing each student’s background to open the tunnels of understanding between the students and the teachers. Know the students well, and understand that every single student come from many different race, ethnicity, religion, and sexual orientation. In order to know every student’s background, teacher can ask the student to write their personal life in a form of a journal and tell them that it is a secret task so that the students are interested in making their most personal life journal.
In order to fight against bullying, teachers need to know the district and school policies on bullying in Indonesia. Teachers need to learn and understand each point of the policies and implement them in school. To implement it effectively teachers must be able to find out an interesting way to communicate the policies to the students. Teachers might need to use role playing method to grab students’ attention. Teacher can ask the students to become local politician who will make a campaign of the policy given by the teachers, and of course the policies are related to bullying in school.

The next step to fight against bullying is by creating a safe environment in class by treating students and others with warmth and respect. It is important to let the students know that the teachers are available for them to listen and help them. Be a teacher who knows when to act like a friend to the students. Sense of sensitivity in a teacher can lift burden from the students’ shoulders. No matter how small or big it is. What every teacher needs to know is that a single pat on the back could save a life. Teacher can help the class identify bullying in books, TV shows and movies, and discuss the impact of that bullying and how it could be resolved. Teacher can hold class meetings in which students can talk about bullying and peer relations. It is also important for teachers to show several videos or books related to sexual orientation discrimination. It means that teachers are suggested to find sources in which students can gain a better understanding on gay student bullying issue. Movies, books, and any other sources which depict the misery resulting from discrimination may convince students to avoid practicing discrimination and bullying towards their friends. There are several movies related
to gay bullying namely: *Prayer for Bobby*, a film about the struggle of a mother in finding justice for her deceased son due to a barbaric bullying in school, *Brokeback Mountain* a book and a film telling a story about two cowboys who fall in love but they have to be separated and hide their feelings due to the society oppression which resulted is the death of one main characters due to gay bashing action.

Another way in which teacher can help prevent gay student bullying in school is by discussing it with colleagues. Encouraging other teachers to take parts in fighting against student bullying in Indonesian school. Discussion is a good start to make other colleagues aware with the danger of gay student bullying in school.

Teachers hold a big role in ending gay students bullying in school. Teachers have one ultimate weapon that can lead the students into the good way or the opposite; *words*. Words do have power in giving impact to somebody’s mind, heart and life. A good teacher knows how to use his/her words wisely. By the presence of this study, hopefully all the teachers will begin to realize that sexual orientation discrimination comes in many ways including gay student bullying in school. Therefore, from now on, no teachers should use homophobic jokes just to cheer up the class. Yes, homophobic jokes might be funny for heterosexual students, but what teachers do not know is that gay students suffer in silence while the rest of the class is laughing. We cannot fix everything which has happened, but we can make a move to make the world a better place for us to live in peace and as equals. We can spread more love and less hate.