AN ANALYSIS OF STUDENTS’ PROBLEMS IN CITING SOURCES IN ACADEMIC ESSAY WRITING CLASS

A SARJANA PENDIDIKAN THESIS

Presented as Partial Fulfillment of the Requirements to Obtain the Sarjana Pendidikan Degree in English Language Education

By
Dewi Ratna Suhita
Student number: 061214065

ENGLISH LANGUAGE EDUCATION STUDY PROGRAM
DEPARTMENT OF LANGUAGE AND ART EDUCATION
FACULTY OF TEACHERS TRAINING AND EDUCATION SANATA DHARMA UNIVERSITY
YOGYAKARTA
2012
A Sarjana Pendidikan Thesis

AN ANALYSIS OF STUDENTS’ PROBLEMS IN CITING SOURCES IN ACADEMIC ESSAY WRITING CLASS

By
Dewi Ratna Suhita
Student number: 061214065

Approved by

Sponsor

Date:
C. Tutyandari, S.Pd., M.Pd.
9 November 2012
A Sarjana Pendidikan Thesis on

AN ANALYSIS OF STUDENTS’ PROBLEMS IN CITING SOURCES IN ACADEMIC ESSAY WRITING CLASS

By
Dewi Ratna Suhita
Student number: 061214065

Defended before the Board of Examiners on December 4, 2012 and Declared Acceptable

Board of Examiners

Chairperson: C. Tutyandari, S.Pd., M.Pd.
Secretary: Drs. Barli Bram, M.Ed., Ph.D.
Member: C. Tutyandari, S.Pd., M.Pd.
Member: Dr. Retno Muljani, M.Pd.
Member: Drs. Barli Bram, M.Ed., Ph.D.

Yogyakarta, 4 December 2012
Faculty of Teachers Training and Education
Sanata Dharma University
Dean,

Rohandi, Ph.D.
STATEMENT OF WORK'S ORIGINALITY

I honestly declare that this thesis, which I have written, does not contain the work or parts of the work of other people, except those cited in the quotations and the references, as a scientific paper should.

Yogyakarta, 4 December 2012

The writer

Dewi Ratna Suhita
061214065
LEMBAR PERNYATAAN PERSETUJUAN
PUBLIKASI KARYA ILMIAH
UNTUK KEPENTINGAN AKADEMIS

Yang bertanda tangan di bawah ini, saya mahasiswa Universitas Sanata Dharma:

Nama : Dewi Ratna Suhita
Nomor Mahasiswa : 061214065

Demi pengembangan ilmu pengetahuan, saya memberikan kepada Perpustakaan Universitas Sanata Dharma karya ilmiah saya yang berjudul:

AN ANALYSIS OF STUDENTS’ PROBLEMS IN CITING SOURCES IN ACADEMIC ESSAY WRITING CLASS

beserta perangkat yang diperlukan (bila ada). Dengan demikian saya memberikan kepada Perpustakaan Universitas Sanata Dharma hak untuk menyimpan, mengalihkan dalam bentuk media lain, mengelolanya dalam bentuk pangkalan data, mendistribusikan secara terbatas, dan mempublikasikannya di Internet atau media lain untuk kepentingan akademis tanpa perlu meminta ijin dari saya maupun memberikan royalti kepada saya selama tetap mencantumkan nama saya sebagai penulis.

Demikian pernyataan ini yang saya buat dengan sebenarnya.

Dibuat di Yogyakarta
Pada tanggal: 4 Desember 2012

Yang menyatakan

Dewi Ratna Suhita
ABSTRACT


Advancing to the level of academic writing, the students of English Language Education Study Program of Sanata Dharma University start to cite sources more intensively in Academic Essay Writing class than other previous writing classes. The large amount of materials which should be studied in relatively limited time in class caused certain difficulties for the students in citing sources.

Therefore, this research intended to analyse the problems that the students had in citing sources on Academic Essay Writing class. The formulated research question was: "What were the students’ problem in citing sources in Academic Essay Writing class?"

To answer the research question, the researcher used document analysis as the research method. Survey method was also used as the minor method to give additional information on the students’ considerations in writing quotations with the instrument of questionnaires. The participants involved in filling the questionnaires were 77 students. On the other hand, the documents to be analyzed were the students’ works to see their problems of applying knowledge in citing sources. Fifteen papers were selected randomly as the sample; five from each class.

The research findings from the questionnaires showed that students already had sufficient sources of learning and they understood the concept of plagiarism. However, cases of plagiarism were still found in the students’ papers. It implied that the comprehension the students had about plagiarism was still on the surface and some plagiarism resulted from negligence. Another conclusion is that the students were not well-informed on the use of direct and indirect quotation. The problems they had were in the formats of citation for direct quotations and in the paraphrasing process for indirect quotations. It could be concluded from the students’ papers that their main problems were incorrect formats of citations, incorrect formats of references and lack of correspondence between in-text citations and references.
Para mahasiswa Pendidikan Bahasa Inggris Universitas Santa Dharma menggunakan kutipan lebih intensif di kelas *Academic Essay Writing* daripada kelas-kelas menulis lainnya. Banyaknya materi yang harus dipelajari tentang cara mengutip dengan alokasi waktu belajar di kelas yang relatif terbatas, menimbulkan masalah-masalah tersendiri bagi mahasiswa.

Oleh karena itu, penelitian ini bertujuan untuk menggali permasalahan yang timbul dalam mengutip sumber di kelas *Academic Essay Writing*. Tujuan penelitian dirumuskan dalam sebuah pertanyaan inti yaitu: “Apa sajakah permasalahan yang dihadapi mahasiswa dalam mengutip sumber di kelas *Academic Essay Writing*?”

Untuk menjawab pertanyaan tersebut, metode yang digunakan adalah analisis dokumen. Survey juga digunakan dalam penelitian ini untuk menambahkan informasi tentang pendapat dan pengertian mahasiswa tentang kutipan langsung dan tidak langsung serta plagiarisme. Responden yang terlibat dalam pengisian kuesioner berjumlah 77 mahasiswa. Di sisi lain, analisa makalah mahasiswa digunakan untuk mengungkap permasalahan yang timbul dalam mengutip sumber pada pengaplikasiannya. Lima makalah diambil dari tiap kelas untuk digunakan sebagai sampel.

Dari hasil analisa kuesioner diketahui bahwa mahasiswa sudah mendapatkan cukup sumber belajar untuk mempelajari tentang kutipan dan plagiarisme. Mahasiswa juga sudah mampu memahami inti dari plagiarisme. Walaupun begitu, kasus plagiarisme masih terjadi pada makalah mahasiswa. Hal tersebut menyoroti bahwa kemampuan mahasiswa untuk memahami plagiarisme hanya sebatas di permukaan saja dan beberapa kasus terjadi karena ketidakacuan pada peraturan. Pada kuesioner juga ditemukan bahwa mahasiswa masih kesulitan dalam mengutip langsung dan pada proses parafrase. Dari analisa makalah mahasiswa dapat disimpulkan bahwa kesulitan-kesulitan utama mahasiswa dalam mengutip adalah format kutipan langsung, format daftar pustaka, dan ketidaksesuaian antara kutipan dalam teks dan daftar pustaka.
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Never ending praise I devote to Father Almighty, Jesus Christ, and the Holy Spirit for the power given to me to eventually finish this thesis in His perfect time. It would be impossible to me to conquer all the obstacles without Jesus, the only faithful friend I could count on. Hosanna, hosanna in the highest for the ceaseless flame of His love. I also devote my gratefulness to Holy Mother Mary, who never stopped praying for me.

The second gratitude goes to the best advisor of all, C. Tutyandari, S.Pd., M.Pd. I thank her deeply for being so patient in my process of writing this thesis. I know she could have just kicked me out of her thesis consultation class when I did not show up for three semesters. Nevertheless, she kept guiding and motivating me to reach the finish line. I can never thank her enough for that. I am greatly indebted to the lecturers of Academic Essay classes: Yuseva Ariyani Iswandari, S.Pd., M.Ed., Hanandyo Dardjito, S.Pd., M.Hum., and Adesti Komalasari, S.Pd., M.A. for their permission to allow me to hold research in their classes. I also thank the students of Academic Essay classes academic year of 2011-2012 for helping me to fill in the questionnaire.

A big hug and gratitude is presented to my number one motivation, my beloved mother, Lucia Andri Susintowati. She is truly my superhero. Her full
dedication in doing her responsibility both as a mother and a father for three of her daughters is an extraordinary inspiration for me. I can only repay her by doing my best to be a good daughter that she can be proud of. My lips will never stop praying for her, for her happiness now and forever. Although my father, Witono, could not live the day when I achieve this big accomplishment, I know he also smiles from heaven. I dedicate this thesis to him as a humble present from a daughter whom he raised with love and care. I also thank my sisters, Nisa (and her Krentika gang: Fendi, Wendi, Trek, Midhut) and Vini and all my family members that I can not mention one by one for all the support in the process of finishing the thesis.

My special appreciation is dedicated to my number one cheerleader, Benedictus Feka Yasmita Pratama, A.Md., S.TP. for the love, support, prayers, and everything that helped me to stay strong during my struggle. There is nothing compare to his stupid jokes that made me laugh when I had frowns in my face and the songs he sang for me when I had the most bitter day. I am the luckiest woman on earth to have a man as "crazy" as he is as a boyfriend. My life would never be this fun and colorful without him.

"I would rather walk with a friend in the dark, than alone in the light (Hellen Keller).” Yes, the next appreciation goes to all my friends who always encouraged me to give my best effort in finishing this thesis: Vika, my loyal partner in thesis consultation with Bu Ndari for all the reminders and support; Sari (Buben), for the tips and motivation she gave when I was stuck; Satrio, for helping me with the
proofreading which meant a lot to me; and the rest of Bolangers Adventure Club members: Rita, Christine, Guntur, Adi, Yoga for the crazy times we shared together; and all friends of PBI batch 2006. I also thank all my friends of Mitra and ex-Mitra Perpustakaan Universitas Sanata Dharma: Dyah (Budi), Mbak Nisa, Putri (Sapu), Ria (Bul-bul), Ria Kecil, Woro (Bunda), Ivonne, Penti, Yudha, Mbak Vita, Agatha, Rudi, Hani, Era, Novi, Inneke, and also the staffs of PUSD for the support and care.

Last but not least, my big gratitude goes to all people who gave their contribution to me to finish this thesis which can be in many supporting forms starting from a warm smile with a wish of luck to the most annoying question of ”when will you graduate?” I know all of them have one root that is love. Therefore, may God bless them all.

Dewi Ratna Suhita
TABLE OF CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>TITLE PAGE</td>
<td>i</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>APPROVAL PAGES</td>
<td>ii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>STATEMENT OF WORK’S ORIGINALITY</td>
<td>iv</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PERNYATAAN PERSETUJUAN PUBLIKASI</td>
<td>v</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ABSTRACT</td>
<td>vi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ABSTRAK</td>
<td>vii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS</td>
<td>viii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TABLE OF CONTENTS</td>
<td>xi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LIST OF TABLES</td>
<td>xiii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LIST OF APPENDICES</td>
<td>xiv</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

CHAPTER I. INTRODUCTION

A. Background of the Study                                    1
B. Problem Formulation                                        4
C. Problem Limitation                                         4
D. Objectives of the Study                                    4
E. Benefits of the Study                                      4
F. Definition of Terms                                         5

CHAPTER II. REVIEW OF RELATED LITERATURE

A. Theoretical Description                                    8
   1. The Reasons for Citing                                   8
   2. Documentation Styles in Writing                         12
      a. In-text Citation                                      15
      b. Reference list                                       20
CHAPTER III. METHODOLOGY

A. Research Method .......................................................... 32
B. Research Participants ....................................................... 33
C. Research Instruments ........................................................ 34
D. Data Gathering Technique .................................................. 35
E. Data Analysis Techniques ................................................... 35
F. Research Procedure .......................................................... 36

CHAPTER IV. RESEARCH RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

A. Data Presentation ............................................................ 38
   1. Data from the Students’ Papers ........................................ 38
   2. Data from the Questionnaire ........................................... 40
B. Data Analysis and Discussion .............................................. 49
   1. Students’ Problems in Citing Based on the Students’ Papers Analysis ........................................... 49
   2. Students’ Problems in Citing Based on the Questionnaire .................................................. 62

CHAPTER V. CONCLUSIONS AND SUGGESTIONS

A. Conclusions ........................................................................ 65
B. Suggestions ......................................................................... 66

REFERENCES ........................................................................ 68
# LIST OF TABLES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Table 4.1.</td>
<td>Summary of students’ problems in citing sources in the papers…</td>
<td>39</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 4.2.</td>
<td>Sources where students learned citation from…</td>
<td>42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 4.3.</td>
<td>The preferred citing style of the students</td>
<td>42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 4.4.</td>
<td>Students’ considerations for choosing direct quotation…</td>
<td>44</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 4.5.</td>
<td>Students’ considerations for choosing indirect quotation…</td>
<td>45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 4.6.</td>
<td>Students’ considerations for choosing combination of direct and indirect quotation…</td>
<td>45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 4.7.</td>
<td>Difficulties of writing direct quotation…</td>
<td>46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 4.8.</td>
<td>Difficulties of writing indirect quotation…</td>
<td>48</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
# LIST OF APPENDICES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Appendix</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Appendix 1: Questionnaire</td>
<td>71</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix 2: Record of Students’ Answers for the Open Questions in the Questionnaire</td>
<td>73</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
CHAPTER I
INTRODUCTION

This chapter covers the rationale of the research. They are the background of the study, problem formulation, problem limitation, objectives of the study, benefits of the study, and definition of terms.

A. Background of the study

There are so many ways to communicate between human beings. Direct communication is done by having conversation with one another. Thoughts and feelings are described orally and responded directly. Another way of describing thoughts and feelings is by writing. This skill of language learning is known to have a long process from thinking of what to write to finally producing a written work. It is definitely more complex than oral communication since it involves not only technical guidelines of a good writing should be but also organization of ideas so that the ideas to be conveyed is clear for the readers. What also differentiates writing with speaking is how the listeners or the readers are convinced. In a conversation, the listener does not always ask the detailed information from the speaker. While, in a composition, the readers may question the credibility of the author if the author does not provide the supporting evidence clearly. Supporting evidences help the author to convince the readers of the reasons or arguments he has. Supporting evidences can consist of anecdotes, personal experiences, facts, studies, statistics, and the opinions of experts (Langan, 2011, p. 5). If a writer wishes to strengthen his arguments with the use
of evidence, they must be presented in the paper with complete information about the source. Otherwise, it can be considered as plagiarism.

Trimmer (2010, p. 25) defined plagiarism as “using someone else’s words or ideas without giving proper credit or no credit at all to the writer of the original”. The credit is given by acknowledging the original author, letting the readers know and later check the source by providing the complete information about the source. Writing complete information about a source is called documentation.

Doing documentation in the paper involves two ways. The first one is in-text citation or also known as parenthetical citation. In-text citation is “separate citation of each borrowed fact or opinion. The source author and the page number are enclosed in parentheses following the borrowed material (Coyle, 1990, p. 129)”. In-text citation is written inside the body of the paper. The second one is references list written in the end of the paper. References list includes the complete information about the source such as the complete name of the author, the date and place of publication and the title of the work. Those two ways should always exist in a documentation as they complement each other.

The need to apply the knowledge on citations appears in Academic Essay Writing class. Academic Essay Writing, as a part of academic writing, is a course offered by ELESP for the fifth semester students. The aims of the course are to guide students to learn about the characteristics of academic writing and to write good academic essays (PBI Academic Guidelines, 2011). The topics of the essays are argumentative essay, comparison and contrast, problem and solution, and
book or article review. In these essays, students are expected to think critically about an issue and pour their opinion in their papers. To support their opinion, students need to provide perspectives from more experienced person or experts. This is where the need of proper citing is crucial. Although it is important, the lots of materials about citing make it difficult for the students to master since the portion of time for learning it in classroom is limited. They have to manage their time and strategies to learn to write good quotations with proper citations at the same time they learn about writing skill itself. Moreover, the ease of accessing information instantly and directly from the internet contributes to the higher tendency for the students to copy and paste which can lead to plagiarism. Thus, this research attempts to seek the potential problems that commonly appear in the process of learning to write quotations in Academic Essay Writing class of ELESP. If the previous study of Prabandari in 1997 about the students’ problems in writing quotation was held in the eighth semester, this study was held in the fifth semester. The researcher intends to dig more information on the students’ problems from the beginning so that the problems can be solved earlier to prevent major errors in the more advanced writing class. In this research paper, the problems are in the terms of writing quotations, in-text citations, and references. It is expected that by reading the result of this research, both students and lecturers of ELESP can find better strategies to learn and teach citing in Academic Essay Writing as a preparation for writing more complicated work like thesis.
B. Problem Formulation

This research is aimed at answering the research question:

What are the problems that the students have in citing sources in Academic Essay Writing class?

C. Problem Limitation

This research is conducted in the class of Academic Essay Writing. The students are fifth semester students of English Language Education Study Program of Sanata Dharma University, academic year of 2011/2012. The problems are limited into how students cite sources and how students write quotations in their papers. The understanding of plagiarism is also discussed in the research since it is relevant to failing writing correct and proper citations. The researcher uses APA Style Manual along with PBI Thesis and Final Paper Guidelines as the standard of the correct and proper citations.

D. Objectives of the study

This study is intended to investigate the problems that the students have in citing sources in the Academic Essay Writing class.

E. Benefits of the study

This study is expected to give beneficial contributions to:
1. Lecturers

This research provides information for lecturers in teaching writing, especially in academic writing. It is important to introduce the concept of plagiarism as early as possible so that students take it seriously and be more careful on composing a piece of writing. There are various styles of documentation with different formats that the students must master, not to mention the paraphrasing skill needed for writing indirect quotations. Lecturers can find numerous ways of teaching how to quote properly with more creative techniques in order to help students understand it deeply.

2. Students

This research hopefully can broaden students’ knowledge about plagiarism and how to avoid it which is by quoting properly. They can also learn from the common problems that are described in this research so that they can find better strategies in learning to cite for better performance in writing an academic essay.

F. Definition of terms

The following terms are specifically used in this research. They are described furtherly in order not to be confused with other terms:

1. **Citation** means the partial reference in the main body of the assignment which consists of the last name of the author and the year when the work is published (Neville, 2010, p.49). However, the meaning of verb ‘to cite’ and ‘to quote’ is often misinterpreted. It is true that according to dictionaries, ‘to cite’ and ‘to quote’ deliver the same meaning i.e. “to speak or write or to repeat
the exact words from a book, an author, etc.” and so does the noun ‘citation’ and ‘quotation’. Nevertheless, authors whose books and articles discuss about documenting sources in specific explain that those two words have different meaning. Harvey (1998) in his book Writing with Sources: A Guide for Student define citing as “making notation or signal in your paper that refers your reader to a place where you give full publication data about the source” (p.14). On the other hand, quoting refers to “using exact words, phrases, and sentences from a source” (www.lib.usm.edu/legacy/plag/quoting.php). That understanding also defines quotation as “record of the exact language used by someone in speech or writing” (Behrens & Rosen, 1988).

2. Academic Writing is defined as writing or composition that is learned by students in the academic community or in this case, college and university as higher level education (Fulwiler, 1988). There are ‘ground rules’ as the guidelines in making an acceptable academic writing. These rules are “shaped by the functional requirements and social conventions of academic communities” (Mercer & Swann, 1996).

3. Academic Essay Writing, under the umbrella term of academic writing, is one of the compulsory subject in the ELESP. It is offered for students of semester five. This course is designed to introduce students to the underlying principles of academic writing. It is projected to help students to be able to analyze the characteristics of academic essay and to write good academic essay (PBI Academic Guidelines, 2011). The topics of essay discussed in this course are argumentative essay, comparison and contrast, problem and solution, and book or
article review. The essay that the students write is a paper of about five hundred words that consists of introductory paragraph, supporting paragraph, and a concluding paragraph (Langan, 2011).
CHAPTER II

REVIEW OF RELATED LITERATURE

There are two main components in Chapter II. They are the theoretical description and theoretical framework. The theories in this chapter are intended to help to analyze the instruments and answering the research question.

A. Theoretical Description

In the theoretical description, the researcher provided some theories as the standard of proper citation and writing quotation. The theories in this study are originally guidelines provided by some authors to write citation and quotation properly. The APA style of citing is also described in the theoretical description as it serves as the standard guidelines to examine the students’ works concerning the format of citation.

1. The Reasons for Citing

In the academic world, an idea is a precious and valuable thing. It is unique as it is the result of one’s thinking process or point of view that can lead to the discovery of a new knowledge or contribution to the development of certain knowledge. For instance, by reading someone’s book, which is the embodiment of the writer’s ideas and hard work, a person can gain a new knowledge that he or she never knew before. As the appreciation for the ideas and hard work, the author’s name must be enclosed in his or her original work as it is spread widely in the academic community. This is
the idea of why documentation of the source is needed: to give appreciation to a person’s idea and hard work for the contribution of knowledge development.

In college, students are introduced into a level-up standard of writing named academic writing. In the English Language Study Program of Sanata Dharma University, a course is offered under the umbrella of academic writing i.e. Academic Essay Writing. In this course, students learn to write essay with the topics of argumentative, comparison and contrast, problem and solution, and book or article review. To provide strong arguments and convincing opinion, explanations must be supported by facts and an expert’s point of view. Therefore, source documentation is a price that cannot be bargained for borrowing other people’s ideas. Wiggins (2012) define documentation as ”all the right information in your paper about the source you used so that another person could go and find the same information in the same source”. Citation is a part of documentation which contains part of the information (the author’s name, the year of publication and the original words taken) and is integrated into paragraph. Another part that is a list of complete detail of a source is called references list and written on a different page. These two work together to provide clear information about the sources that the writer used. Neville (2010) proposed six reasons for citing:

a. It facilitates the tracing of the origin of ideas. Citation helps the reader to know where the source came from and who wrote it.

b. It helps to build a web of ideas. When a writer adds his or her own interpretation after a citation, he or she has a role in developing the
knowledge. From the original idea, a new perspective is added as the original ideas were supported from other source, and in the future the ideas will continue to grow and develop.

c. Supports one’s own voice in academic writing. Although sources are taken from experts, it does not mean that they are more important so that they dominate. In fact, sources help to support and strengthen the writer’s personal views.

d. It validates arguments. From the citation, readers can know whether a written work is credible or not. A writer should choose only reliable and valid evidence to support his or her arguments.

e. It helps to spread knowledge. By citing, a writer helps to pass knowledge for other people who might need the source for their study.

f. It acknowledges the work of others. Citing equals to give appreciation for the hard work of others.

Aside from the purpose of citing that is to give appreciation to other’s work, good citing also give benefits to the writer and the distribution of knowledge. As a part of the academic world, students must be aware of these reasons. They should be taken seriously as individual moral responsibility. Fail to cite does not only mean fail to respect others but more on failing to respect self. Not giving correct citation means that a writer is not competent and it can lead to serious offense called plagiarism.
In some cases, students do not cite or forget to cite because they do not know when they need to cite and when they do not need to cite. Trimmer in 2010 explained that citing is needed when:

a. using a direct quotation
b. copying a table, chart, or other diagram
c. constructing a table from data provided by others
d. summarizing or paraphrase a passage in your own words
e. presenting specific examples, figures, or factual information that have been taken from a specific source and used to explain or support judgments

But there are also situations when citing is not needed. Neville (2010) wrote four kinds of sources that do not require citation:

a. Historical overviews
   If a summary in a paper is made from more or less the same explanation from many sources about a particular event in the past, citation is not needed. But, if the fact is taken from just one source, then citation is needed.

b. Writer’s own experiences and observations
   The case would be different if the experiences and observations have been officially published before in a book, journal, etc. The experiences, then, will need to be cited to support the writer’s view.

c. Summaries and conclusions
   There is no need to cite the idea that has been mentioned and cited earlier in the paper.
d. Common knowledge

Common knowledge is information that can be found easily in many sources. The University of Queensland (2006, as cited in Neville, 2010) gave examples of common knowledge:

1) That Neil Armstrong landed on the Moon in July 1969 (common fact of history)
2) That Alexander Fleming discovered penicillin (common fact of history)
3) The definition of photosynthesis (common knowledge in the discipline)
4) That humans need food and water for survival (commonsense observation)
5) That Count Dracula lived in Transylvania (accepted folklore)
6) ‘Life wasn’t meant to be easy’ (aphorism)

Students must be careful in deciding when to cite and when not to cite. But, it is safer to just cite whatever materials in order to avoid plagiarism.

2. Documentation Styles in Writing

After knowing the reasons for quoting, the next step that a writer must do in documenting sources is choosing the documentation style. Nowadays, the documentation styles has developed and varied much as the result of the need for the manual in more specific disciplines. More organizations and institutions published their own manual such as MHRA (The Modern Humanities Research Association), CSE (The Councils of Science Editors) or formerly known as CBE (The Councils of Biology Editors), IEEE (The Institute of Electrical and Electronics Engineers), ASA
(The American Sociological Association), and many more in particular disciplines. Some earlier style manuals are MLA (Modern Language Association of America), APA (American Psychological Association), and Chicago style. Those documentation styles basically have the same purpose that is to state the name of the author of the source within paragraphs which correspond with the complete source at the end of the paper. The differences between them lie on how the citation is written inside the paragraph and how the sources are written in the reference list. Sanata Dharma University, in this case, English Language Education Study Program (PBI) has its own manual named Sarjana Pendidikan Thesis and Final Paper Guidelines. It adopts APA style as the manual for both non-literature and literature research. Writers are free to decide which documentation style to use depends on the discipline that their works are in. The main rule in using a particular documentation style is to be consistent. It is unaccepted to have a mix of different documentation styles in a work because it will be confusing.

Since this research is held in PBI of Sanata Dharma University, the documentation style to be focused on is the APA style, as it is the only recommended style in PBI Sarjana Pendidikan Thesis and Final Paper Guidelines applied for both literature and non-literature papers. Therefore, APA style would apply to all writing classes in PBI, including Academic Essay Writing Class. Although the PBI Thesis and Final Paper Guidelines 2011 compile the rules from 5th edition of the APA style, the researcher used the latest version that is the 6th edition. The researcher also
decided not to add explanation on other documentation styles, so that they would not distract explanation on APA style.

APA or American Psychologist Association first published their publication manual as six-page guidelines in the Psychological Bulletin in 1929. Later in 1953, the first edition was published, printed separately from the bulletin. After that, it continues to develop and be widely used. The latest edition, the sixth, was printed in 2009 with some updates on the format of citing on-line sources.

The basic format of APA documentation style is writing the name of the author and the year of publication or sometimes called author-date style. APA style stresses author and date because data updates are important in scientific research (Winkler & McCuen-Metherell, 2008). The nature of scientific research itself is growing and developing. Therefore, the newer the source the better it will be.

There are two main components in APA documentation style. The first is in-text citation (parenthetical documentation) which is the direct quotation of a source incorporated in the paragraph. The second is reference list, which is a record of complete sources from where the direct quotations are taken. These two have to correspond. The source of the direct quotation written in the paragraph must be present in the reference list, and vice versa.
a. In-text citation

1) Format for short direct quotations

How direct quotations written in the text according to the APA style is divided into two parts. The first one is for paragraph containing direct quotations. The information about the source should be put in brackets in the order of the last name of the author, the year of publication, and the page where the words are taken. This information can be put at the beginning of the sentence or at the end of the sentence before period. The p. is the abbreviation of page (or pp. if there is more than one page). The direct quotation is written with quotation marks to tell the readers the exact words of the author. See the example:

Darwin used the metaphor of the tree of life "to express the other form of interconnectedness–genealogical rather than ecological" (Gould & Brown, 1991, p.14).

There is also another way of writing direct quotations that is by introducing the author as the part of the narration. The year of publication can follow right after the name of the author in brackets and the page number is placed at the end of the direct quotation, for example:

Gould and Brown (1991) explained that Darwin used the metaphor of the tree of life "to express the other form of interconnectedness–genealogical rather than ecological" (p. 14).
2) Format for long direct quotations

If the direct quotation to be taken consists of 40 or more words, it should be written on a new line, double-spaced, in a freestanding block of text. Quotation marks are omitted and the block should be indented about a half inch from the left margin, in the same position as a new paragraph. The name of the author can be placed at the beginning of the sentence followed by year of publication. The page number is placed at the end of the quotation after period.

Olson (2000) concluded that:

enacting curriculum decisions within classrooms is a complex, multistoried narrative in a dynamic process of continual negotiation. Because pre-service teachers enter an ongoing narrative in process finding their place within the story can be confusing and frustrating. Finding space to create their own curriculum story with students is difficult. (p. 175)

Another way of writing the source is by writing it together in brackets and placing it at the end of the quotation after period.

…..curriculum story with students is difficult. (Olson, 2000, p. 175)

3) Format for a summary or a paraphrase

The way of writing citation for rephrased information or indirect quotation needs not the page number. However, adding page number or paragraph if possible is
recommended because it would help the readers to find out the location of the quotation in the source.

Pollock (1994) has shown that a disturbance in the mother’s initial contact with the infant can affect her decision or capacity to breast-feed her infant (para.7).

or,

One study has shown that a disturbance in the mother’s initial contact with the infant can affect her decision or capacity to breast-feed her infant (Pollock, 1994, para.7).

4) Citing work of two authors

Both names of the authors should be mentioned together anytime they appeared in the text. The names are combined using the word “and” if they appear in the text and using ampersand “&” if they are written inside the parenthetical citation.

Much earlier, Grant and Change (1958) had discovered….

or,

In a previous study of caged rats (Grant & Change, 1958), the surprising element was…
5) **Citing work of multiple authors**

For works with three to five authors, all authors should be mentioned the first time the citation appears. In subsequent citation, the last name of the first author is written followed by the word “et al.”.

Holland, Holt, Levi, and Beckett (1983) indicate that….(first citation)

Holland et al. (1983) also found….(subsequent citation)

For works with six or more authors, write directly the last name of the first author followed by “et al.”.

6) **Citing work of an organization as the author**

If an organization’s or an institution’s name is short, it is recommended to spell out the complete name:

(Michigan University, 2000) or (Monsters Corporation, 1999)

If the organization’s name is long, the complete name is spelled out the first time it appears in the text and abbreviated in the subsequent citation:

(American Psychological Association [APA], 2011)

continued by:

(APA, 2011)

7) **Citing work of anonymous author or no author**

If the author of a work is listed as “Anonymous”, write the word “Anonymous” in the text:
(Anonymous, 1987)

For works without any information about the author, write two or three words from the title of the book or the article followed by the year of publication:

...the worst election loss in the party's history ("This is the end," 1968).

8) Citing work with no date of publication

When the date of publication of a work is unknown, write the abbreviation “n.d.” which means “no date” in the citation.

F.G. Spencer (n.d.) studied both aspects of….

9) Citing secondary source

To use the work cited in another source, mention the original work and the source in the introducing sentence. In the end of the quotation, mention the secondary source in the reference list and in the citation using the words “as cited in.”

Kiel and Elliott's study (as cited in Eve, Horsfall, & Lee, 1997) found that. . . .
(p. 97).

10) Citing online sources

Citing on-line sources differs in term of page number. Since on-line materials do not have page number, the information about page number is replaced by paragraph number. Use the abbreviation para.
Redall (2004) suggested that “Yeats warmed to a number of Nietzsche’s ideas” (para.5).

Writer can also add headings to add clarity about the source and its location.

Funkhouser concludes, “There is a very small effect of classroom size reduction in student achievement in reading and math, and no effect in language and spelling” (Synthesis and conclusion section, para.1)

b. References list

References list is the record of all detailed information of sources that is quoted in the paragraph. The page of references list itself can be written under the title “reference” if there is only one source, or “references” if there is more than one source. The elements of information for references list include the name of the author (the last name comes first), year of publication (written inside brackets), the title of the book (italicized with only the first letter of the sentence is capitalized), city of publication, and the name of the publisher. All sources should be listed in alphabetical order of the author’s name. Here is the example of general form of reference:


1) Work of multiple authors

For work of two authors, combine the names of the author with ampersand “&”. If there are three to six authors, combine the names with a comma and an
ampersand before the name of the last author. For work of six or more authors, write all six and followed by “et al.”


or,


2) Work of organization as the author

Write the full name of the organization:


3) Work of Anonymous or no author

If the work is listed as “Anonymous”, write “Anonymous” as the author. If the work has unknown author, write the title of the book or the article to replace the author’s name.


or,

4) **Edited book**

List all editors up to six. More than six editors, use the word “et al.”. Put the word “Ed.” or “Eds.” in parentheses after the names.


For a book with an author and an editor, use the following term:


5) **Revised edition of a book**

Mention the edition in parentheses following the title.


6) **Multivolume book**

Add the volume number after the title.


Baltimore, MD: Williams& Wilkins.
7) **Article in a journal or magazine**

The basic format for article in a journal or magazine is writing the article in normal fonts (not italicized) followed by the title of the journal or magazine in italic and adding the volume, issue number and page number.

Harvey, O. L. (1980). The measurement of handwriting considered as a form of expressive movement. *Quarterly Review of Biology, 55*(12), 231-249

Specifically for magazine and newspaper, add the month of publication.

8) **Online sources**

The general format for on-line sources requires the author’s name, the complete date (not just the year) of the last update, the title of the article (not italicized, except for book, magazine, journal, or newspaper), the source (a database, website, or on-line magazine, journal, or newspaper; italicized), the date of retrieval, and the complete URL.


For non-periodical web document or article, list as many as possible the information about it.

For articles or documents without author or date of publication, use this format:

*Census data revisited.* (n.d.). Retrieved March 9, 2009, from

http://harvard.edu/data/index.php

3. Plagiarism

In the “Reasons for Quoting” above, plagiarism has already been mentioned as the act of failing to give credit for the ideas of other people. Many definitions are made among experts, but the main idea of plagiarism is theft. In this case, the precious thing stolen is idea. Any use of materials from other person without telling where it comes from is plagiarism. Even when the material is rephrased, it still counts as plagiarism. Neville (2010) made clear that the materials or works in this context is any work which has been published and presented to public in the form of “in print, internet, audio-visual, theatrical, cinematic, choreographic or other tangible form.” Anything that goes through publication process and is read by many people needs to be cited.

Although the understanding of plagiarism is more or less the same everywhere, the interpretation of what counts as plagiarism varies for each institution. But in general, there are three main forms of plagiarism that is concluded by Neville (2010, p.30):

a. Copying another person’s work, including the work of another student (with or without their consent), and claiming or pretending it to be your own.
b. Presenting arguments that use a blend of your own and a significant percentage of copied words of the original author without acknowledging the source.

c. Paraphrasing another person’s work, but not giving due acknowledgement to the original writer or organization publishing the writing, including internet sites. The exceptions to this would be in relation to common knowledge.

Students must be careful even more in writing a paraphrase. Taking verbatim copy without quotation marks treated as paraphrasing will also be considered as plagiarism even though the student has cited the name of the author (Spatt, 1999). It is because paraphrasing means writing with own words. Students should use their own words to reformulate the idea of the passage. If there are words that cannot be replaced, students should use direct quotation instead.

Although in the definition the act of plagiarizing sounds more on deliberate action, the causes may vary. According to Harvey (1998, p. 22) possible causes of plagiarism could be:

a. A student that is truly confused about the rules of acknowledgement

b. A student who deliberately plagiarizes because he or she simply does not care about a course

c. A student who starts with good intentions but finally fails to maintain his or her spirit in writing, gets tired and gets careless while taking notes. He or she has neither the time nor the inclination to resist the blurring.
The most worrying is students doing unintentional plagiarism. This is because the students do not mean any harm with not attaching the source’s information. They are just simply ignorant. Therefore, it is the task of both lecturers and the students to improve the student’s knowledge on writing correct and proper citation. The lecturer can find any technique to teach how to write quotation for the students in class and the students can find other way of learning by themselves from other sources if the lecturer has only limited time in class to teach how to write quotation.

A way to discourage plagiarism is simply by citing. Another way could be in the form of giving punishment as the consequences of doing plagiarism. The consequences can be in the form of an ‘E’ mark or failing a course. But this consequence should be discussed by the lecturers in order to find the agreement to be applied in the writing classes.

4. Writing Direct Quotations

It is true that direct quotation is the easiest way to write quotation which most students are more comfortable with. The main idea of direct quotation is picking the words or sentences from a source and writing them down in quotation marks. Although it is easier and safer from plagiarism, a writer must be wise in deciding to use direct quotation. Direct quotation is used only when there are specific terms or words that cannot be replaced by simpler words. Harvey in his study (1998, p.5) also made clear some of the reasons needed for writing direct quotation: “the source author has made a point so clearly and concisely that it cannot be expressed any
better.” Therefore, a writer must be selective and chooses only the quotations that are really important and essential to support the argument.

Using too many direct quotations can bring disadvantages for the writer. Firstly, it shows that the writer does not understand the material that he is studying. It is the writer’s job to provide clear explanation for the readers. How would he do it without having a deep comprehension of the material? Although some books do have difficult diction, most of the books use everyday language that can be understood quite easily and replaced by the writer’s own words. Secondly, excessive use of direct quotations is a sign that the source is overwhelming the writing. A student probably thinks that taking many quotations shows that his writing is reliable because it is supported by many experts. In fact, taking too many quotations implicates that it is not his writing but the experts’. Hubbuch (1982) pointed out that this is where the students are “used by the sources.” The real point of view of the student blurs as his writing is overcrowded by others’ opinions and ideas.

In conclusion, students should be careful in deciding to write direct quotations. They should choose the words that are really important and significant. It is better if they take only some phrases and then combine it with their own words rather than putting all sentences at once when it is not necessary. Quotation marks must always accompany the direct quotations. Otherwise, it can be counted as plagiarism (Spatt, 1999; Trimmer, 2010). However, the best way to write quotations is by combining the right amount of direct quotations and paraphrasing or summarizing.
5. Paraphrasing and Summarizing

Both paraphrasing and summarizing have the same idea. They both are meant “to describe a brief restatement of the author’s ideas in your own words” (Trimmer, 2010, p. 24). If a paraphrase pays “close attention to a particular section of a text”, a summary takes the “broad and general” side of the text taking just some important points to present (Neville, 2010, p.38). Paraphrase is usually used for short passage, while summary is for relatively long passage. In specific, summary may change the structure of the passage if necessary and may also involve interpretation of the writer (Spatt, 1999). To make a good paraphrase or a summary, a writer must first understand the content of the passage so that later he can reformulate the main idea of the passage into his own words. By paraphrasing, a writer shows his competence and deep comprehension of the material he is studying. Although paraphrasing is the better way to write quotation, most students often find it difficult and tricky. Students often mistake paraphrasing to simply replacing some of the words with the synonym but leaving the structure of the sentence in the original version. Paraphrasing is also more prone to plagiarism since the students can use it as a way to claim that the words are theirs, though they get the idea from someone else. One thing to remember is that whenever any kind of information is borrowed or taken from a source, a citation must be enclosed with it.

To have a good paraphrasing skill starts from having good reading skill. In reading course, students are taught to read a passage and understand the main idea. As the extension of this understanding is paraphrasing, that is rewriting the sentences
in their own words. In many occasions, the process halts at reading and understanding the source. Some students who are able to understand sometimes just do not know how to change it into their own words. The lack of confidence may create the apprehension. Students are afraid if they get too far from the main idea or they miss a point or two from the original passage. This often results in what Hubbuch called as “illegitimate paraphrase” (1982). Students should always remember that the main purpose of paraphrasing is “to change unusual language into words that are more meaningful in order to increase comprehension of the author’s ideas…so that ultimately you could express your understanding of the author’s ideas” (Hubbuch, 1982, p. 179). If only some words are replaced, how can that shows that the writer has gained an understanding of the material? Moreover, how can that help the readers get what the material is about?

Students do need a lot of practice to finally be able to produce a fine paraphrase. Spatt (1999) proposed guidelines for paraphrasing a difficult passage:

a. Find the meanings of difficult words in the dictionary. Do not forget to see the context of the passage whether some words contain specific terms.

b. Write a literal paraphrase by “substituting appropriate synonyms” for the words in the passage.

c. Write a free paraphrase. In this stage, a writer tries to use his own words and phrases but still consulting the literal paraphrase. The original passage should be put aside.

d. Read the free paraphrase aloud and feel if it sounds good and understandable.
The guidelines above are one of so many guidelines proposed by experts. Students can find other guidelines that they think are easier to follow. In practicing how to make a good paraphrase, students can work together with peers or if possible with seniors in order to check the product of paraphrasing. Others can provide feedback whether the paraphrase is understandable and presented within different words and structure. Practicing to paraphrase must be done in exclusive time. It is better for the students to practice it before they start writing. That way, the things which deal with quoting will not consume the time needed to write the composition.

Hubbuch (1982) also added some rules to be applied in making summary which can also be applied in making paraphrase. The first one is about making clear which one is the writer’s perception or interpretation and which one is the author’s. Introduce the author’s ideas by mentioning the name e.g. “According to X,” or “Y argued that...”. To mark the writer’s own ideas, the phrases such as “It may be argued that...” or “Another perspective on this topic is that...” can be used (Neville, 2010, p. 102). The second one is always remember to give citation at the end of a summary or a paraphrase. Sometimes students are tempted not to give citation because they think that those are, after all, their words. However, the ideas behind the summary or a paraphrase still belong to the author’s. Failing to do this will also count as plagiarism.
B. Theoretical Framework

As one of the preparation for writing thesis, Academic Essay Writing class is the first stage where students learn to compose essays under the conventions of academic writing. In order to write a good essay, students need to collect information necessary to support their writing. The information may come from many sources including books and internet. However, students must be careful in utilizing this information in their papers. Students should follow the rules in citing sources; otherwise they can be accused of doing plagiarism.

This research was designed to analyze the problems that the students have in citing sources. The sources can be in the form of books or internet articles. The rules in APA Style Manual 6th edition were used as the standard of the correct format of in-text citations and references. The guidelines on how to write appropriate quotation were used to check the students’ understanding and considerations in writing quotations. One of the potential problems that most students would probably have was with paraphrasing. Thus, the researcher provided the guidelines on how to make a good paraphrase by Spatt (1999). Last but not least, the theories on plagiarism were added to make clear what mistakes in quoting are counted as plagiarism. It was expected that all theories could work together in helping the researcher find the answer to the research problem.
CHAPTER III

METHODOLOGY

This chapter presents an overall research methodology used in processing this research. They include research method, research participants, research instruments, data gathering technique, data analysis technique, and research procedure.

A. Research Method

Qualitative study was used as the approach of this research. It was more suitable because “qualitative researchers study things in their natural settings, attempting to make sense of, or interpret, phenomena in terms of the meaning people bring to them.” (Denzin and Lincoln, 2005 as cited in Merriam, 2009) This study did not manipulate the process of learning. It sought the problems in the learning by investigating the product of the learning process that is the students’ works.

Because this study used students’ papers as the data, the method falls specifically into one of qualitative research types that is document analysis. Ary et al. (2002) defined document analysis as “a research method applied to written or visual materials for purpose of identifying specified characteristics of the material”. The “written materials” in this study are the students’ works, while the “specified characteristics” here are the problems in writing quotations. Further, Ary et al. added the purpose of content analysis which is “to analyze types of
errors in students’ writings” as another reason for applying document analysis as the method for this study.

In addition, this research also employed survey research as the minor research method. As Wiersma pointed out, surveys are “used to measure attitudes, opinions, or achievements – any number of variables in natural setting (1995, p. 196).” This survey research was only used to gain extra information to complement the data from the students’ papers. It was intended to investigate students’ opinions and considerations on quotations and plagiarism, which also play parts in citing.

B. Research Participants

The participants involved in this research were students of Academic Essay Writing Classes in the academic year of 2011 – 2012. The total numbers of students were 160 and they were divided into five classes. Three classes were chosen with total participants of 77 students.

There were two considerations behind the researcher’s decision in holding the research in Academic Essay Writing class. First, Academic Essay Writing is the first stage where students learn to compose academic essays. Writing an academic essay requires ideas from experts to support students’ point of view. Therefore, it is crucial for the students to learn how to cite properly in order not to plagiarize other people’s work. Second, as for being the second stage for students to learn citing after the introduction in Paragraph Writing class, lecturers will find the research beneficial by seeing the results. If the result reveals that students find
difficulties in citing, lecturers can revise or add materials or techniques in teaching. It is hoped that students can write better and more effectively in the early stage of writing before they go further to writing more important documents such as journals or thesis. This is also for preventing the students to take major and general mistakes to the next level of writing.

C. Research Instruments

Two instruments were used in this research. The first instrument was the questionnaire. The questionnaires were aimed at checking students’ comprehension on writing quotations and the concept of plagiarism. Two types of questions were used in the questionnaires, namely close-ended questions and open-ended questions (Ary, Jacobs, and Razavieh, 2002). Close-ended questions were questions which answers come in alternatives and students were expected to choose the answer that they thought best describes what they know. In open-ended questions, students were free to write their own answers. Therefore, students could give various answers freely according to their own opinions.

The second instrument was the standard rules of citation provided by the APA. Since the English Language Education Study Program adopted APA documentation style in Sarjana Pendidikan Thesis and Final Paper Guidelines, the researcher used APA Publication Manual 6th edition as the standard to examine whether the students make proper citation.
D. Data Gathering Technique

After asking permission to conduct research in Academic Essay Writing class, firstly, the researcher distributed the questionnaires to the students. The result provided some insights of the students’ understanding about plagiarism and writing quotations. The second step was collecting students’ works for the second progress test. The researcher copied the works and kept the copied works to be studied while the original ones were returned to the lecturers.

E. Data Analysis Technique

Since there were two kinds of data collected from the students, first of all, the researcher analyzed the documents from the students. The researcher searched for errors in citations that most of the students did. Later on, the researcher listed the major problems that the students faced when citing and added some examples from the students’ papers for each of the problems. After the analysis of the students’ papers was finished, the researcher continued analyzing the questionnaire. From the questionnaires, it could be concluded whether the students understood the concept of plagiarism. The questions in the questionnaires also tried to find out the difficulties that they had when writing quotations and their awareness about using quotations properly in their papers. The result came in two kinds of answers; the fixed answers from the closed-ended questions and the free answers from the open-ended questions. The fixed answers were analyzed by calculating the total percentage. The open answers were analyzed one by one as the way they are. The researcher looked if
there were similarities in the answers so that categorization was made out of them. The conclusion from the questionnaire added complementary information to the conclusion from the students’ papers to describe the problems students had in citing.

F. Research Procedure

In doing this research, there were some steps to be accomplished. They are as follows:

1. Finding the topic of the research

The researcher read all kinds of sources including books, journals, and thesis written by alumni of ELESP to gain some insights of what might be problematic in learning English. The researcher then decided to dig in the skill of writing. Specifically, the researcher wanted to find out the difficulties and problems in documenting sources in writing.

2. Reviewing literature

After the topic had been determined, the researcher went into the next step that is reviewing literature. It dealt with finding theories as the ground for the research. Sources came not only from books but also from the internet.

3. Constructing questionnaires

The next phase was constructing questionnaires. In order to find answers to the problem formulation, the researcher needed to make several questions to be asked to the students. The questions should be related to the theories as well.
4. Distributing questionnaire

The questionnaires, then, were ready to be distributed. After asking the permission to conduct research in Academic Essay Writing classes, the researcher distributed questionnaires to be filled by all the students in three classes. This step was made before analyzing students’ works to see their prior knowledge of plagiarism and quotations.

5. Gathering students’ works

The researcher then borrowed the students’ papers from the lecturers to copy. These works later were analyzed.

6. Analyzing data

The questionnaires and the documents from the students then were analyzed. The students’ works were analyzed first and continued by the questionnaires.

7. Making conclusion

The final conclusion was made over the two analysis results to answer the previous problem formulation.
CHAPTER IV

RESEARCH RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

In this chapter, the researcher presents two parts of the research namely the data and the analysis of the data. The data presented here were the result of the questionnaire and the list of citing problems found in the students’ work. Discussion includes the analysis of the questionnaire and the students’ work.

A. Data Presentation

In the data presentation, all findings from the document analysis and the questionnaire are exposed in the forms of points and tables. The analysis follows in the data analysis part.

1. Data from the Students’ Papers

The students’ papers were used to see the application of how students wrote quotation and whether they had followed the standard in citation. Five papers were taken from each class as the example. There were 15 papers to represent three classes. The papers were submitted as the second progress test in Academic Essay Writing class. The theme of the essay is problem and solution. After having permission from the lecturers, the researcher copied the papers and the original ones were returned to the lecturers.

In analyzing the papers, the first step to do was checking the in-text citation and the format of references in the students’ papers. This step was done first because
it only required matching the format that the students had with the format in the APA Style Manual as well as the PBI Thesis guidelines. Then, the incorrect formats were noted down. The next step was checking the papers one by one to see the students’ application of citing. The citations in the paragraph were matched with the references to see if they corresponded. Then, the researcher checked the citation which accompanied indirect quotation. This step was done to see whether the paraphrases were really the students’. It involved a long process because the researcher had to check all the available sources to match it with the students’ writing. The process of finding all available sources were also used to see whether the students had done copying and pasting or in other words, plagiarizing. The problems that appeared in most papers were noted down and collected.

In collecting the problems in writing quotation, the researcher used a table to check and compare all fifteen papers. Below is the table of students’ problems in citing.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Problems in citing sources</th>
<th>Papers no.</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Incorrect format of in-text citations</td>
<td>1,2,5,6,9,11,13</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Incorrect format of references</td>
<td>1,2,3,4,6,9,10,13,14,15</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Overuse of direct quotation</td>
<td>2,11</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lack correspondence between in-text citations and references</td>
<td>5,7,8,9,10,11,12</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Later, each problem will be explained deeper in the data analysis. Examples of student problem will also be provided.

2. Data from the Questionnaire

The questionnaire was distributed in November 2011. From five classes of Academic Essay Writing, three classes were chosen as the participant. Each class consisted of 25 to 30 students. To keep the anonymity of the class and the lecturers, the classes were named class A, B, and C. In the day of the distribution of the questionnaire, some students were absent. The questionnaire returned from class A were 24, class B were 26, and class C were 27. The total number of the students participated in answering the questionnaire were 77 students.

Questionnaire in this research was meant to dig more information on students’ way in writing quotation. It helped to answer the reason behind the students’ consideration in using a type of quotation. It also helped to see whether the students were aware of their decision in using a certain type of quotation or they just do it randomly, without any deep understanding on the material. Students cannot decide to use direct quotation all the time just because it is easier. There are reasons underlying the choice to use direct quotation or indirect quotation.
There were six questions in the questionnaire. Two of them were in the form of close-ended questions while the rest were open-ended questions. Close-ended questions here were used to see the tendency of the students in citing and writing quotation and the open-ended were the ones to provide more complete and clearer explanation. The result of close-ended questions is presented in the form of tables and percentage. Analysis was then made from the numbers of the percentage. The open-ended questions require categorization first to see the major answers and the minor answers. These answers then would also be presented in the form of tables and percentage, and finally the conclusion was made.

Below are the close-ended questions and the percentage of the answers in the form of table:

Question 1: Where did you learn citation from?

The purpose of this question is to find out where the students learn citation from; whether they learn from and rely only to the lecturer in class, whether they learned from the lecturer and find other sources to learn by themselves, or whether they found the teacher uninformative in terms of giving material of how to cite and they did autonomy learning from sources outside of the class.
Table 4.2. Sources where students learned citation from

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Answers</th>
<th>Class A</th>
<th>Class B</th>
<th>Class C</th>
<th>Total</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>From the lecturer only</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>28.57</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>From the lecturer and other sources</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>42</td>
<td>54.54</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>From other sources only</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>16.89</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>24</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>77</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

It can be seen in the table that most of the students (54.54 %) were using many sources to learn from. The expectation would be the more sources they could learn from, the better their understanding about citation and plagiarism.

Question 2: What was the type of quotation that mostly you used in your work?

The purpose of this question is to find out the type of quotation that they tend to use when writing a paper. The tendency of one style only shows that the students have limited knowledge of proper quoting.

Table 4.3. The preferred citing style of students

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Answers</th>
<th>Class A</th>
<th>Class B</th>
<th>Class C</th>
<th>Total</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Direct quotation</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>23.37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Indirect quotation</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>6.50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Combined (direct and indirect)</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>54</td>
<td>70.13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>24</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>77</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The result showed that most students (70.13%) had already understood that the variation in quotation is needed. They could not rely on just one type of citing. Although direct quotation is easier, its use must be limited since its overuse shows the incapability of comprehending the source. Combining direct quotation and paraphrasing or summary is the best way.

After the close-ended questions were presented, now the data presentation continues to the open-ended questions. There were four open-ended questions in the questionnaire. They were aimed at providing freedom for the students to answer. Generally, the open-ended questions were used to seek personal perceptions of the students in an unlimited variation of answers:

Question 3: What were your considerations for choosing direct quotation, indirect quotation, or combined?

This question complemented Question 2 to dig deeper on their awareness in choosing the type of quotation. The answers would show whether they understand how to use two types of quotation wisely. If in Question 2 the students picked direct quotation as the quotation that they used more frequent, the answers in Question 3 showed the reasons behind those choices from the students. Before putting the answers in the form of table, the researcher categorized the answers based on the main ideas.
Table 4.4. Students’ considerations for choosing direct quotation

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Answers</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. It is easier (word-per-word quotation within quotation marks plus info on the author’s name and date of publication).</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. The points of quotation are clear for no alteration is made in the original sentence.</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. It is a risk-free way from plagiarism.</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. No reason/unclear reason</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

There were 18 students out of 77 students who picked direct quotation as the preferred quotation (23.37%). From the table above, the number one reason why direct quotation is the preferred way of citing is because it is practical and easy. Direct quotation, as explained in the theory, involves verbatim copy of a quotation written in quotation marks completed with the information on the last name of the author and the year of publication written in brackets. There is no change in the words; students do not need to sweat on paraphrasing the sentences. However, the use of it should be limited.
Table 4.5. Students’ considerations for choosing indirect quotation

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Answers</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. It allows the writers to develop the idea so that it is more</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>understandable for the readers.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. It shows the competence of the writer</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

There were only five out of 77 students who chose indirect quotation (0.71%). What was expected from this question was that the students knew the benefits of using indirect quotation. Of course it was not expected that a student use indirect quotation all the time. Therefore, the answers to the next questions below were the complementary of this question.

Table 4.6. Students’ considerations for choosing combination of direct and indirect quotation

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Answers</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. It is important (without explaining the reason).</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. It is used to make variation to the paper.</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. It depends on the easiness of the main idea to understand, the</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>length and the topic of the paragraph.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. It depends on the ideas or words to be emphasized (strong</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>words kept original, others will be paraphrased)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
5. It is to show the level of understanding.  
6. Other answers (not answering or irrelevant answers)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Answers</th>
<th>Total</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. The rules/format of citation</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>44.17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. No (significant) difficulties</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>15.58</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

There were 54 out of 77 students who chose combining direct and indirect quotation as the preferred way of quoting. From the table, it can be seen that only seven students (point number 4) who really understand the concept of the use of direct and indirect quotation. It is only 9.09% from total 77 students. It can be concluded that the students of Academic Essay Writing did not have sufficient knowledge on how to use quotation properly. They only knew that both quotations are important but could not explain the reason behind it. Some of the reasons were not relevant.

Question 4: What were the difficulties of writing direct quotation?

This question was to provide explanation on the problems that the student had in writing direct quotation. The result or the answers are described in the table below:
The major problem that most students (44.17%) had is with the rules or format of citation. This phenomenon explains later finding in the students’ papers which is the problem of writing incorrect format of citation and references. Second major students (15.58%) admitted that they had no difficulties in writing direct quotation since it involves only copying and pasting with adding quotation marks and the information about the source. However, the use of direct quotation must be limited.

Question 5: What were the difficulties of writing indirect quotation?

This question was to provide explanation on the problems that the student had in writing indirect quotation (paraphrase and summary). The result or the answers are described in the table below:

<p>| | | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3. Understanding the meaning</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>7.80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Tailoring with the student’s own words in a paragraph</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>11.68</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Choosing the important and suitable quotation</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>7.80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Others</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>12.97</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>77</td>
<td>100.00</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 4.8. Difficulties of writing indirect quotation

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Answers</th>
<th>Total</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Paraphrasing process</td>
<td>65</td>
<td>84.43%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Others</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>15.57%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>77</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The percentage for the major students (84.43%) is quite big. It means that almost all students had problems in paraphrasing process. They had difficulties in understanding the idea and changing it into their own words. Some students even stated that they were apprehensive when they had to paraphrase since they did not know whether they had made the proper paraphrase or not. If it was not written properly, they were afraid of being accused of doing plagiarism. Some of the students also stated that they were not sure whether they had made a good paraphrase which still conveys the original message. Sometimes the ideas were hard to understand, moreover to be paraphrased.

Question 6: What do you know about plagiarism?

This question is meant to dig on the students’ understanding of the concept of plagiarism. Most students have already had the general idea of plagiarism that is copying and pasting someone else’s work and use it as one’s own. However, some students gave shallow answers that may lead to plagiarism. Here are the examples:

- “Plagiarism is a copy-paste without editing and without giving the sources.”
• “copy and paste without any changing”

• “We copy and paste somebody’s work exactly the same.”

The answers above indicated the students’ misunderstanding. The students who wrote those statements did not understand that even though the words are altered, the author’s name should also be mentioned. Plagiarism is not only about the using of others’ exact words, it is more about the ideas of the author. Students should understand that a paraphrase from other’s work must also be accompanied by citation, or else, it can be counted as plagiarism.

B. Data Analysis and Discussion

After all papers were compared and all frequent problems were classified, the next process was to elaborate each problem and seek the answers for the research problem. The problems of citing were displayed one by one with the example, and the final result would be connecting the analysis of the papers to the analysis of the questionnaire so that later a conclusion can be made.

1. Students’ problems in citing based on the students’ papers analysis

   a. Incorrect format of in-text citations

   From fifteen students, six of them made mistakes in writing the in-text citations. What described as incorrect format of in-text citation falls on several categories:
1) Incomplete citations

Some students did not know that according to APA Style and PBI Thesis Guidelines, a direct quotation must always be accompanied by the page number of the book or paragraph number from an online source where the statement was taken. Here is the example found in paper 6:

> something to overcome the misbehaviour that happens in the classroom. Burden and Byrd (2010) said: “Teachers should develop challenging, interesting and exciting lessons and threaten students with dignity and respect”. Hence, the

The students should have stated the page number directly after the year or after the quotation marks.

2) Incorrect format of block quotation

Another mistake that the students made in writing in-text citation is in writing block quotation. Here is the example from paper 2:

> “Meanwhile, practice to write the phonetic of the words will also helpful because it will help them to remember the sounds of the words including understand the sound and differentiate the stress because understanding the meaning do not necessarily occur sequentially; they may occur simultaneously, in rapid succession, or backward and forward as needed” (Van Dozer, 1997, p 3). Then listening to the audio and

According to the rule of APA Style and PBI Thesis Guidelines, quotation that consists of more than 40 words or more then four lines should be written inside indentation without quotation marks. Here are the other examples:
Paper 5

Based on Armbruster (2002), most of the existing research on vocabulary focuses on how students “naturally” acquire word knowledge and how instruction facilitate learning particular vocabulary from particular texts. Therefore, we think the intent of the competency is that teachers should use effective instructional techniques and strategies to help children learn new words and acquire greater knowledge of partially known words from classroom materials (p. 62).

Paper 9

Nearly everyone responds well to stories—that’s why even the news is given in story shapes. ("What’s the story on the fire downtown?") This is because the story is simply the main tool we have for organizing content in a way that brings out its emotional force, and delivers information to engage the emotions of the hearer (personal communication, October 10, 2009).

Another example from two papers showed that the student wrote block quotation in italic and smaller fonts. The correct form is writing it with the normal font.

3) Incorrect punctuation in the citation

As seen in paper 9 below, the student wrote the page number after a colon. It should be written after a comma, followed by the year of publication.

In teaching grammar for elementary school student, teacher should use simple way to build students’ understanding of grammar. It because students can get easily bored (Harmer: 82). A good classroom that does
b. Incorrect format of references

The problem that had become the major problem of the students was incorrect format of references. From fifteen students, ten students wrote the complete source in an incorrect way. Here are the examples:

Paper 6


Most students had been inconsistent in writing the format of a source in the references list. From paper 6, it can be seen that actually the student know how to write the correct form, but there was a lack of thorough recheck from the student. The year of publication which should be written inside brackets was not put inside brackets. This problem of inconsistency also appeared in this paper:

Paper 15


Some students did not put brackets for the year of publication as what is recommended by APA Style:
The students who wrote paper 2 and 4 above also did not write the correct place of publication. Instead of writing the city or the state, they wrote the country (United States of America and England).

Some students did not arrange the order of the initial of the last name of the author based on alphabets.
Paper 3


Most students also write the title of the books or articles with all initial words capitalized. In the APA Style Manual, the title should be written in sentence case format (only the first letter of the sentence is capitalized)

Example: Paper 5


The correct format should be:


Illinois: Charles C. Thomas Publisher

There were also students who did not write the title of the book in italic. On the other hand, the student italicized the place of publication and the publisher which is incorrect:


Here is the other example:


Another problem that the students had was writing electronic sources. Some students did not write complete information of a source. Here is the example:

The student who wrote paper 1 did not put the title of the paper. This was surely a result of carelessness. The student might lose track of the source.

A student had been very ignorant and careless so that he or she put this kind of references list:

Paper 10


Some students still wrote the terms “Publisher, Company, and Inc.” whereas those words should be omitted. The exception is on university presses and associations.


Overall, the incorrect format of references could have been easily avoided if only the students consulted the manual or guidelines.

c. Overuse of direct quotation

Two students had problems with using direct quotation. They used direct quotation in bulk. Here is the example:

As seen in paper 11, the student used direct quotation in an improper way. Instead of making paraphrase or choosing the important words and main idea, he or she put all the sentences in the paragraph. The direct quotation in the last paragraph was not even put as block quotation. Another example:
Paper 2

The next problem is caused by pronunciation problem. Being able to write the phonetic of the words will help the students easier to remember the sounds of the words itself because “Phonetic instruction and phonemic transcription on students’ listening ability regardless of the wash back effect of the exams so as to achieve the long-term goals of improving English” (Ghorbani, 2010 p 25). “Pronunciation is an integrated and integral part of second or foreign language learning since it directly affects learners’ communicative competence as well as performance to a substantial extent” (Miller, 2007 p 6) The ability of differentiate the sounds of English will help the students to understand the meaning of words and sentences. For example, the ending low tone of sentences indicates statement sentences while the increase ending tone indicates the question statement.

Inside the paragraph, the student put two direct quotations in a row without any narration or explanation. It is difficult to understand the flow of the ideas. What can be concluded from this paper is that the student did not know how to explain the material so that he or she put all the sentences as the way they were and let them speak for themselves.

The problem of overusing direct quotation happened because the students did not know what considerations lie behind the decision to use direct or indirect quotation. As explained in the theoretical description, direct quotation is only used when the writer cannot find other words that better describe what the author meant. It is about precise and specific terms and language that if they were altered, they would lose their essence. However, if the sentences are easy to understand and do not contain specific term or language, it is better for the students to paraphrase or
summary so that the reader can comprehend the material. This problem happened because the students did not have the skill to paraphrase. They become so unconfident in translating the message into their own words and chose to stick with the original words of the author. To overcome this problem, students can practice paraphrasing more often and find the guidelines in making paraphrase. Students can also practice paraphrasing in groups to have a peer feedback. Students can review each other paraphrase and see whether it is understandable and acceptable.

d. Lack correspondence between in-text citations and references

Seven out of fifteen papers were found to have lack of correspondence between the source in-text citations and references. Some papers have sources that appeared in the references but did not appear in the text. If this case happened, maybe the title “references” could be replaced by the word “bibliography”. It is because in the APA Style Manual, the term “references” means all the sources that are cited in the text, in the other hand, “bibliography” consists of works that could be cited or just reviewed to give inspiration or additional information.

There were also some sources that appeared in the text but did not appear in the references. After being tracked down, some sources were secondary sources that the students did not put the words “as cited in…”. The students might also forget to write the sources in the references list.
e. Case of plagiarism

From examining fifteen papers, the researcher finally found some students who did plagiarism. There are two kinds of plagiarism that is meant in this part. The first one is mentioning the direct quotation without putting the quotation marks around them. The rules varied in countries and institutions, though. However, it is clear that APA Style Manual and PBI Thesis Guidelines mentioned that all direct quotation must be put inside quotation marks. That way, the original words of the author are still respected. In additional, what is called as paraphrasing is using the writer’s own words. If direct quotation is treated the same with paraphrase, it means that the writer claims that the sentences inside the paragraph are his. This case would also be categorized as stealing or more specifically, plagiarism. Three students were found doing this kind of plagiarism. Here is the example:

Paper 7

According to Stuart Campbell (1998), translating into a second language is clearly very different from translating into the first language. Campbell’s (1998) study showed that in translating from a second language, the main difficulty is in comprehending the source text; it is presumably much easier marshal one’s first language resources to come up with a natural looking target text. In translating into a second language, comprehension of the source text is the easier aspect; the real difficulty is in producing a target text in a language in which composition does not come naturally. He also assumes at the outset that perfectly balanced bilinguals are so rarely found that virtually all human translation activity falls into one of the two categories – into or from the second language.

Below is the original text from Campbell, Stuart. (1988). Translation into the second language. New York: Longman to compare:
The two activities are in a way mirror images. In translating from a second language, the main difficulty is in comprehending the source text; it is presumably much easier to marshal one’s first language resources to some up with a natural looking target text. In translating into a second language, comprehension of the source text is the easier aspect; the real difficulty is in producing a target text in a language in which composition does not come naturally. It is probably wise to assume at the outset that perfectly balanced bilinguals are so rarely found that virtually all human translation activity falls into one of the two categories – into or from the second language.

It can be seen that the student took all paragraph to be put in his or her first paragraph. Although the student gave information about the source, he or she did not put quotation marks around the direct quotation. That is a plagiarism, and it happened to paper 1 and 9 as well.

The second kind of plagiarism is the straight plagiarism itself. The student deliberately copied and pasted from the source. He or she did put some citation but those were not adequate. Here is the example:

Paper 12

Students have no clear information about which the teacher is explaining. They do not understand what and why they should do. To help the students to know what and why they should do, the teacher should spend more time explaining why the materials are taught, and why the topic, approach, and activity is important, interesting, and worthwhile. The teacher should explain more exactly what is expected on an assignment and activity. Thereby, the students will understand how they should place themselves during the class to reach the goal that has been made.

.... Some recent research shows that many students do poorly on assignments or in participation because they do not understand what to do or why they should do it. Teachers should spend more time explaining why we teach what we do, and why the topic or approach or activity is important and interesting and worthwhile. In the process, some of the teacher's enthusiasm will be transmitted to the students, who will be more likely to become interested....

It can be seen from the paper and the original text that the student did what is Harvey (1998) called “mosaic plagiarism”. In this plagiarism, the student took some sentences from a source and mixed them with his or her own words.

2. Students’ problems in citing based on the students’ answers in the questionnaire

There were some points that could be made based on the analysis of the questionnaire:

a. The biggest percentage of the students (42 from 77 or 54.54%) stated that they learned quotations not only from the lecturers but also from other sources such as books, internet websites, handouts, and other forms of sources. The implication was the more sources that the students could learn from, the better understanding and the more knowledge they had. However, attention must be paid to the other percentage of the students which were relatively significant. Twenty two out of seventy seven students (28.57%) admitted that they only counted on the lecturers to
learn about citations. These students should be more proactive in searching materials about citation so that they could have more sources to learn and better results in citing. Thirteen out of seventy seven students (16.89%) admitted that they learned citations only from other sources. What could be implied from this is that perhaps the materials given from the lecturer were not enough covering what needed to be studied so that the students did autonomy learning outside the class.

b. Most students (54 from 77 or 70.13%) had already understood about the need to combine direct and indirect quotations in composing a good essay. Nevertheless, the understanding was not followed by the right reasons. Only 7 out of 77 students (9.09%) who really understood the precise reason. In the theoretical description, Hubbuch pointed out that taking too many direct quotations will only show that it is the original author of the source who did the essay and not the writer. Harvey (1998) also added that a direct quotation is used whenever the sentences in the source “cannot be expressed any better”. The alteration of the words may cause the sentence to lose its original meaning. Therefore, a direct quotation is used if there are strong or significant words from the author that cannot be replaced. The rest of the quotations should be in the form of paraphrases or summaries to show the comprehension of the writer.

c. Direct and indirect quotations have their own difficulties. In order to maximize the learning, an anticipation of their difficulties must be prepared. The biggest difficulty in writing direct quotations was the formats of citations following
the direct quotations. It is because the standard of citations has many formats. Consulting the manual at the same time they were rushing to meet the deadline might be time consuming. However, second major answers stated that the students had no significant difficulties in writing direct quotations.

It appeared that paraphrasing process in writing indirect quotations was the biggest difficulty. Sixty five out of 77 students agreed on that. Some students revealed that they were unconfident in paraphrasing. They were afraid if their paraphrases got too far from the original meaning of a source.

In conclusion, students’ problems in citing sources based on the questionnaires were the formats of citations and the paraphrasing process.

d. From the students’ answers in the questionnaires, it can be concluded that although the students had already understood the idea of plagiarism, their understanding was still on the surface level. Some students thought that plagiarism is only verbatim copy without acknowledgement. In fact, there are many definitions and types of plagiarism. Direct quotations without quotation marks can be concluded as plagiarism (Spatt, 1999; Trimmer, 2010). A paraphrase or summary without acknowledgement is also plagiarism. This finding was proven in the papers. There were still cases of plagiarism in the papers. It means that the students did not have sufficient knowledge about plagiarism and they were still prone to plagiarism. After all, there were various reasons and conditions why plagiarism still happened even though the writer already knew about it.
CHAPTER V

CONCLUSION AND SUGGESTION

In this final chapter, all the analysis of the research problem is concluded. Suggestions were also made by the researcher to give contribution to the better teaching and learning of citing.

A. Conclusion

This research is aimed to investigate students’ problems in citing sources in Academic Essay class. The formulated research question was: “What are the students’ problems in citing sources?” In order to answer this question, a research was held in Academic Essay class of the academic year 2011-2012.

After the data were retained and analysis was made, what can be concluded were that:

1. Students had problems in writing quotations especially in the format of citations following direct quotations and in paraphrasing indirect quotations.

2. Students’ main problems revealed from the students’ papers were incorrect format of in-text citations, incorrect format of references, and lack of correspondence between in-text citations and references.

3. Students were whether uninformed or careless or run out of time when writing their papers. As a result, they made improper citations and quotations and plagiarism still happened in the papers.
B. Suggestion

Suggestions with relevance to the topic of writing quotations were aimed to lecturers, students, and future researchers.

1. Lecturers

As the one in charge of directing the students to learn, it is the lecturers’ task to provide students with more chance of learning to write quotations. The most crucial need in this area is to learn to make a good paraphrase. Learning to paraphrase can be taught in early stage of reading course. After all, paraphrasing is about understanding the main idea of text which is the heart of reading course. Lecturers are also expected to create better strategies for improving students’ skill of citing by autonomy learning. If there is not enough time to discuss the materials of citing in class, lecturers can assign students to learn outside the class. References of books and web addresses can also be chosen by the lecturers so that all students can have the equal source of knowledge. It is even better if there are quizzes in class to check whether the students study citations at home or not.

2. Students

Students should also be proactive in learning citations. They should not always count on lecturers to learn something. Moreover, the materials about citations and writing quotations are many which make it difficult to be discussed all in class. Students can form a study group to learn about citations together outside the class. Students are expected to be more careful when composing essays, always cite the
source they use, and consult the guidelines or style manual to produce correct citations.

3. Future researchers

The researcher hoped that this research inspires other researchers to dig deeper in the problems of citing in the future. It is expected that other researchers investigate more on what happens in the teaching and learning situations, what kind of strategies work best to maximize the learning of citation, what contribution can be given by students and teacher, etc.
REFERENCES


Boston: Scott, Foresman and Company.


Appendix 1: Questionnaire

Name: 
Student no.: 

Please answer these following questions:

1. Where did you learn citation from?
   - [ ] the lecturer in the classroom
   - [ ] books: ...........................................(mention the books)
   - [ ] internet: ...........................................(mention the websites)
   - [ ] handouts: ...........................................(mention the sources)
   - [ ] other (mention)............

2. There are two techniques of quoting that can be used in documenting sources. They are direct quotation (borrowing exact word-per-word of someone’s ideas) and indirect quotation (borrowing someone’s ideas and changing them into your own words) including paraphrasing and summarizing.
   What was the type of quotation that you used in your writing?
   - [ ] Direct quotation
   - [ ] Indirect quotation
   - [ ] Combined (direct and indirect)

3. What were your considerations for choosing direct quotation, indirect quotation, or combined?
   ........................................................................................................................................................................
   ........................................................................................................................................................................
   ........................................................................................................................................................................

PLAGIAT MERUPAKAN TINDAKAN TIDAK TERPUJI
4. What were the difficulties of writing direct quotation?

……………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………
……………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………
……………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………

5. What were the difficulties of writing indirect quotation?

……………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………
……………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………
……………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………

6. What do you know about plagiarism? Explain in your own understanding!

……………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………
……………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………
……………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………

*Thank you very much! Have a nice day and GBU!*
Appendix 2: Record of Students’ Answers for the Open Questions in the Questionnaire

3. What were the considerations for choosing DQ, IQ, or combined?
Class A (24 students)

1. To make myself clearly understood by my readers and most of all it will help me to gather some information needed and give me some ideas. (C)

2. It depends on the situation I think. If it’s better to use indirect, I will use indirect. However, if it’s proper to use direct, I will use it. (C)

3. We can’t admit or use something that is not ours. (C)

4. The difficulty in paraphrasing the idea. If it’s easy I will use indirect and vice versa. (C)

5. It depends on the easiness. If the idea is easily understood, I will paraphrase it, and vice versa. (C)

6. By combining I may take words from someone’s ideas and then combine it perfectly with my own words. (C)

7. Because three of them is important and it’s okay if I use three of them. (C)

8. I use combined quotation because I realize that both direct and indirect quotation are very important. So, I combine them together. (C)

9. By combining, I can explain the quotation to convey my argument but I also put the exact word-per-word of the quotation. It’s about the validity. (C)

10. Combined because it can make my writing more variously. (C)

11. I chose combined because I thought that if I only used or chose the direct one, it meant that I didn’t know the point of what I was going to quote well. (C)

12. Because when I use indirect, I can combine it with my own idea and I can develop it. (I)

13. Combine, because it depends on my writing essay. (C)

14. Direct quotations. (D)

15. Direct quotation is more easy. We don’t need to change anything. (D)

16. Choosing direct quotation can make clearly to be read. (D)

17. To make it simple and also if I use combined, it’s used for me to get an understanding about that quotation, because I can make it by my own words. (C)

18. Direct quotation is safer than other to avoid plagiarism. (D)

19. I think it is easier to copy paste or type, rather than make new words. (D)

20. I use direct quotation because it is more simple. (D)
21. My considerations about combined quotation is for the sake of changing styles in writing or oral reflections and speech that I often give. (C)
22. It was easy because we already have the example of the idea then we just need to quote it using our own word. (C)
23. It depends on the following sentences on my essays. If I want to add my information that I explained before, I’ll use indirect quotation. Sometimes when I saw the quotation is very long I’ll use direct quotation and I’ll explain it in the bottom. (C)
24. – (C)

Class B (26 students)

1. Because it’s the good way to take somebody’s words without doing any plagiarism.(I)
2. The most important is understanding. (C)
3. – (C)
4. The appropriate words with my context in writing.(C)
5. Using direct quotation is easier than using indirect quotation because we don’t have to paraphrase and summarize. However, sometimes we have to use indirect quotation.(C)
6. The topic of the writing.(C)
7. The appropriate words.(C)
8. Based on my topics, which is appropriate or not.(C)
9. It depends on the reading topic that become our reference to write an essay.(C)
10. I choose combined quotation in order to make variation. It will be so boring if I only use direct quotations or indirect quotations all the time.(C)
11. Because in combining the way we quote, we can choose the word whether important or not. Sometimes it depends on the situation, whether we choose direct or indirect quotation.(C)
12. The easiest one and more appropriate.(C)
13. It depends on my writing. Therefore I prefer to use combined quotation to make my writing more interesting.(C)
14. Based on what type of the writing that I want to do.(C)
15. I just try to fit it with my writing. Combined quotations are not monotonous.(C)
16. Diction.(C)
17. The content, related to the topic, the length of the sentences. (C)
18. The appropriateness with my writing. (C)
19. I like to develop the idea from the quotation not only adopt. (I)
20. If I use indirect quotation, I can use my own style in writing. (I)
21. Combined quotation. It will be more variate. (C)
22. Related to the topic, the length. (D)
23. The easiest one and the most understand concept (I’m sure about the usage). (D)
24. Based on the instruction what I have to do. (D)
25. I choose direct quotation because it’s the easiest way to write quotation. (D)
26. I choose direct quotation for I don’t need to paraphrase it. (D)

Class C (27 students)

1. Indirect quotation gives the freedom of arguing whereas direct quotation strengthens my argument better. (C)
2. To make it not monotonous. (C)
3. To avoid plagiarism. (C)
4. When I need supporting ideas from experts for my own opinion. (C)
5. Depends on the sentence length of the quotation. (C)
6. The variation of writing and the level of comprehension of the readers. (C)
7. No consideration. I mean when I want to quote I use both direct and indirect quotation. (C)
8. It is more easy than indirect quotation and combined q. (D)
9. Direct quotation because it is the easiest that we only copy and paste without change any words. (D)
10. It makes the writing more “scientific” and not boring because if we use only one method of quotation, then it’ll be monotonous. (C)
11. Depends on my need and my understanding of the statements. (C)
12. The length of the sentences that I need to quote. (C)
13. I choose combined quotation because sometimes I really need to quote directly and sometimes because the quotation is too long I only need to paraphrase the quotation (take idea). (C)
14. The consideration for direct quotation is the important point. (D)
15. To support my argument or opinion in writing. (C)
16. It depends in the idea itself. If it’s possible, I will choose indirect quotation. Otherwise, I will use direct quotation in my writing. (C)
17. To strengthen my idea by any supporting idea from any experts.(C)
18. To avoid monotonous way of writing the quotation, to challenge myself.(C)
19. It depends on my feeling what types of quoting that I want to use.(C)
20. To avoid plagiarism and to strengthen my arguments.(C)
21. To strengthen the context and avoiding plagiarism.(C)
22. Direct quotation is the easiest one.(D)
23. It depends on the idea the quotation has. I won’t paraphrase it if it has a strong idea which explanation I can’t directly refer to.(C)
24. I considered the difficult words or the words are difficult to understand.(I)
25. It is simplest way of quoting.(D)
26. Direct quotation = the easiest way to quote.(D)
27. If I chose direct quotation, it can be more understandable by the readers/reviewers who check my writing. Besides, it can support my writing well.(D)

4. What were the difficulties of writing DQ?
   Class A
   1. I can’t make much further explanation on the quotation and I can’t change the content of it but just to stick on it.
   2. It is difficult to write the detail of the source. We need to write the page, the number of the paragraph, etc.
   3. The way how we write the quotation itself. Since we can’t write it freely.
   4. I haven’t found a difficulty yet.
   5. If the statement is very long, it will be a ‘painful’ work to quote it.
   6. Sometimes feel not satisfied with those words.
   7. There are no difficulties because we just copy and paste.
   8. I think there were no big difficulties in it.
   9. Write the arrangement of punctuations correctly.
10. I think it’s not really difficult, perhaps the difficulty takes place in writing the direct quotation in a good way.
11. If the author was more than one, I would have difficulties to write the names of the authors.
12. To synchronize with my own idea.
13. I think it’s not really difficult.
14. The difficulties are to place the quotation, I mean where I should put the quotation.
15. Sometimes we forgot to write the source completely.
16. The difficulties of writing direct quotation are meaning, grammar, and writer’s purpose to write a quotation.
17. About the format of writing the correct quotation.
18. After the quotation actually, we have to give comment to the ideas.
19. We have to take a look at the words from the original sources, is there any mistypes or not.
20. When the sentences in the quotation is too long.
21. When I do not have the book or if I have not written it down in my notebook.
22. Sometimes we are afraid that we are claimed as plagiarism.
23. The format. I confuse to take the pages, name, etc.
24. Sometimes I confused and forgot how to write the sources.

Class B

1. Because it took time to analyze it per word and difficult to summarize when it comes to paraphrasing.
2. Sometimes it is difficult to understand the statement.
3. We don’t know exactly what is the writer’s purpose.
4. I feel difficult when I have to make a form to write direct quotation.
5. No difficulties.
6. Mentioning the source.
7. I think direct quotation is easy.
8. No difficulties.
9. The rules that used in writing a direct quotation, sometimes looks confusing. One teacher and another sometimes has different idea about it.
10. The difficulties are in terms if carefulness and accurateness. Sometimes I find it difficult to use correct form in quoting the statement or arguments.
11. The difficulties in writing direct quotation is sometimes we forgot several elements which should be added in quoting process.
13. Writing direct quotation is easy because we just copy-paste exact word-per-word of someone’s idea. Therefore there is no difficulty.
14. The systematic of how to write the direct quotation.
15. There is no difficulty (I think). We can just quote it word-per-word.
16. Find the meaning.
17. We have to make sure that the words are really the same.
18. To blend and match it with the previous writing.
19. When we’re gonna combine the quotation with our writing. Sometimes it looks like the quotation is not appropriate.
20. Mix the quotation with our writing. Sometimes it sounds weird.
21. Sometimes I forget the format to make.
22. Combining it on our essay. The length is too long, sometimes it might be out of the topic.
23. Finding the most appropriate quotation.
24. How to write it based on the structure.
25. The format of writing direct quotation.
26. The appropriate writing of name of someone whose quotation quoted.

Class C
1. Memorizing the rule.
2. We have to consider if the quotation more than 40 words, it must be in indented par.
3. The format of writing direct quotation.
4. How to cite or write the references.
5. Choose appropriate quotation for our writing.
6. When we have a long quotation.
7. Sometimes it is too long and sometimes I forgot to mention the page number.
8. Sometimes I confuse with the language that the writer used so I need to read more and more.
9. No difficulties if I have the text that I want to quote.
10. There are so many styles to write quotation and they make me confused how to write the direct/indirect quotation.
11. Mention the source correctly or the way in direct quotation.
12. Mention the source correctly.
13. We have to state the author, the year, and the page, but not every journal has.
   We have to think whether the quotation is short or long because it will determine how we write it.
14. The difficulties of writing is combined with direct and indirect sentence.
15. The format of the quotation.
16. I have no difficulties of writing direct quotation.
17. The rule of quoting article.
18. Sometimes I forget the rule of writing the direct quotation, I must check the handout first before writing it.
19. We have to explain more about the idea again below the quotation.
20. The right format of quoting.
22. Looking for the match one.
23. Oblivion
24. How to write the author from book or journal. They are so different.
25. Choosing the appropriate or suitable quotation for my writing.
26. It is hard to find the exact quotation I need for supporting my statement.
27. The format.

5. What were the difficulties of writing IQ?
   Class A
   1. You have to paraphrase your own idea based on the idea that you have been quoted.
   2. In the paraphrasing process. We have to restate the sentences.
   3. The dictions that we will use and about the idea.
   4. We have to paraphrase the idea, it’s not easy at all.
   5. We have to paraphrase the idea and it is not easy.
   6. Difficult to summarize and make it simpler with my own words.
   7. We have to pick the main idea up and then make a sentence by using our own words but it have to still relate to the main idea.
   8. The difficulty is changing the words themselves without reducing the main message.
   9. It’s less easy.
   10. When we want to write it again by our own words.
   11. If the sentences that I was going to quote was so long.
   12. To choose the suitable sentences to develop it.
   13. Sometimes it looks difficult to change it to my own words.
   14. The difficulties are to change someone’s ideas. Sometimes it’s not related to or even there is no relationship between someone’s idea and my idea.
   15. We need to change the ideas with my own words.
   16. The difficulties in writing indirect quotation are paraphrasing and avoiding from plagiarism.
   17. Sometimes I cannot understand what is the quotation about, then I have to make it by my own words.
   18. Actually I am afraid if it is plagiarism.
   19. Finding new words that is similar to the original ideas.
   20. Making it reliable and acceptable.
21. If I do the writing or speech in a hurry, otherwise there is no much difficulty when I take time to make the draft properly.
22. The difficulty was to paraphrase someone’s word into our own words.
23. Matching the other ideas with my own.
24. I have to think twice.

Class B

1. We need to know the idea. Well, if we did not know the idea well, it would be misunderstanding happens into your writing.
2. It’s not easy to make new word construction.
3. Difficult to find the similar words.
4. Changing in our words.
5. Paraphrasing and summarizing.
6. –
7. Arranging our own words to write the topic.
8. Make my own words become understandable for others.
9. How we can stick our own words and the writer’s ideas become a problem because sometimes what we write out of the range/context.
10. The difficulty is that I find it difficult to grab the main idea of the original statement and paraphrase or summarize it into my own words without changing the meaning.
11. Changing the phrase and word form direct, which usually used into an indirect quotation is the common hardest thing.
12. Find the best words of mine which is not the same with the original one.
13. Firstly, we should understand the idea of someone’s idea. Therefore, it is little difficult to paraphrasing it.
14. How to change the words but not to change the ideas.
15. We need to grab the idea first (that might be little bit different from the original one)
16. Choose the appropriate word.
17. Share the ideas by our own words but we don’t really know how to use the other words/synonym.
18. We need to adjust the words using our own words and style.
19. The choosing suitable words with the quotation.
20. Finding the appropriate word to replace the direct quotation.
21. It’s difficult to use our own words.
22. Transfer the language into our own, if we can’t understand what the writer means, we might have misunderstanding.
23. Choosing the other appropriate words.
24. How to understand the original quote first.
25. –
26. It lies on how to paraphrase it.

Class C

1. Memorizing the rule as well. Opening the guide book every time is just complicated and time consuming.
2. Paraphrasing with our own words.
3. How to paraphrase the ideas.
4. How to write the idea in my own words but still give the main idea from the source.
5. Make new sentence which has the same meaning.
6. How to paraphrase it in my own sentences and it’s still readable and in accordance with what the writer really wants to convey.
7. I have to paraphrasing it.
8. Change the quotation into my own word and make it more understandable for me and related with my writing.
9. To make it easier to get the point because what is written has been clear.
10. Paraphrasing, summarizing. Sometimes it’s difficult to say someone’s ideas with our own words.
11. Paraphrasing.
12. The way I paraphrase it.
13. We have to really know the main idea, we have to use our own words and sometimes it is hard to do so. We tend to use some words that appear in the quotation.
14. Difficulties because not so understand the context of writing.
15. The format of the quotation.
16. Sometimes paraphrasing an idea can have different idea from what the expert’s said. Paraphrasing and idea should consider the writer’s understanding on that idea.
17. Writing somebody’s idea in our own words, it means that the main idea of the writer should not be change. So, I have to understand well the article, book, or journal I read.
18. I must check the handout first before writing it. I am confused to paraphrase.
19. We have to deliver the ideas use my own types of sentence. (paraphrase)
20. The right format of quoting.
21. Paraphrasing the sentence using the appropriate sentences.
22. Looking for the right sentences.
23. Word choice to make the idea remains the same.
24. Paraphrasing.
25. Paraphrasing.
27. How to borrow someone’s idea (avoiding plagiarism)

7. What do you know about plagiarism?
   Class A
   1. It is about taking or copying the idea of other people and making it your own.
   2. Using someone’s ideas without mentioning the owner, the source. In other words, claiming someone’s ideas as ours.
   3. When you write or admit someone’s work or saying without mentioning the name of the person or source.
   4. Copying else’s works without any acknowledgement.
   5. Plagiarism is a necessary evil.
   6. Copy paste someone’s idea without changing the language style.
   7. Plagiarism is the act of copying and pasting someone’s idea without any note.
   8. Plagiarism is the act of copying and pasting someone’s words or works without any note so that it looks like your own words or works.
   9. Writing some others’ ide without put their names or without any permission.
   10. Plagiarism is an act that writing other working without any permission.
   11. If we quotate other’s work in a wrong way, we can do plagiarism.
   12. Plagiate other work, without acknowledging the author.
   13. Plagiarism is a copy-paste without editing and without giving the sources.
   14. Plagiarism is to take someone’s idea without writing the author or sources.
   15. Copying someone’s ideas or works without mention the author, it’s like stealing someone’s ideas. So, plagiarism is a criminal.
   16. Plagiarism is cheating someone else’s work by cheating his ideas, his words, his sentences, and etc.
   17. Copy and paste without provide an exactly source.
   18. Copy the ideas from other resources without giving the resources itself, and copy paste.
19. Plagiarism is copying and pasting other words without writing the sources or the author’s names.
20. (copy-paste) it sucks! Plagiarism is not made by writer’s own idea.
21. Plagiarism is when somebody copies either directly or indirectly from someone’s ideas in writing without acknowledging the writer or state where he/she takes the original ideas from.
22. Borrowing exact word-per-word of someone’s idea without quote it or giving explanation, name, or source.
23. Plagiarism is copying the other’s work without permission from the owner.
24. Quote or copy paste someone work as our work without permission or write the real author.

Class B

1. It is stolen somebody’s work. It is a bad thing that students have to avoid.
2. It’s about stealing someone’s ideas without mentioning the real proponents.
3. Copy and paste without any changing.
4. Plagiarism is using other’s idea (copy-paste)
5. If we quote and we did not out the source.
6. –
7. In my opinion plagiarism is duplicating other’s works without mentioning the source.
8. Plagiarism is when you copy someone’s work and admit as your own work.
9. Steal someone’s ideas.
10. Plagiarism is copying someone’s creation.
11. Plagiarism is copying the other person’s work or writing without permission or without mentioning the references.
12. Stealing! Steal someone’s work. It is a sin.
13. Plagiarism is a bad act. It shows that someone doesn’t respect to the authors. It has to be forbidden.
14. Plagiarism is an action which copy-paste from other people without writing the resources.
15. When we use other idea without stating the source/author.
16. Take and use someone’s ideas, words without give who made that.
17. Copy and paste someone’s works without get/have the permission.
18. Plagiarism is taking someone’s works and make it as our own without mention the authot and the source.
19. Plagiarism is borrowing/taking other’s works without permission.
20. We copy and paste somebody’s work exactly the same.
21. Plagiarism is such as a victim that duplicate that the other people creation.
22. Quoted someone’s statement without putting his name and consider it as our own.
23. Copy paste, paraphrasing someone’s ideas.
24. Plagiarism is about copy paste people’s work and you use it and claim it as your own.
25. Plagiarism is copy and paste someone’s idea without mentioning the source or the name of the person who has the idea and to consider that idea as our own.
26. Copy and paste someone’s else work or quotation without mentioning the source and the author or writer.

Class C

1. Plagiarism is stealing other’s right upon their ideas. It is an act of ignorance and recklessness.
2. Stealing someone’s words and opinion.
3. Plagiarism is an act that uses other’s works without citing the sources.
4. Copy someone’s idea to our own writing without give the source.
5. Plagiarism is taking someone’s opinion without stating their name.
6. Plagiarism is recognizing other’s opinion or arguments as yours.
7. Use others’ idea or work as his/her work or idea.
8. Take someone’s opinion or idea without permission.
9. Plagiarism is take someone’s idea without mention the writer.
10. Plagiarism is writing someone’s ideas or work without mentioning the source or author.
11. Use others words in our writing without stating the source if we take from others.
12. Plagiarism is an action of taking or using somebody else’s ideas to be our own ideas. Plagiarism is a bad thing to do because we do not do anything but only taking somebody else’s ideas.
13. When we use someone else’s opinion, thought, idea without acknowledging the source.
14. I think for plagiarism is bad behavior for understanding because plagiarism is copy paste from the other writing.
15. Plagiarism is when someone steals someone else’s opinion or statement as their own statement without writing the name of original writers.
16. Plagiarism is an action of claiming someone else’s work as mine or attaching someone’s idea without attaching the source.
17. Plagiarism is taking somebody’s idea or writing and put it as our own idea without mentioning the author’s name. When we do not consider how to quote something correctly.
18. Take other’s idea without putting the source.
19. Plagiarism is about claim someone’s ideas to be my ideas without putting the source.
20. Using someone’s idea in our writing without give any references.
21. If we use other’s opinion or idea without mention the name of the owner.
22. Criminal, plagiarism is stealing someone’s ideas without permission.
23. Claiming one’s ideas and using one’s idea without acknowledgement.
24. Take someone’s ideas and do not state the source.
25. Plagiarism is a violence in writing. It is when we use other’s works or words without quoting.
26. Use someone’s ideas without giving any credit for his/her works at least putting his/her name upon the work we cite.
27. It is a kind or bad thing by taking someone’s ideas without permission.